# Ex. 1-B (Duffey Dep. Tr.)

# Redacted Version of Document Sought to be Sealed

#### Case 3:18-md-02843-VC Document 1086-54 Filed 12/12/22 Page 2 of 233 CONFIDENTIAL

1	UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT	
2	NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA	
3		
4	IN RE: FACEBOOK, INC., MDL No. 2843	
5	CONSUMER USER PROFILE Case No.	
6	LITIGATION 18-md-02843-VC-JSC	
7	This document relates to:	
8	ALL ACTIONS	
9		
10	**CONFIDENTIAL**	
11		
12	ZOOM DEPOSITION OF FACEBOOK's 30(b)(6)	
13	CORPORATE REPRESENTATIVE - MICHAEL DUFFEY	
14	(Reported Remotely via Video & Web Videoconference)	
15	Palo Alto, California (Deponent's location)	
16	Wednesday, June 2, 2022	
17	Volume I	
18		
19	STENOGRAPHICALLY REPORTED BY:	
20	REBECCA L. ROMANO, RPR, CSR, CCR	
21	California CSR No. 12546	
22	Nevada CCR No. 827	
	Oregon CSR No. 20-0466	
23	Washington CCR No. 3491	
24	JOB NO. 5234611	
25	PAGES 1 - 194	
	Page 1	

#### Case 3:18-md-02843-VC Document 1086-54 Filed 12/12/22 Page 3 of 233 CONFIDENTIAL

1	UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
2	NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA
3	
	IN RE: FACEBOOK, INC., MDL No. 2843
4	CONSUMER USER PROFILE Case No.
	LITIGATION 18-md-02843-VC-JSC
5	
6	This document relates to:
7	ALL ACTIONS
8	
9	
10	
11	
12	
13	
14	
15	DEPOSITION OF MICHAEL DUFFEY, taken on
16	behalf of the Plaintiffs, with the deponent located
17	in Palo Alto, California, commencing at
18	9:14 a.m., Wednesday, June 3, 2022, remotely
19	reported via Video & Web videoconference before
20	REBECCA L. ROMANO, a Certified Shorthand Reporter,
21	Certified Court Reporter, Registered Professional
22	Reporter.
23	
24	
25	
	Page 2

#### Case 3:18-md-02843-VC Document 1086-54 Filed 12/12/22 Page 4 of 233 CONFIDENTIAL

1	APPEARANCES OF COUNSEL
2	(All parties appearing via Web videoconference)
3	
4	For the Plaintiffs:
5	BLEICHMAR FONTI & AULD LLP
6	BY: LESLEY E. WEAVER
7	BY: ANNE K. DAVIS
8	BY: JOSHUA SAMRA
9	Attorneys at Law
10	555 12th Street
11	Suite 1600
12	Oakland, California 94607
13	(415) 445-4003
14	lweaver@bfalaw.com
15	adavis@bfalaw.com
16	jsamra@bfalaw.com
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	////
	Page 3

#### Case 3:18-md-02843-VC Document 1086-54 Filed 12/12/22 Page 5 of 233 CONFIDENTIAL

1	APPEARANCES OF COUNSEL
2	(All parties appearing via Web videoconference)
3	
4	KELLER ROHRBACK L.L.P.
5	BY: CARI CAMPEN LAUFENBERG
6	BY: DEREK W. LOESER
7	Attorneys at Law
8	1201 Third Avenue
9	Suite 3200
10	Seattle, Washington 98101
11	(206) 623-1900
12	claufenberg@kellerrohrback.com
13	dloeser@kellerrohrback.com
14	
15	For Facebook, Inc.:
16	GIBSON, DUNN & CRUTCHER LLP
17	BY: RUSSELL H. FALCONER
18	Attorney at Law
19	2001 Ross Avenue
20	Suite 2100
21	Dallas, Texas 75201
22	(214) 698-3170
23	rfalconer@gibsondunn.com
24	
25	////
	Da ~ a 4
	Page 4

#### Case 3:18-md-02843-VC Document 1086-54 Filed 12/12/22 Page 6 of 233 CONFIDENTIAL

```
1
                APPEARANCES OF COUNSEL(cont'd)
2
     (All parties appearing via Web videoconference)
3
4
    For Facebook, Inc.:
5
          GIBSON, DUNN & CRUTCHER LLP
6
          BY:
               YEKATERINA REYZIS
          Attorney at Law
8
          333 South Grand Avenue
9
          Los Angeles, California 90071-3197
          (213) 229-7907
10
11
          yreyzis@gibsondunn.com
12
    and
13
          BY: DAYNA ZOLLE HAUSER
14
          BY:
               HANNAH REGAN-SMITH
15
          Attorneys at Law
16
          1801 California Street
17
          Suite 4200
18
          Denver, Colorado 80202-2642
19
          (303) 298-5700
20
          dzhauser@gibsondunn.com
21
          hregan-smith@gibsondunn.com
22
23
24
    /////
25
                                                Page 5
```

#### Case 3:18-md-02843-VC Document 1086-54 Filed 12/12/22 Page 7 of 233 CONFIDENTIAL

```
1
                APPEARANCES OF COUNSEL(cont'd)
 2
     (All parties appearing via Web videoconference)
 3
     For Facebook, Inc.:
 4
 5
          GIBSON, DUNN & CRUTCHER LLP
6
               ROSEMARIE T. RING
          Attorney at Law
8
          555 Mission Street
          Suite 3000
9
          San Francisco, California 94105-0921
10
11
          (415) 393-8247
12
          rring@gibsondunn.com
13
14
          JAMS
15
               DANIEL B. GARRIE
          BY:
16
          Special Master
17
          555 W. 5th Street
18
          32nd Floor
19
          Los Angeles, California 90013
20
          (213) 253-9706
21
          dgarrie@jamsadr.com
22
23
24
     /////
25
                                                Page 6
```

#### Case 3:18-md-02843-VC Document 1086-54 Filed 12/12/22 Page 8 of 233 CONFIDENTIAL

```
1
                      APPEARANCES (cont'd)
     (All parties appearing via Web videoconference)
 2
 3
 4
     ALSO PRESENT:
          Ian Chen, Associate General Counsel,
 5
     Meta Platforms
 6
 7
          John Macdonell, Videographer
 8
 9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
     /////
25
                                                  Page 7
```

#### Case 3:18-md-02843-VC Document 1086-54 Filed 12/12/22 Page 9 of 233 CONFIDENTIAL

1		INDEX	
2	DEPONENT	E	XAMINATION
3	MICHAEL DUFF	EY	PAGE
	VOLUME I		
4			
5		BY MS. WEAVER	14
6			
7			
8		EXHIBITS	
9	NUMBER		PAGE
10		DESCRIPTION	
11	Exhibit 384	Plaintiffs' Third Amended	17
12		Notice of Deposition of	
13		Defendant Facebook, Inc.	
14		Pursuant to Federal Rule of	
15		Civil Procedure 30(b)(6)	
16		regarding Preservation of	
17		Relevant ESI;	
18			
19	Exhibit 385	Legal Hold Policy Effective:	32
20		June 20, 2020,	
21		ADVANCE-META-0000489 -	
22		ADVANCE-META-0000493;	
23			
24			
25	////		
			Page 8

1		E X H I B I T S(cont'd)	
2	NUMBER		PAGE
3		DESCRIPTION	
4	Exhibit 386	30(b)(6) Deposition Notes	52
5		6/2/2022, Legal Hold Policy	
6		Effective: June 20, 2020,	
7		ADVANCE-META-0000489 -	
8		ADVANCE-META-00003256 - Legal	
9		Hold Policy Effective: June	
10		20, 2020,	
11		ADVANCE-META-0000489 -	
12		ADVANCE-META-00003259;	
13			
14	Exhibit 387	Email & Workplace Chat	103
15		Retention Policy Effective:	
16		October 28, 2022,	
17		ADVANCE-META-0000692 -	
18		ADVANCE-META-0000694;	
19			
20	Exhibit 388	Electronic Communications	104
21		Policy Effective: November	
22		16, 2021,	
23		ADVANCE-META-0000462 -	
24		ADVANCE-META-0000470;	
25	////		
			D = 0
			Page 9

1		E X H I B I T S(cont'd)	
2	NUMBER		PAGE
3		DESCRIPTION	
4	Exhibit 389	Gibson Dunn Letter dated	114
5		September 6, 2018;	
6			
7	Exhibit 390	Gibson Dunn Letter dated	116
8		December 9, 2019;	
9			
10	Exhibit 391	US Privacy Program Records	129
11		Management Policy Effective:	
12		April 20, 2021,	
13		ADVANCE-META-0000504 -	
14		ADVANCE-META-0000509;	
15			
16	Exhibit 392	US Privacy Program Records	130
17		Retention Schedule Effective:	
18		April 20, 2021,	
19		ADVANCE-META-0000516 -	
20		ADVANCE-META-0000531;	
21			
22			
23			
24			
25	////		
			Page 10

1		E X H I B I T S(cont'd)	
2	NUMBER		PAGE
3		DESCRIPTION	
4	Exhibit 393	US Privacy Program Records	134
5		Retention Schedule Effective:	
6		April 20, 2021,	
7		ADVANCE-META-0000555 -	
8		ADVANCE-META-0000568;	
9			
10	Exhibit 394	Meta US Privacy Program	134
11		Records File Plan;	
12			
13	Exhibit 395	FTC Order Records Management	142
14		Policy Effective: April 28,	
15		2020, ADVANCE-META-0000578 -	
16		ADVANCE-META-0000585.	
17			
18			
19			
20			
21			
22			
23			
24			
25	////		
			Page 11

1	Palo Alto, California; Thursday, June 2, 2022	09:04:04
2	9:14 a.m.	
3	00	
4		
5	THE VIDEOGRAPHER: Okay. We on the	09:14:31
6	record. It's 9:14 Pacific Time on June 2nd, 2022.	
7	This is the depositions of Mike Duffey. We are in	
8	the matter In Re: Facebook, Inc. Consumer Privacy	
9	User Profile Litigation.	
10	I'm John Macdonell the videographer with	09:14:47
11	Veritext.	
12	Before the reporter swears the witness,	
13	would counsel please identify themselves, beginning	
14	with the noticing attorney, please.	
15	MS. WEAVER: Good morning, everybody.	09:14:58
16	This is Lesley Weaver of Bleichmar Fonti & Auld on	
17	behalf of the plaintiffs.	
18	With me today is my partner, Anne Davis,	
19	and Josh Samra of my firm is assisting with this	
20	deposition. My cocounsel, Derek Loeser and Cari	09:15:10
21	Laufenberg, are also present virtually.	
22	MR. FALCONER: Good morning. This is	
23	Russ Falconer with Gibson Dunn, here on behalf of	
24	Facebook and the witness. I'm here with my	
25	colleagues from Gibson Dunn, Dayne Hauser, Hannah	09:15:27
		Page 12

# Case 3:18-md-02843-VC Document 1086-54 Filed 12/12/22 Page 14 of 233 CONFIDENTIAL

1		
1	Regan-Smith, and Katie Reyzis. And also with	09:15:31
2	Ian Chen from Facebook.	
3	SPECIAL MASTER GARRIE: And	
4	Special Master Garrie. I'm here today on behalf of	
5	the court.	09:15:42
6	For the record and clarity of the record,	
7	there will be one attorney taking and one attorney	
8	defending on today's deposition pursuant to the	
9	protocol. All lawyers have agreed to or have	
10	provided and submitted the signed protective order	09:15:55
11	and will provide copies to counsel and have agreed	
12	to as such.	
13	That said, I'm turning it over to counsel	
14	to start the deposition.	
15	THE COURT REPORTER: Mr. Duffey, if you	09:16:07
16	could raise your right hand for me, please.	
17	THE DEPONENT: (Complies.)	
18	THE COURT REPORTER: You do solemnly	
19	state, under penalty of perjury, that the testimony	
20	you are about to give in this deposition shall be	09:16:07
21	the truth, the whole truth and nothing but the	
22	truth?	
23	THE DEPONENT: I do.	
24		
25	////	09:16:24
		Page 13

1	MICHAEL DUFFEY,	09:16:24
2	having been administered an oath, was examined and	
3	testified as follows:	
4		
5	EXAMINATION	09:16:24
6	BY MS. WEAVER:	
7	Q. Good morning, Mr. Duffey. Will you	
8	please state your full name and employment for the	
9	record.	
10	A. Sure. My name is Michael Duffey,	09:16:35
11	D-U-F-F-E-Y. I am a manager for E-discovery Case	
12	Management within the legal department of Meta	
13	Platforms, Inc.	
14	Q. And you understand, Mr. Duffey, that you	
15	are testifying today as a corporate representative	09:16:55
16	on behalf of Facebook; is that correct?	
17	A. Yes, I understand that.	
18	Q. And how have you been a manager of	
19	E-discovery since June 2021?	
20	A. That sounds right.	09:17:12
21	Q. And prior to that time, from roughly 2017	
22	to 2021, you were an E-discovery and litigation	
23	case manager; is that correct?	
24	A. That's correct.	
25	Q. Is there any difference between those	09:17:25
		Page 14

# Case 3:18-md-02843-VC Document 1086-54 Filed 12/12/22 Page 16 of 233 CONFIDENTIAL

1	titles and roles?	09:17:27
2	A. Prior to June 2021, I I did not have	
3	any direct reports. I manage three case managers	
4	on the E-discovery team now.	
5	Q. And what are case managers in terms of	09:17:51
6	their roles and responsibilities at Facebook?	
7	A. Case managers work with our in-house and	
8	outside legal counsel on litigation and regulatory	
9	matters involving Meta Platforms, Inc. We focus on	
10	the identification, preservation, collection and	09:18:20
11	production of ESI relevant to a matter.	
12	Q. And do you hold a legal degree?	
13	A. No, I don't.	
14	Q. And prior to Facebook, you worked at	
15	Ropes & Gay Ropes & Gray, rather as a	09:18:48
16	litigation paralegal; is that right?	
17	A. Litigation paralegal specialist. That's	
18	correct.	
19	Q. And then you were at Howrey LLP prior to	
20	that; is that right?	09:18:59
21	A. Correct.	
22	Q. I myself was a paralegal at Howrey &	
23	Simon, years ago.	
24	Okay. Great.	
25	And did do you have personal knowledge	09:19:08
		Page 15

1	of the steps that Facebook took to identify and	09:19:10
2	collect ESI for production in this matter?	
3	MR. FALCONER: Objection. Beyond the	
4	scope of the notice.	
5	You can go ahead and answer.	09:19:24
6	THE WITNESS: Yes.	
7	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) Who at Facebook was	
8	responsible for the identification and collection	
9	of ESI in response to the filing of this lawsuit?	
10	A. Our outside counsel and in-house counsel	09:19:49
11	are responsible for identify identifying	
12	custodians to be placed on legal hold and	
13	ultimately the custodians who are are identified	
14	for collection of ESI.	
15	Q. So who specifically by name was	09:20:15
16	responsible for the identification and collection	
17	of ESI in response to the filing of this lawsuit?	
18	MR. FALCONER: Objection. Beyond the	
19	scope of the notice.	
20	THE DEPONENT: I'm trying to remember. I	09:20:44
21	don't know that I can remember all of the names of	
22	the in-house counsel that worked on the	
23	Cambridge Analytica multi-district litigation over	
24	the years. Gibson Dunn has been our lead counsel	
25	on the MDL since 2018.	09:20:59
		Page 16

1	Would you like me to try to attempt	09:21:13
2	some some to name some names or	
3	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) Yes, please.	
4	MR. FALCONER: Objection. Beyond the	
5	scope of the notice.	09:21:22
6	THE WITNESS: Ian Chen is the lead	
7	in-house counsel on on the MDL currently.	
8	Sandeep Solanki was another in-house counsel who	
9	was involved in the Cambridge Analytica matter.	
10	Natalie Naugle was another in-house counsel working	09:21:54
11	on the Cambridge matter.	
12	Those those are the names that I	
13	that I recall.	
14	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) And with regard well,	
15	strike that.	09:22:19
16	I'll address the scope objection.	
17	MS. WEAVER: Let's mark as Exhibit 384	
18	the 30(b)(6) notice, third amended notice of	
19	deposition of Facebook to which you are being	
20	presented as a witness today.	09:22:37
21	(Exhibit 384 was marked for	
22	identification by the court reporter and is	
23	attached hereto.)	
24	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) And while that's	
25	loading, Mr. Duffey, you've been deposed before,	09:22:41
		Page 17

# Case 3:18-md-02843-VC Document 1086-54 Filed 12/12/22 Page 19 of 233 CONFIDENTIAL

1	correct?		09:22:44
2	A.	I have, yes.	
3	Q.	On how many occasions?	
4	Α.	Eight or nine times, I think.	
5	Q.	How many times in the last year have you	09:22:58
6	been depo	sed?	
7	А.	Once, I believe.	
8	Q.	And what matter was that?	
9	Α.	It was an Instagram matter involving	
10	facial re	cognition.	09:23:24
11	Q.	And when was that?	
12	Α.	I don't recall.	
13	Q.	Was it a remote deposition?	
14	A.	It was, yes.	
15	Q.	So just for the record, you seem very	09:23:35
16	proficien	t and capable of answering testimony today	
17	in a mann	er that will be clear and cogent, but just	
18	so we und	erstand each other, these are the rules of	
19	the road.		
20		I will ask you questions and you will	09:23:50
21	answer, a	nd we will attempt not to talk over each	
22	so Ms. Ro	mano can get a clear record.	
23		Is that fair?	
24	Α.	Absolutely fair, yes.	
25	Q.	And you must answer audibly so that we	09:24:02
			Page 18

1	can get those answers in the record. Shake of the	09:24:04
2	head won't do.	
3	Is that fair?	
4	A. That's fair, yes.	
5	Q. Okay.	09:24:12
6	We can take breaks, you know, as you need	
7	during this deposition. You just let me know if	
8	you need a break. But we ask that you not take a	
9	break while a question is pending.	
10	Is that fair?	09:24:24
11	A. Yes, that's fair. Thank you.	
12	Q. Okay.	
13	How many times have you testified as a	
14	corporate representative on Facebook's behalf?	
15	A. I believe this is only time or the first	09:24:39
16	time.	
17	Q. And how many times have you testified on	
18	Facebook's behalf at all in any litigation?	
19	A. As as a deponent or	
20	Q. Yes, as a deponent.	09:24:59
21	A. I believe eight or nine times.	
22	Q. And how many times have you submitted	
23	declarations in various litigation matters on	
24	behalf of Facebook?	
25	A. I don't know the exact number. It would	09:25:26
		Page 19

1	be over 50 times.	09:25:28
2	Q. And you've submitted a declaration in	
3	this matter, in fact, haven't you?	
4	A. I don't recall.	
5	Q. Okay.	09:25:51
6	Are you familiar with the Exhibit Share	
7	function so that you can review exhibits as this	
8	deposition proceeds?	
9	A. Yes. I have it open, and I believe I've	
10	used it before.	09:26:05
11	Q. Okay.	
12	And looking at Exhibit 384, do you	
13	recognize it?	
14	A. Yes.	
15	Q. What is it?	09:26:48
16	A. What is the document that I'm looking at?	
17	Q. Yes.	
18	A. It's the plaintiff's third amended notice	
19	of deposition of defendant Facebook Inc. regarding	
20	preservation of relevant ESI.	09:27:00
21	Q. Okay. And do you understand that you are	
22	being produced as a witness today in response to	
23	this notice?	
24	A. Yes, I understand that.	
25	Q. Okay.	09:27:12
		Page 20

1	And let's turn to page 7, and	09:27:13
2	specifically paragraph 11.	
3	And I'll direct your attention and read	
4	into the record where it says "'You' or 'your' or	
5	'Facebook' or 'defendant' means defendant Facebook,	09:27:27
6	Inc., together with your predecessors, successors,	
7	parents, subsidiaries, et cetera."	
8	And then if you read on, do you see where	
9	it says "attorneys or other persons occupying	
10	similar positions or performing similar functions"?	09:27:42
11	A. I see that, yes.	
12	Q. And when you were identifying who was	
13	involved on behalf of Facebook collecting ESI in	
14	this case, you were referring to attorneys, right?	
15	A. I was referring to attorneys, correct.	09:28:04
16	Q. Okay. And who at Gibson Dunn, the	
17	outside counsel, by name can you identify as being	
18	involved in the collection of ESI in this	
19	litigation?	
20	MR. FALCONER: Objection. Beyond the	09:28:19
21	scope of the notice.	
22	THE DEPONENT: There have been lots of	
23	attorneys from Gibson Dunn working on the Cambridge	
24	matter: Russ Falconer, Laura Mumm or Munn. I I	
25	don't recall people's last names.	09:28:54
		Page 21

1	I know Rose Ring works on the	09:28:58
2	Cambridge Analytica matter. The attorneys that are	
3	present today for Gibson Dunn. I'm the last	
4	name is escaping me; her name is her first name	
5	is Martie, M-A-R-T-I-E.	09:29:21
6	Those are the names that come to mind.	
7	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) And for the record, is	
8	that Martie Kutscher Clark to whom you're	
9	referring?	
10	A. Correct. Thank you. That's right.	09:29:36
11	Q. No no problem.	
12	And you were also identifying other	
13	individuals present today. Is that Katie Reyzis	
14	and Dayne Zolle Hauser and Hannah Regan-Smith?	
15	A. Correct.	09:29:49
16	Q. Great.	
17	And at the outset of the litigation, in	
18	2018, who was responsible for the identification	
19	and preservation of ESI?	
20	MR. FALCONER: Objection. Beyond the	09:30:01
21	scope.	
22	THE DEPONENT: We had some ongoing	
23	regulatory matters that overlapped with the	
24	Cambridge Analytica MDL, so I just want to get	
25	clarity on on sort of this question.	09:30:29
		Page 22

1	Is the question specific to to the	09:30:31
2	MDL?	
3	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) The question is focused	
4	on what efforts were taken to preserve documents	
5	relating to this litigation. If there was overlap	09:30:43
6	with some of these efforts with another matter, we	
7	would like to understand that.	
8	MR. FALCONER: Same objection as before	
9	for continuing the question.	
10	THE DEPONENT: Once again, Gibson Dunn is	09:31:09
11	lead counsel for the multi-district litigation.	
12	For the regulatory matters, state AG matters, and	
13	the FTC matter involving Cambridge Analytica,	
14	counsel for WilmerHale was involved. We also	
15	worked with the Redgrave firm on some preservation	09:31:32
16	issues back in that time period. I don't recall	
17	the names of the people that worked on on on	
18	those matters back in the onset of this litigation.	
19	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) What were the	
20	preservation issues which you worked with the	09:31:53
21	Redgrave firm?	
22	MR. FALCONER: Mr. Duffey, I'll just	
23	caution you not to reveal any privileged	
24	communications or privileged information, of	
25	course, in answering that question.	09:32:04
		Page 23

1	THE DEPONENT: I don't recall.	09:32:15
2	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) Do you have a general	
3	sense of any preservation issues that might have	
4	effected the collection of ESI in this matter?	
5	A. No.	09:32:27
6	Q. When was the Redgrave firm retained?	
7	A. I don't recall.	
8	Q. When you say "preservation issues," what	
9	do you mean?	
10	MR. FALCONER: Objection. Form.	09:32:48
11	Go ahead.	
12	THE DEPONENT: I didn't issues in in	
13	any sort of negative way. It was they they were	
14	working on as I stated, I don't recall the	
15	specific things. But but Redgrave was was	09:33:13
16	involved in the steps taken to necessary to	
17	to identify and preserve relevant ESI.	
18	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) And what specific steps	
19	are you thinking of?	
20	A. The steps I'm thinking of are are the	09:33:55
21	identification of relevant custodians.	
22	Q. And how did the Redgrave firm identify	
23	the relevant custodians?	
24	A. I don't know that Redgrave exclusively	
25	identified relevant custodians. It certainly was a	09:34:20
		Page 24
		ı

1	collaborative effort between Gibson Dunn and our	09:34:28
2	in-house counsel working on the matter.	
3	Q. And when you say Gibson Dunn in this	
4	particular respect, who specifically by name do you	
5	mean?	09:34:43
6	MR. FALCONER: Objection. Beyond the	
7	scope.	
8	THE WITNESS: I don't I don't recall.	
9	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) Was it Ms. Mumm or	
10	Ms. Kutscher Clark?	09:34:54
11	MR. FALCONER: Same objection.	
12	THE DEPONENT: I don't recall either	
13	I I don't recall whether or not they were	
14	working on on on identification of custodians	
15	in that 2018 time period.	09:35:30
16	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) Okay. Who can you	
17	identify by name well, strike this.	
18	I'll address the objection again.	
19	Looking at Exhibit 3 what is again?	
20	84.	09:35:42
21	I'll direct your attention to topic 3.	
22	And while you're looking at it, I'll read	
23	it into the record.	
24	"All of your efforts to identify and	
25	preserve ESI, personal information, documents,	09:35:52
		Page 25

1	data, and content and information, including but	09:35:55
2	not limited to that which was or is associated in	
3	any with the named plaintiffs in this action."	
4	Do you see that?	
5	It's on page	09:36:09
6	A. I do.	
7	Q. It's on	
8	A. I see it.	
9	Q. Apologies.	
10	Is it your understanding you are	09:36:14
11	testifying on behalf of Facebook with regard to	
12	topic 3?	
13	A. My understanding is that I would be	
14	speaking to topics as they were laid out in a	
15	letter from Gibson Dunn to plaintiff's counsel	09:36:39
16	on on I think it was May 18th, 2022.	
17	Q. Right.	
18	But the question I'm asking you is that	
19	do you understand that you are here to testify	
20	regarding Facebook's efforts to identify and	09:36:57
21	preserve ESI personal information, documents, data,	
22	and content and information relating to this	
23	matter?	
24	A. Yes.	
25	Q. Going back to the identification of	09:37:16
		Page 26

1	custodians for the purpose of collecting ESI in	09:37:22
2	this matter in 2018, who was involved in that	
3	process by name?	
4	MR. FALCONER: Objection. Beyond the	
5	scope.	09:37:32
6	THE DEPONENT: Can you repeat the	
7	question, please.	
8	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) Yes.	
9	With regard to the identification of	
10	custodians for the purpose of preserving and	09:37:50
11	collecting ESI in this matter in 2018, who was	
12	involved in that process by name?	
13	MR. FALCONER: Objection. Beyond the	
14	scope.	
15	THE DEPONENT: I remember Sandeep Solanki	09:38:23
16	was one of our our in-house attorneys who was	
17	responsible for providing the E-discovery team the	
18	names of the custodians to be placed on legal hold.	
19	I don't I recall it, again, being a	
20	a collaborative effort between our outside counsel	09:38:54
21	and our in-house counsel, but I cannot recall by	
22	name all of those individuals.	
23	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) Can you recall by name	
24	any of them?	
25	MR. FALCONER: Same objection.	09:39:08
		Page 27
		I I

1	THE DEPONENT: No.	09:39:13
2	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) Was Josh Lipshutz	
3	involved?	
4	MR. FALCONER: Same objection.	
5	THE DEPONENT: I don't know.	09:39:25
6	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) Were you?	
7	MR. FALCONER: Same objection.	
8	THE DEPONENT: I was not involved in the	
9	identification of relevant custodians.	
10	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) And the only person you	09:39:39
11	can think of who was involved in the identification	
12	of relevant custodians by name is Mr. Solanki; is	
13	that right?	
14	MR. FALCONER: Same objection.	
15	THE DEPONENT: Yes.	09:39:58
16	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) What was the process by	
17	which Facebook identified custodians?	
18	A. Our in-house and outside counsel are	
19	work together to to identify relevant custodians	
20	in a matter.	09:40:24
21	Q. How did they work together to identify	
22	the custodians?	
23	A. I'm not part of those discussions.	
24	Q. So you don't know?	
25	A. I know that they collaborate and work	09:40:45
		Page 28

1	together. To what extent that they do that, I	09:40:47
2	can't answer that.	
3	Q. Okay. I'm just trying to actually	
4	understand the process and what you mean by	
5	"collaborate and work together."	09:40:54
6	Do they interview people? Do they look	
7	at documents? Did you speak with anybody to find	
8	out who was and by "you," I mean Facebook who	
9	was involved in Cambridge Analytica? What was the	
10	process for identification custodians that Facebook	09:41:06
11	engaged in this matter in 2018?	
12	A. Yes, I do believe that they talked to	
13	employees at the company to understand if there is	
14	any involvement on any matter, including	
15	Cambridge Analytica. We also ask our custodians to	09:41:29
16	assist in identifying additional custodians that	
17	that worked on relevant topics related to the	
18	matter, so that so that's our process.	
19	Q. Okay.	
20	Let's return for a moment just back to	09:41:57
21	Exhibit 384. And looking at the exhibit, do you	
22	understand that you are here to testify on all of	
23	the topics, 1 through 8, identified in Exhibit 384?	
24	A. No. As I mentioned, I I had	
25	understood that the topics were were listed in	09:42:24
		Page 29

1	the letter to plaintiff's counsel from Gibson Dunn	09:42:31
2	in May in May of this year.	
3	Q. I understand. I've read the	
4	correspondence.	
5	But I'm asking you this question: Is	09:42:45
6	there any topic listed in Exhibit 384 upon which	
7	you are not prepared to testify generally?	
8	MR. FALCONER: Objection. Form.	
9	THE DEPONENT: The topic 8 is is	
10	one for which I, you know, don't have by name,	09:44:00
11	title, position all persons responsible with the	
12	decision-making as it pertains to topics 3 and 7.	
13	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) So for the record, topic	
14	8 says "identify by name, title, position, employer	
15	all persons responsible for and involved with	09:44:20
16	decision-making relating to topics 3 through 7 as	
17	well as a general description of these decisions,	
18	the timing of those decisions, and the effect of	
19	those decisions."	
20	That's the topic you were referring to,	09:44:32
21	correct?	
22	A. That's the topic I'm referring to, yes.	
23	Q. And you're saying you have no knowledge	
24	or maybe you have general knowledge with regard to	
25	topic 8?	09:44:45
		Page 30

1	A. I have general knowledge. The but	09:44:50
2	but the topic is asking for all persons and and	
3	name, title, and position, which which,	
4	you know, depending on the question, I might I	
5	might struggle with.	09:45:10
6	Q. Fair enough. That's okay. We	
7	understand.	
8	Let's look for a moment here at topic 1.	
9	Is it fair to describe topic 1 as	
10	Facebook's guidelines, policies, practices,	09:45:25
11	procedures, rules, et cetera, regarding the	
12	collection, preservation, retention of ESI,	
13	personal information, documents, data and content,	
14	and information relating to this action?	
15	MR. FALCONER: Objection. Form.	09:45:49
16	THE DEPONENT: I did I didn't catch a	
17	question there, Counsel. I'm sorry.	
18	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) That's okay. I'm just	
19	trying to get your general understanding of what	
20	you think topic 1 entails, so I was asking a	09:46:01
21	leading question, which I will do again and	
22	hopefully it will be helpful.	
23	Is it fair to describe topic 1 as	
24	Facebook's guidelines, policies, practices,	
25	procedures, rules, et cetera, regarding the	09:46:15
		Page 31

1	collection, preservation, and retention of ESI,	09:46:18
2	personal information, documents, data, content, and	
3	information relating to this action?	
4	MR. FALCONER: Objection. Form.	
5	THE DEPONENT: Yes, that's fair.	09:46:36
6	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) What is your	
7	understanding of what ESI is?	
8	A. ESI is an acronym for electronically	
9	stored information.	
10	Q. And what is electronically stored	09:46:56
11	information?	
12	A. That could be, you know, documents,	
13	communications, electronic communications data,	
14	within the company.	
15	(Exhibit 385 was marked for	09:47:18
16	identification by the court reporter and is	
17	attached hereto.)	
18	MS. WEAVER: We are marking as	
19	Exhibit 385 tab 29, Mr. Samra.	
20	And for the record, Exhibit 385	09:47:29
21	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) which will be up in a	
22	moment, Mr. Duffey. I'm just going to read the	
23	Bates numbers into the record.	
24	And you know what those are; is that	
25	correct? A Bates number?	09:47:38
		Page 32

A. I know what a Bates number is, yes.	09:47:39
Q. Yes.	
MS. WEAVER: Exhibit 385 bears Bates	
numbers Advance-Meta-0000489 through -493.	
Q. (By Ms. Weaver) And let me know when you	09:47:58
have it up.	
MS. WEAVER: I am informed that it is	
loaded, and I see the file.	
THE WITNESS: I have it up now.	
MS. WEAVER: Okay. Great.	09:48:39
MR. FALCONER: Can you give me just a	
second? Sorry. I'm still	
MS. WEAVER: No problem.	
MR. FALCONER: Sorry.	
I got it. Thank you.	09:48:46
Q. (By Ms. Weaver) And you may take a	
moment to review it, of course, Mr. Duffey. But	
when you've had a moment, please tell me whether or	
not you recognize Exhibit 385.	
A. Yes, I do recognize it.	09:49:04
Q. And what is it?	
A. It's the company's legal hold policy.	
Q. And when you say "the company's," do you	
mean Meta or Facebook?	
MR. FALCONER: Objection. Form.	09:49:19
	Page 33
	Q. Yes.  MS. WEAVER: Exhibit 385 bears Bates  numbers Advance-Meta-0000489 through -493.  Q. (By Ms. Weaver) And let me know when you have it up.  MS. WEAVER: I am informed that it is loaded, and I see the file.  THE WITNESS: I have it up now.  MS. WEAVER: Okay. Great.  MR. FALCONER: Can you give me just a second? Sorry. I'm still  MS. WEAVER: No problem.  MR. FALCONER: Sorry.  I got it. Thank you.  Q. (By Ms. Weaver) And you may take a moment to review it, of course, Mr. Duffey. But when you've had a moment, please tell me whether or not you recognize Exhibit 385.  A. Yes, I do recognize it.  Q. And what is it?  A. It's the company's legal hold policy.  Q. And when you say "the company's," do you mean Meta or Facebook?

1	THE DEPONENT: When I say "company," I	09:49:26
2	mean I mean Meta Platforms, Inc., but that's	
3	what I that's that's the company.	
4	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) Okay.	
5	Is but you're here testifying on	09:49:39
6	behalf of Facebook. Does this does	
7	Exhibit 385 represent Facebook's current legal	
8	hold policy?	
9	MR. FALCONER: Objection. Form.	
10	THE DEPONENT: I believe this this	09:50:02
11	policy was put into effect before the company	
12	changed its name from Facebook Inc. to Meta	
13	Platform, Inc. So so I would say yes to your	
14	question.	
15	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) And in preparation for	09:50:19
16	your deposition today, did you review other legal	
17	hold notices other than Exhibit 385 legal hold	
18	policies, rather?	
19	A. Do you mind restating the question?	
20	Q. No problem.	09:50:34
21	In preparation for your deposition today,	
22	did you review legal hold policies other than	
23	Exhibit 385?	
24	A. I reviewed this document. I did not	
25	review any earlier versions of this policy.	09:50:59
		Page 34

1	Q. Do earlier versions exist?	09:51:04
2	A. I believe so. At the on the last	
3	page, it indicates that there is a that what we	
4	are looking at is the portal version 3.	
5	So I believe that there were possibly two	09:51:33
6	earlier versions of this policy.	
7	Q. Did Facebook have a legal hold policy in	
8	place in March of 2018?	
9	A. I don't believe we had a formal legal	
10	hold policy in place prior to June 10th, 2020.	09:52:08
11	Q. Okay.	
12	What did you do to prepare for your	
13	deposition today?	
14	A. Counsel, I have a few pages of notes here	
15	in front of me. Is it okay if I I refer to	09:52:33
16	them?	
17	Q. You may.	
18	MS. WEAVER: And I'll request their	
19	immediate production, Russ. And I really just a	
20	standing request that if things like that happen,	09:52:44
21	these are produced ahead of the deposition so we	
22	can prepare.	
23	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) Please go ahead and	
24	answer the question. And, yes, you may rely on	
25	those documents, Mr. Duffey.	09:53:00
		Page 35

1	A. Thank you.	09:53:03
2	I met with counsel for Gibson Dunn	
3	approximately for 38 hours over the course of four	
4	weeks. I believe that there were ten sessions.	
5	I reviewed the documents that were	09:53:22
6	produced to plaintiffs, I believe a week or so ago.	
7	I reviewed correspondence from Gibson	
8	Dunn to plaintiffs regarding legal hold and and	
9	preservation of ESI.	
10	I reviewed a handful of documents that	09:53:53
11	were provided from by plaintiffs to Gibson Dunn.	
12	I reviewed the 30(b)(6) notice and the	
13	correspondence that I mentioned from May 18th,	
14	2020 2022.	
15	I spoke with various employees at the	09:54:25
16	company to help learn more about the various topics	
17	at issue here.	
18	Q. And is all of this information detailed	
19	in the notes that you're reviewing?	
20	A. The the timing of the events, the	09:54:56
21	number is on on the notes. The people that I	
22	spoke with are are also listed.	
23	Q. Do you have	
24	A. There's listing	
25	Q. I'm so sorry. Please continue.	09:55:15
		Page 36

1	A. Oh, I was just no, no.	09:55:18
2	You know, I mentioned that I reviewed the	
3	documents. Those are not listed in my notes, no.	
4	Q. What documents did you review?	
5	A. The policies that were produced to	09:55:38
6	plaintiffs a week or so ago. I don't know I	
7	don't know the exact date that that production was	
8	made.	
9	Cor again, correspondence from Gibson	
10	Dunn to plaintiffs regarding the legal hold and	09:56:02
11	preservation of ESI.	
12	I reviewed some documents that plaintiffs	
13	provided to Gibson Dunn.	
14	I reviewed the 30(b)(6) notice.	
15	I I saw I reviewed an email from	09:56:34
16	Special Master Garrie regarding questions he had	
17	for this deposition.	
18	Counsel showed me, I believe, the initial	
19	disclosures that plaintiffs filed in this case and	
20	a very short portion of the Tyler King deposition	09:57:17
21	transcript.	
22	Q. Anything else?	
23	A. No.	
24	Q. What was the subject matter of the	
25	portion of the Tyler King deposition transcript	09:57:41
		Page 37

1	that you reviewed?	09:57:44
2	A. It was confirmation that her account was	
3	deleted in 2018.	
4	Q. And were you involved in seeking to	
5	preserve any ESI relating to Ms. King's account?	09:58:08
6	MR. FALCONER: Objection. Beyond the	
7	scope of the notice.	
8	THE DEPONENT: I was not personally	
9	involved, but there were members of my team that	
10	that were involved.	09:58:26
11	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) And who was that?	
12	A. Another case manager on the E-discovery	
13	team. Her name is Jennifer Allen, A-L-L-E-N.	
14	Q. And what do you recall about efforts to	
15	preserve ESI relating to Ms. King's account?	09:58:51
16	A. There was an attempt made to take a DYI	
17	snapshot of Ms. King's account as well as there was	
18	a preservation effort to preserve information using	
19	a tool and a tool that we call Switchboard.	
20	Q. And was, in fact, a DYI snapshot of	09:59:36
21	Ms. King's account taken?	
22	A. We attempted to take those snapshots in	
23	March 9th on March 9th, 2020, because Ms. King's	
24	account was deleted in 2018. I don't believe that	
25	there was any data available to be taken as a	10:00:09
		Page 38

1	snapshot.	10:00:13
2	Q. Were any attempts to take snapshots taken	
3	before March 9th, 2020?	
4	A. I know I know that our our counsel	
5	at Gibson Dunn attempted to obtain information	10:00:39
6	necessary to identify the named plaintiffs'	
7	accounts. I don't believe we received that	
8	information until late 2019, early 2020.	
9	Q. The question was were any attempts made	
10	to take snapshots before March 9th, 2020?	10:01:16
11	A. No.	
12	Q. You referenced a tool called Switchboard.	
13	Do you recall that?	
14	A. Yes.	
15	Q. What is Switchboard?	10:01:40
16	A. Switchboard is a investigative tool that	
17	has information related to Facebook users that our	
18	law enforcement response team is responsible for.	
19	Q. And who	
20	A. That tool is used I'm sorry.	10:02:10
21	That tool is used to take snapshots of	
22	information about a Facebook user.	
23	Q. How is Switchboard different than any	
24	other tool that might be used to take a snapshot of	
25	an account?	10:02:36
		Page 39

1	MR. FALCONER: Objection. Form.	10:02:37
2	THE DEPONENT: Switchboard and DYI are	
3	very similar in the information that is captured in	
4	a snapshot. Switchboard has some additional	
5	information that DYI doesn't pertaining to Facebook	10:03:03
6	groups and advertising accounts.	
7	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) And specifically, does	
8	Switchboard contain relating to Facebook groups and	
9	advertising accounts that DYI does not?	
10	A. My understanding is that DYI doesn't have	10:03:49
11	information related to whether a user is an	
12	administrator of a particular Facebook group. I	
13	don't believe DYI has information related to a	
14	user's advertising accounts.	
15	Q. And when you say "a user's advertising	10:04:13
16	accounts," what do you mean?	
17	A. If a user is selling ads on Facebook.	
18	Q. So for the record, Switchboard has	
19	information regarding users' advertisers' accounts	
20	that are used to sell ads on Facebook; is that	10:04:46
21	correct?	
22	A. I'm not I'm not sure of the exact	
23	information relating to advertising accounts in	
24	Switchboard. That would be a question for the law	
25	enforcement response team.	10:05:06
		Page 40

1	Q. What is the law enforcement response	10:05:07
2	team?	
3	A. That that team is is receives	
4	subpoenas and requests from law enforcement	
5	regarding individual users at Facebook.	10:05:31
6	Q. And why does the law enforcement response	
7	team use Switchboard as opposed to DYI tool?	
8	MR. FALCONER: Objection. Beyond the	
9	scope of the notice.	
10	And, Mr. Duffey, again, I'll just caution	10:05:49
11	you: Don't reveal any privileged communications	
12	you may have had in the course of your work at the	
13	company in answering that question.	
14	THE DEPONENT: I don't know I don't	
15	know the the all of the reasons why the law	10:06:17
16	enforcement response team uses Switchboard. I know	
17	that Switchboard was a tool used by that team	
18	before DYI. The ability to download your	
19	information was available to users.	
20	I I I think that it the law	10:06:39
21	enforcement response team can produce records to	
22	law enforcement in response to subpoena in a more	
23	usable way than DYI has available to it as a	
24	download.	
25	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) And when you say "in a	10:07:07
		Page 41

:08
:36
:01
:29
:42
:03
42

1	the law enforcement response team would know the	10:09:04
2	answer to that question.	
3	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) Can you identify anybody	
4	by name who was on the law enforcement response	
5	team?	10:09:12
6	A. Yes. I'm going to have a very difficult	
7	time pronouncing or spelling her last name. But it	
8	is, I believe, Lana Schednenko.	
9	Another another person on on that	
10	team is a woman by the name of Beth Jarvis,	10:09:44
11	J-A-R-V-I-S.	
12	Q. Is there anyone else that you can think	
13	of?	
14	A. Not by name, no.	
15	Q. And these are current employees; is that	10:10:13
16	correct?	
17	A. I believe they are current employees,	
18	yes.	
19	Q. Is it your understanding that in response	
20	to a subpoena, the law enforcement response team	10:10:22
21	provides information about users that goes beyond	
22	the scope of what's in a DYI file?	
23	MR. FALCONER: Objection. Beyond the	
24	scope of the notice.	
25	THE DEPONENT: I don't know.	10:10:44
		Page 43

1	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) When Facebook tried to	10:10:48
2	use Switchboard to retrieve Ms. King's ESI, did	
3	that yield any results?	
4	A. I don't believe so.	
5	Q. Did Facebook use Switchboard to retrieve	10:11:04
6	any ESI for any other named plaintiff in this	
7	action?	
8	A. I don't understand what you mean by	
9	"retrieve."	
10	Q. That's a fair question.	10:11:23
11	What was Facebook using Switchboard to do	
12	with regard to Ms. King's ESI?	
13	A. We attempted to take a snapshot in order	
14	to preserve whatever information was available	
15	regarding Ms. King's account at the time at the	10:11:45
16	time at yeah, March on March 9th, 2020.	
17	Q. And is it your testimony that there was	
18	no ESI at all available with regard to Ms. King?	
19	A. I don't know if there was any ESI	
20	available at all. I don't believe there was,	10:12:16
21	but but I am not sure.	
22	Q. So was there an attempt to retrieve any	
23	data with regard to Ms. King's ESI as opposed to	
24	take a snapshot of what currently existed?	
25	MR. FALCONER: Objection. Form.	10:12:36
		Page 44

1	THE DEPONENT: Again, I I'm not I'm	10:12:42
2	not quite I don't understand what you mean by	
3	the the word "re retrieve."	
4	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) When you say you didn't	
5	believe there was any ESI available at all, what	10:12:58
6	did you mean by "available"?	
7	A. Available for preservation purposes.	
8	Q. And what does "available" mean?	
9	A. That that any information existed at	
10	the time that we tried to take the snapshot.	10:13:25
11	Q. When you say "existed," are you including	
12	in that definition data which might exist but had	
13	been anonymized or "pseudonymized" in a way such	
14	that it was just not associated with Ms. King?	
15	A. I'm not, no.	10:13:47
16	Q. Were any attempts made to reidentify or	
17	reassociate data with Ms. King's account?	
18	MR. FALCONER: Objection. Beyond the	
19	scope of the notice.	
20	THE DEPONENT: I don't know.	10:14:03
21	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) Who would know?	
22	A. When when you when you refer to	
23	sort of like anonymization and reidentification, I	
24	think I think, to me, that would be a question	
25	for the E-discovery data science team.	10:14:51
		Page 45

1	Q. And who specifically by name is on that	10:14:57
2	team who you think might have knowledge of this?	
3	A. The two data scientists that I know that	
4	are working on the Cambridge matters are Maggie Ji,	
5	M-A-G-G-I-E J-I. And Gerardo, G-E-R-A-R-D-O,	10:15:13
б	Zaragoza, Z-A-R-A-G-O-Z-A.	
7	Q. And returning to the snapshot tool, do	
8	you know if the snapshot or sorry. Strike that.	
9	With regard to the Switchboard tool, do	
10	you know if it was used to take a snapshot of any	10:15:51
11	other named plaintiff's account in this action?	
12	A. Yes, it was.	
13	Q. For which named plaintiffs?	
14	A. These all took place on March 9th, 2020.	
15	Steve Akins.	10:16:17
16	Would you like me to spell those names	
17	or are we comfortable that everybody knows who	
18	I'm talking about when I	
19	Q. With the court reporter's permission, if	
20	we can skip the spelling, the deposition will be	10:16:30
21	shorter.	
22	MS. WEAVER: Is that okay, Ms. Romano?	
23	Okay.	
24	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) Yes, you may skip the	
25	spelling and we'll clean that up later.	10:16:37
		Page 46

1	A. Okay.	10:16:40
2	Jason Ariciu, Anthony Bell, Bridgett	
3	Burke, Terry Fischer, Jordan O'Hara, and Cheryl	
4	Senko.	
5	My understanding is that Bridgett Burke,	10:17:03
6	there was a was a second account identified, and	
7	so a a Switchboard snapshot was taken on the	
8	second account on September 27th, 20221.	
9	Q. So did Facebook produce the Switchboard	
10	snapshots in this action as well as the efforts to	10:17:32
11	retrieve from the DYI tool?	
12	MR. FALCONER: Objection. Beyond the	
13	scope of the notice.	
14	THE DEPONENT: The question was has	
15	Facebook produced from the Switchboard tool? I	10:17:50
16	don't believe so, no.	
17	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) And do you know why that	
18	is?	
19	MR. FALCONER: Objection. Beyond the	
20	scope of the notice.	10:18:01
21	And, again, Mr. Duffey, to the extent you	
22	can answer that question without revealing any	
23	privileged communications, you can do so. But if	
24	you can't, you should not answer the question.	
25	THE DEPONENT: I don't know.	10:18:19
		Page 47

1	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) Was there a technical	10:18:20
2	impediment to producing the PDFs from the	
3	Switchboard tool in this case?	
4	MR. FALCONER: Objection. Beyond the	
5	scope of the notice.	10:18:27
6	THE DEPONENT: Not that I'm aware of.	
7	MS. WEAVER: We would request immediate	
8	production of those PDFs.	
9	MR. FALCONER: Understood.	
10	Lesley, we've been going just a little	10:18:48
11	more than an hour	
12	MS. WEAVER: That's fine.	
13	MR. FALCONER: When you get to a point,	
14	if we can take a quick break? I don't know if	
15	you're done with Switchboard or not, but	10:18:54
16	MS. WEAVER: We can take a break. That's	
17	fine.	
18	THE VIDEOGRAPHER: Okay. We're off the	
19	record. It's 10:19 a.m.	
20	(Recess taken.)	10:19:01
21	THE VIDEOGRAPHER: Okay. We are back on	
22	the record. It's 10:35 a.m.	
23	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) Mr. Duffey, you	
24	understand you're still under oath, correct?	
25	A. Yes, I understand that.	10:35:47
		Page 48

1	Q. And before the break, we were discussing	10:35:49
2	the Switchboard tool.	
3	Do you recall that?	
4	A. Yes, I do.	
5	Q. And when was the DYI tool first	10:35:56
6	implemented?	
7	MR. FALCONER: Objection. Beyond the	
8	scope of the notice.	
9	THE DEPONENT: I don't know.	
10	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) You testified earlier	10:36:10
11	that the Switchboard tool was used before the DYI	
12	tool.	
13	Do you recall that?	
14	A. Yes, I do recall that testimony, yes.	
15	Q. And what, roughly, do you recall about	10:36:21
16	the timeline of the Switchboard tool being used to	
17	take snapshots of ESI as opposed to the DYI tool?	
18	MR. FALCONER: Objection. Beyond the	
19	scope.	
20	THE DEPONENT: I started at the company	10:36:41
21	in in 2017, and we have been using Switchboard	
22	since then. I I don't recall DYI having been	
23	available for snapshot in that time period. So	
24	that's why my belief is that Switchboard was used	
25	before before DYI.	10:37:09
		Page 49

1	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) And when you say "in	10:37:11
2	that time period," do you mean 2017 or 2018?	
3	A. Yeah, both. You know, it was it was	
4	not I meant I meant 2017 when I started,	
5	but but in 2018, I don't recall DYI being used	10:37:32
6	as as a preservation tool for snapshots.	
7	Q. Did the DYI tool become the tool to be	
8	used as preservation well, strike that. Let me	
9	ask the question again.	
10	At some point in time, did Facebook begin	10:38:01
11	to use the DYI tool to take snapshots for	
12	preservation purposes?	
13	MR. FALCONER: Objection. Form.	
14	THE DEPONENT: Both are used. I don't	
15	recall when the, you know, the first instance of	10:38:22
16	E-discovery team using DYI as a preservation	
17	mechanism for user accounts.	
18	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) Fair enough.	
19	Do you know if the DYI tool is used as	
20	commonly as the Switchboard tool for preservation	10:38:44
21	snapshots?	
22	MR. FALCONER: Objection. Beyond the	
23	scope of the notice.	
24	THE DEPONENT: I don't know that.	
25	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) In your experience, have	10:38:57
		Page 50
		Page 50

1	you more often used the Switchboard tool than the	10:38:57
2	DYI tool for preservation snapshots?	
3	MR. FALCONER: Objection. Beyond the	
4	scope of the notice.	
5	THE DEPONENT: Yes.	10:39:14
6	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) And why is that?	
7	MR. FALCONER: Same objections.	
8	THE DEPONENT: I I don't know why that	
9	is. My my instinct is part of it would be	
10	because of the the way that snapshot could be	10:39:48
11	presented.	
12	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) Any other reason you can	
13	think of?	
14	MR. FALCONER: Same objection.	
15	THE DEPONENT: No.	10:40:06
16	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) And when you say it	
17	would be because of the way that snapshot could be	
18	presented, what do you mean?	
19	A. I mentioned this earlier. It's it's	
20	the sort of my understanding is that DYI is	10:40:29
21	is lots of individual files, so a Switchboard	
22	snapshot, from my experience, can be provided as a	
23	PDF.	
24	Q. And when were the Switchboard snapshots	
25	created for the named plaintiffs in this case?	10:41:00
		Page 51

1	A. March 9th, 2020. And then the second	10:41:18
2	Bridgett Burke account on September 27th, 2021.	
3	Q. And you're consulting your notes; is that	
4	correct?	
5	A. I am.	10:41:33
6	Q. And I believe if you look in your	
7	Exhibit Share that that your notes have been	
8	marked as Exhibit 386.	
9	(Exhibit 386 was marked for	
10	identification by the court reporter and is	10:41:53
11	attached hereto.)	
12	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) Do you see that?	
13	A. Yes.	
14	Q. So looking at Exhibit	
15	And just for the record, what is	10:42:16
16	Exhibit 386?	
17	A. These are notes that I took during the	
18	course of my preparation for this deposition.	
19	Q. And when did you prepare these notes?	
20	A. I think I started on Monday and continued	10:42:49
21	to update the notes through yesterday.	
22	Q. And looking at the page ending with Bates	
23	number -3258 in Exhibit 386.	
24	Do you see a reference to Switchboard	
25	there?	10:43:11
		Page 52

1	A. Yes.	10:43:15
2	Q. And do you see that it's written "has	
3	more information about other users compared to DYI.	
4	It also has information related to pages, groups,	
5	advertising accounts."	10:43:24
6	Do you see that?	
7	A. Yes.	
8	Q. How do you know that?	
9	A. Based off of discussions with Jen Allen,	
10	Jennifer Allen, who took the snapshots.	10:43:53
11	Q. Thank you.	
12	And you believe that to be true, correct?	
13	A. Yes, I do believe that to be true.	
14	Q. And when you wrote I'm sorry.	
15	You wrote those sentences; is that right?	10:44:11
16	Is that fair?	
17	A. (Nodding.)	
18	Yes.	
19	Q. Okay.	
20	When you wrote "has more information	10:44:18
21	about other users"	
22	A. Uh-huh.	
23	Q what did you mean by "other users"?	
24	A. Because Switchboard is used by the law	
25	enforcement response team, I believe that	10:44:40
		Page 53

1	Switchboard captures additional information about	10:44:44
2	who the user is interacting with.	
3	Q. Would that include	
4		
5	?	10:45:12
6	A. I don't know.	
7	Q. Do you know specifically what more	
8	information about other users Switchboard has other	
9	than DYI?	
10	A. I don't understand the question.	10:45:37
11	Q. I'm just trying to understand when you	
12	say "has more information about other users"	
13	specifically what that is.	
14	Can you be more specific?	
15	A. Compared to DYI?	10:45:53
16	Q. Yes.	
17	A. Is that the question?	
18	Q. Yes.	
19	A. I don't have that level of detail, no.	
20	Q. But Jennifer Allen would; is that right?	10:45:59
21	A. I think that would be more of an	
22	appropriate question to the law enforcement	
23	response team.	
24	Q. And did you speak with them in	
25	preparation for your deposition?	10:46:16
		Page 54

1	A. No.	10:46:18
2	Q. Do you see where you wrote "it"	
3	meaning Switchboard "also has information	
4	related to pages, groups, advertising accounts"?	
5	A. Yes.	10:46:35
6	Q. What information does Switchboard have	
7	about pages that the DYI tool does not?	
8	A. The question was asking about pages	
9	specifically?	
10	Q. Yes.	10:47:02
11	A. I don't know.	
12	Q. What information did the Switchboard tool	
13	have about groups that the DYI does not?	
14	A. My understanding is that the DYI tool	
15	does not maintain information about groups for	10:47:27
16	advertising accounts.	
17	Q. And when you say "groups," what do you	
18	mean?	
19	A. Facebook groups.	
20	Q. And can you state for the record what	10:47:44
21	Facebook groups are?	
22	A. Sure. I'm sorry.	
23	Q. No problem.	
24	A. A group is how would I if you have	
25	an interest in a specific topic, for instance,	10:48:05
		Page 55

1	surfing, there could be a group established or	10:48:10
2	or created or in existence that is related to	
3	surfing that you could, you know, join and interact	
4	with others that are not necessarily your or not	
5	your friends, but people that have the same level	10:48:29
6	of interest.	
7	So that is the a way to interact	
8	outside of your network of of friends.	
9	Q. Do you know if the Switchboard tool has	
10	the ability to collect information about privacy	10:48:43
11	settings?	
12	A. I believe it does, yes.	
13	Q. And what specific information about	
14	privacy settings can the Switchboard tool collect?	
15	A. I don't know the answer to that.	10:49:04
16	Q. Okay. What's the basis for saying that	
17	you think it does have the ability to collect	
18	information about privacy settings?	
19	A. The basis would just be, you know, having	
20	worked worked on a variety of of, you know,	10:49:25
21	legal matters.	
22	Q. And what specifically do you know, as you	
23	sit here, about what information about privacy	
24	settings the Switchboard tool can collect?	
25	A. I don't know anything specifically. I	10:49:49
		Page 56

1	just I just understand that the Switchboard tool	10:49:50
2	can has has information about privacy	
3	settings in it, but but nothing specific, to my	
4	knowledge	
5	Q. Okay.	10:50:04
6	A that I can share with me.	
7	Q. Fair enough.	
8	And when you say "privacy settings," what	
9	do you mean, just so that we understand each other?	
10	A. I mean the the controls that a user	10:50:18
11	can set about, for instance, who can see your posts	
12	or so so the settings for access of of	
13	information related to your user account.	
14	Q. Do you know if the Switchboard tool	
15	reflects information about privacy settings on	10:50:38
16	as opposed to	
17	3	
18	A. I don't know.	
19	Q. Okay.	
20	Does the privacy sorry.	10:50:56
21	Does the Switchboard have the ability to	
22	collect information about	
23	?	
24	MR. FALCONER: Objection. Form.	
25	THE DEPONENT: I don't know if if I	10:51:17
		Page 57

1	understand the question. What you do you mean by	10:51:19
2	"which apps"?	
3	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) That's fair.	
4	What is an app, for the record?	
5	A. It's it's a product that you can	10:51:32
6	download onto your onto your phone.	
7	Q. Okay.	
8	And you're aware that users can download	
9	apps through the Facebook platform; is that right?	
10	A. Yes.	10:51:51
11	Q. And does the Switchboard tool have the	
12	ability to identify ?	
13	MR. FALCONER: Objection. Beyond the	
14	scope.	
15	But go ahead, Mike.	10:52:02
16	THE DEPONENT: I I don't know.	
17	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) Do you know who would	
18	know?	
19	A. I would I would refer to the law	
20	enforcement response team to be able to answer that	10:52:16
21	question.	
22	Q. Okay.	
23	Looking a little lower on this page, do	
24	you see where it says "Note: In the aggregate,	
25	Facebook preserved 52 Switchboard snapshots across	10:52:27
		Page 58

1	groups, pages, ads accounts in fall 2021 for the	10:52:32
2	named plaintiffs one identifies as admins."	
3	Do you see that?	
4	A. I do.	
5	Q. What's your understanding of what	10:52:43
6	happened in fall of 2021 with regard to these	
7	Switchboard snapshots?	
8	A. If any of the named plaintiffs were	
9	admins for any groups or pages, then snapshots were	
10	taken of those groups and pages, and if any of the	10:53:06
11	named plaintiffs had advertising accounts, those	
12	were also captured in a Switchboard snapshot.	
13	Q. And for clarity, when you say "named	
14	plaintiffs," you mean the individuals listed above	
15	in that box; is that correct?	10:53:29
16	A. That's correct.	
17	Q. And were those 52 Switchboard snapshots	
18	produced in this action?	
19	MR. FALCONER: Objection. Beyond the	
20	scope of the notice.	10:53:41
21	THE DEPONENT: I don't believe any	
22	Switchboard snapshots have been produced to date	
23	in in this litigation.	
24	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) And, again, you're not	
25	aware of any technical impediment that would have	10:53:55
		Page 59
		I

1	presented their production; is that right?	10:53:58
2	MR. FALCONER: Same objection.	
3	THE DEPONENT: No, I'm not.	
4	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) And 52 Switchboard	
5	snapshots that you referred to there, those were	10:54:15
6	first taken in fall of 2021; is that correct?	
7	A. Yes, that's correct.	
8	Q. Were similar Switchboard snapshots taken	
9	prior to fall of 2021?	
10	A. Yes. On March 9th, 2020, we took	10:54:42
11	snapshots of the named plaintiffs' user accounts.	
12	Q. So how did the snapshots taken on	
13	March 9th of 2020 differ from the 52 Switchboard	
14	snapshots taken in fall of 2021?	
15	A. In March 9th, 2020, we took snapshots of	10:55:05
16	the user accounts. In the fall of 2021, we took	
17	snapshots of groups and pages for which the named	
18	plaintiffs were admins and ads accounts associated	
19	with the named plaintiffs.	
20	Q. And when you say "fall of 2021," what	10:55:30
21	month are you referring to?	
22	MR. FALCONER: Objection. Form.	
23	THE DEPONENT: I don't know.	
24	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) Who would know?	
25	A. Jennifer Allen would be able to provide	10:55:50
		Page 60

# Case 3:18-md-02843-VC Document 1086-54 Filed 12/12/22 Page 62 of 233 CONFIDENTIAL

1	that information.	10:55:52
2	Q. Why were the 52 Switchboard snapshots	
3	taken in the fall of 2021?	
4	MR. FALCONER: And, Mr. Duffey, I'll just	
5	caution you: If you can answer that question	10:56:02
6	without revealing anything privileged, do so, but	
7	if you can't, please don't answer the question.	
8	THE DEPONENT: I can't answer that	
9	question.	
10	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) To be clear, when you	10:56:13
11	testified that the March 9th, 2020 snapshots were	
12	of user accounts, do you mean the DYI tool or do	
13	you mean something different?	
14	A. I don't I don't understand the	
15	question.	10:56:34
16	Q. Me either.	
17	What did you mean when you when you	
18	wrote when you said that snapshots were taken of	
19	user accounts in March 9 of 2020, what does "user	
20	accounts" mean?	10:56:45
21	A. The the Facebook account of the named	
22	plaintiffs.	
23	Q. And is what contained in a user account	
24	different than what's available in the DYI tool?	
25	MR. FALCONER: Objection. Form.	10:57:04
		Page 61

1	THE DEPONENT: I understand that there	10:57:22
2	may be some differences between what a snapshot of	
3	a Facebook user account is in Switchboard versus	
4	what is captured in a DYI for a Facebook user, but	
5	I don't know what those differences are. My	10:57:47
6	understanding is they are very very similar, but	
7	there is but there are some differences.	
8	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) Okay. I'm a little	
9	confused by what you mean by "user accounts" and	
10	the difference between user accounts and DYI.	10:58:08
11	Are you using those terms to be	
12	synonymous or are they different?	
13	A. Well, DYI is the the tool that allows	
14	Facebook users to download their information.	
15	Switchboard is a tool internal tool used by	10:58:38
16	Facebook to preserve information related to	
17	Facebook accounts, user accounts.	
18	So I am when I say "user account,"	
19	I'm I'm referring to the Facebook account of the	
20	named plaintiffs.	10:59:01
21	Q. So I apologize for being thick. I'm just	
22	trying to get this clear for the record.	
23	When you say that there was a snapshot of	
24	user accounts on March 9, 2020, was that with the	
25	DYI tool?	10:59:14
		Page 62

1	A. No, it was not. The the I have	10:59:18
2	a on my other another page of notes. I have	
3	a table that was that provides the detail of	
4	when the DYI snapshots were taken.	
5	Q. And that's at page ending -3257 in	10:59:44
6	Exhibit 386; is that correct?	
7	A. That's correct.	
8	Q. So where it says "DYI currently eight	
9	named plaintiffs" and then there's a table	
10	underneath that, that table reflects when DYI	11:00:01
11	snapshots were taken; is that correct?	
12	A. That's correct.	
13	Q. So looking back at the page ending -3258	
14	and there's a table, that table reflects the	
15	snapshots taken with the Switchboard tool; is that	11:00:19
16	correct?	
17	A. That's correct.	
18	Q. Okay.	
19	And looking back at page -3257, has	
20	Facebook produced all of the snapshots identified	11:00:33
21	here taken with the DYI tool?	
22	MR. FALCONER: Objection. Beyond the	
23	scope of the notice.	
24	THE DEPONENT: I don't know.	
25	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) Who would know?	11:00:54
		Page 63

A. I I could find out that information.	11:01:05
I just don't know that sitting here. Counsel for	
Gibson Dunn could could also get that	
information. Our E-discovery team would know. I	
just I just don't know the answer to that	11:01:17
question as I sit here.	
Q. Okay.	
And do you see that in your notes here,	
you refer to "TAO," the associations and objects	
database?	11:01:41
A. Yes.	
Q. Is it fair to call it a database?	
A. I don't know. I don't know if it would	
be called a database.	
Q. Let's call it a data source. Fair	11:01:53
enough.	
Do both DYI and Switchboard pull data	
from TAO?	
A. I believe so, yes.	
Q. Do they pull different data from TAO than	11:02:10
each other?	
A. I think I mentioned this before. My	
understanding is that the Switchboard snapshots can	
. So so while I I don't know	11:02:53
	Page 64
	I just don't know that sitting here. Counsel for Gibson Dunn could could also get that information. Our E-discovery team would know. I just I just don't know the answer to that question as I sit here.  Q. Okay.  And do you see that in your notes here, you refer to "TAO," the associations and objects database?  A. Yes.  Q. Is it fair to call it a database?  A. I don't know. I don't know if it would be called a database.  Q. Let's call it a data source. Fair enough.  Do both DYI and Switchboard pull data from TAO?  A. I believe so, yes.  Q. Do they pull different data from TAO than each other?  A. I think I mentioned this before. My understanding is that the Switchboard snapshots can

1	specifically what the differences are. I do	11:03:00
2	believe that that Switchboard does collect or	
3	collect additional information potentially from TAO	
4	that is not collected in a DYI snapshot.	
5	Q. And do you see on page -3258 you've got a	11:03:28
6	heading "Facebook can remove objects and	
7	associations," and then there's a bullet point that	
8	says "Facebook deprecates products and features,	
9	and objects and associations would be deleted when	
10	this happens"?	11:03:51
11	Do you see that?	
12	A. Yes.	
13	Q. What does "deprecate" mean, for the	
14	record?	
15	A. No longer available for use.	11:04:05
16	Q. And below that it says "	
17		
18	. "	
19	Do you see that?	
20	A. Yes, I do.	11:04:17
21	Q. What does that mean?	
22	A. So if if if a snapshot, whether it	
23	would be in DYI or Switchboard, was	
24	, then that	
25		11:04:46
		Page 65

1	the .	11:04:48
2	After deprecation, if	
3		
4		
5	Q. And looking at the chart at -3257 under	11:05:06
6	DYI, there it says "user accounts January 23,	
7	2020."	
8	Do you see that?	
9	A. Yes.	
10	Q. And that reflects when the DYI snapshots	11:05:24
11	occurred, correct?	
12	A. That is the first day in which a DYI	
13	snapshot occurred.	
14	Q. And do you know why Switchboard snapshots	
15	did not also occur in January of 2020?	11:05:40
16	MR. FALCONER: Same instruction as	
17	before, Mr. Duffey, not to reveal any privileged	
18	conversations or privileged information you may	
19	have in the course of answering that question.	
20	THE DEPONENT: I can't answer that	11:06:01
21	question.	
22	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) Do you know of any	
23	technical reason why the Switchboard snapshots did	
24	not occur in January of 2020?	
25	A. No.	11:06:16
		Page 66

1	Q. And by that, you understand I mean like a	11:06:17
2	practical impediment to actually taking the	
3	snapshot? Is that fair?	
4	A. That's fair.	
5	Q. Okay.	11:06:24
6	So we were talking a moment ago about	
7	objects and associations, and then I'll refer you	
8	back to the bullet point below the one we just read	
9	where it says "preserved if data captured in Hive	
10	placed on legal hold."	11:06:45
11	Do you see that?	
12	A. Give me one second.	
13	Q. Sorry. It's the third bullet point down.	
14	A. Yes, I see it.	
15	Q. What is Hive?	11:07:04
16	A. I'm going to refer to my notes.	
17	Hive is a a data warehouse that	
18	captures and stores data about its products and	
19	services, also user activity for analytics	
20	purposes.	11:07:33
21	Q. And are you looking at page -3258 of	
22	Exhibit 386?	
23	A. Yes, I am.	
24	Q. And how did you develop your	
25	understanding of what Hive is?	11:07:53
		Page 67

1	A. My understanding of Hive has evolved over	11:08:02
2	time, since I started working at the company in	
3	2017. I also had some discussions with our data	
4	science team in preparation for this deposition.	
5	Because I'm not a data scientist or a computer	11:08:24
6	science engineer, I thought it would be helpful to	
7	prepare notes about about Hive and what it is.	
8	Q. And when you say the the data	
9	scientists you're referring to are Maggie Ji and	
10	Gerardo Zaragoza; is that right?	11:08:47
11	A. That's correct.	
12	Q. And did you develop your understanding of	
13	Hive in preparation for this deposition by speaking	
14	with anyone other than them?	
15	A. Can you repeat the question.	11:09:03
16	Q. Sure.	
17	Are those the only two people that you	
18	conferred with regarding Hive in preparation for	
19	your deposition?	
20	A. That's correct.	11:09:13
21	Q. And going back to the bullet point that I	
22	referred to it's three down on -3257.	
23	Do you see the one that says "preserved	
24	if data captured on Hive placed on legal hold"?	
25	A. Yes.	11:09:42
		Page 68

1	Q. Can you identify which data in Hive was	11:09:42
2	placed on legal hold for this case?	
3	A. No, I can't.	
4	Q. Can anyone?	
5	A. Can you can we go back two questions	11:10:09
6	ago? Just so I I understand the question.	
7	Q. Yeah. No problem.	
8	Let me try it this way. Was any data in	
9	Hive placed on legal hold for this case?	
10	A. Yes.	11:10:33
11	Q. What data in Hive was placed on legal	
12	hold for this case?	
13	A. I understand that there are 137 Hive	
14	tables placed on legal hold for the	
15	Cambridge Analytica matter. We don't maintain a	11:10:51
16	description or a description of the fields or	
17	Hive tables that have been placed be on hold.	
18	If if I were to you know, needed to	
19	understand what data from those 137 tables, that	
20	would be a a question for the E-discovery data	11:11:34
21	science team.	
22	Q. It is possible for Facebook to identify	
23	those 137 Hive tables, correct?	
24	A. Yes. Our data science team could	
25	identify those tables.	11:11:53
		Page 69

1	Q. And do you know how those Hive tables	11:11:55
2	were selected?	
3	MR. FALCONER: And, again, Mr. Duffey,	
4	same same instruction about not revealing	
5	anything privileged in the course of your answer.	11:12:08
6	THE DEPONENT: In general, similar to	
7	identifying custodians relevant to a matter.	
8	Our our in-house and outside counsel conducts	
9	custodian interviews to to help identify	
10	relevant Hive tables to be placed on legal hold.	11:12:30
11	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) When were the Hive	
12	tables that we have been the discussing, the one	
13	137, placed on legal hold?	
14	A. I I don't have the answer to that.	
15	Q. Who would know?	11:13:00
16	A. That would be a question for the the	
17	E-discovery data science team.	
18	Q. Looking at your notes here the last page	
19	ending at -3259, there's a square bullet point that	
20	says "iData allows searching for Hive tables and	11:13:21
21	indicates if table is on hold."	
22	Do you see that?	
23	A. Yes.	
24	Q. So is iData a tool?	
25	A. I don't know. I don't know if if	11:13:39
		Page 70

it's a appropriate to describe it as as a tool.	11:13:42
But it it allows the ability to determine if	
a if a specific Hive Hive table is on legal	
hold.	
Q. Do you see above that there's a square	11:14:07
bullet point that says "stops partitions from being	
deleted or modified, archived into a secured area	
and hold storage"?	
Do you see that?	
A. Yes.	11:14:19
Q. What does it mean to stop a partition	
from being deleted or modified?	
A. So one way would I describe a partition i	
it's it's a set set amount of data within a	
legal hold.	11:14:41
So Hive data can be updated every single	
day, and a partition can be described as that	
you know, a single day or a, you know, Hive table	
of data going into a Hive table.	
What the legal hold process does is it	11:15:08
prevents a partition from being deleted or modified	
before or it prevents it and puts that data into	
cold storage before the data gets deleted or	
modified pursuant to, you know, the retention	
period that the table owner, the Hive table owner,	11:15:34
	Page 71
	But it it allows the ability to determine if a if a specific Hive Hive table is on legal hold.  Q. Do you see above that there's a square bullet point that says "stops partitions from being deleted or modified, archived into a secured area and hold storage"?  Do you see that?  A. Yes.  Q. What does it mean to stop a partition from being deleted or modified?  A. So one way would I describe a partition i it's it's a set set amount of data within a legal hold.  So Hive data can be updated every single day, and a partition can be described as that you know, a single day or a, you know, Hive table of data going into a Hive table.  What the legal hold process does is it prevents a partition from being deleted or modified before or it prevents it and puts that data into cold storage before the data gets deleted or modified pursuant to, you know, the retention

1	sets.	11:15:37
2	Q. And then it says "archive into a secured	
3	area in cold storage."	
4	Do you see that?	
5	A. Yes.	11:15:54
6	Q. So does the legal hold archive the data	
7	in Hive into cold storage?	
8	MR. FALCONER: Objection. Form.	
9	THE DEPONENT: Can you repeat the	
10	question.	11:16:17
11	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) Does the legal hold	
12	cause the data to be archived into a secured area	
13	in cold storage?	
14	A. Yes.	
15	Q. And what is cold storage?	11:16:35
16	A. I don't know if I can provide the	
17	definition of what cold storage is, but I but	
18	that that is the storage space for which we put	
19	legal hold Hive Hive data that is on legal hold	
20	to prevent it from being deleted or modified.	11:17:07
21	Q. And so for the 137 tables that Facebook	
22	put into cold storage for this case, the tables	
23	themselves that were not put into storage are being	
24	constantly overwritten; is that right? Like	
25	there's a copy that was put in cold storage and	11:17:33
		Page 72

1	then there's sort of the active table; is that	11:17:35
2	right?	
3	MR. FALCONER: Objection. Form.	
4	THE DEPONENT: I'm not sure I understand	
5	the question.	11:17:47
6	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) I'm going to ask a bunch	
7	of bad questions to try to get to a good clear one,	
8	because I don't really understand.	
9	So the act of putting a legal hold on a	
10	table, does that a snapshot or make a replica that	11:17:56
11	is then put into cold storage?	
12	A. It would it would take data from the	
13	Hive table that would be for instance, scheduled	
14	to be deleted or anonymized and put the partition	
15	into cold storage before that data were to be	11:18:24
16	deleted, scheduled to be deleted at on the	
17	timetable that is set by the table owner.	
18	Q. And you don't know when these 137 Hive	
19	tables were put on legal hold; is that right?	
20	A. I don't know the dates of when all	11:18:50
21	when the tables were put on legal hold, no.	
22	Q. But that is something that Facebook could	
23	tell us; is that right?	
24	A. I believe the E-discovery data science	
25	team could provide that information, yes.	11:19:04
		Page 73

1	MS. WEAVER: And, Mr. Falconer, we're	11:19:06
2	going to ask for that information.	
3	MR. FALCONER: Yeah yeah. Let's talk	
4	about that after the deposition, given the volume,	
5	so but yeah, understood.	11:19:12
6	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) For and this is the	
7	piece that I'm not asking good questions about and	
8	I want to understand.	
9	So data is put in cold storage. Do do	
10	some version of those tables continue to exist that	11:19:26
11	is overwritten and used such that if you went to	
12	the existing operative table, the one that is not	
13	in cold storage, it will not contain data that the	
14	tables in cold storage contain?	
15	A. Potentially, yes. For example, if a	11:19:45
16	table has user identifiable information, like an	
17	email address of the user, that information can	
18	only be retained up to 90 days, and so and	
19	that's where I was talking about a partition. So	
20	if if the if the data were scheduled to be	11:20:25
21	deleted on the 90th day, the legal hold would take	
22	that partition and put it in cold storage before	
23	that active Hive table data gets deleted.	
24	Q. I know you said you don't know, but I'm	
25	just going to ask to see if I can jog your memory.	11:20:51
		Page 74

1	Do you know if these Hive tables were put	11:20:54
2	on hold in 2018?	
3	MR. FALCONER: Objection. Form.	
4	THE DEPONENT: I I couldn't give you	
5	an accurate answer without, you know, consulting	11:21:15
6	with the data science team on that.	
7	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) Do you know what year	
8	roughly the Hive tables were put on hold?	
9	MR. FALCONER: Objection. Form.	
10	THE DEPONENT: We're talking about 137	11:21:39
11	Hive tables. I would imagine that Hive tables were	
12	put on legal hold starting in 2018 and have,	
13	you know, as additional you know, again, as	
14	additional Hive tables are identified relevant to a	
15	matter, we work with our our in-house and	11:22:04
16	outside counsel and our data science team and	
17	E-discovery to place those Hive tables on legal	
18	hold.	
19	When those occurred across the 137, I	
20	can't tell you.	11:22:27
21	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) Do you know if any Hive	
22	table was put on legal hold in 2018?	
23	A. Specific to Cambridge Analytica?	
24	Q. Yes.	
25	A. Yes, I believe so.	11:22:48
		Page 75

1	Q. Do you know which ones?	11:22:50
2	A. I don't.	
3	Q. And why do you say "yes, I believe so"?	
4	A. So I I've been working on	
5	Cambridge Analytica matters since March 2018. I'm	11:23:10
6	just thinking back to that time and and,	
7	you know, recall outside counsel working with	
8	E-discovery data scientists at the time. So	
9	that's that's the extent of like my memory about	
10	that.	11:23:40
11	Q. Who were the E-discovery data scientists	
12	involved in this process in 2018?	
13	A. Gerardo Zaragoza.	
14	Q. Anyone else?	
15	A. We were a much smaller team at the time.	11:24:14
16	Gerardo is the one that comes to mind that that	
17	was employed and working in the E-discovery team at	
18	the time.	
19	Q. Thank you.	
20	Do you see the bullet point where you	11:24:41
21	wrote "teams are informed about a Hive table on	
22	hold"?	
23	A. Yes.	
24	Q. What do you mean by "teams"?	
25	A. The I I meant by "teams" is the	11:24:54
		Page 76

1	table owner.	11:24:58
2	Q. And how were they informed?	
3	A. My understanding from discussions with	
4	Maggie Ji is that an email notification goes out to	
5	the table owners that a Hive table is placed on	11:25:17
6	hold.	
7	There are other ways where table owners	
8	or people with access to a Hive table can receive a	
9	notification. For instance, in that iData space,	
10	you can see if a Hive table is on legal hold.	11:25:45
11	I also understand that if a Hive owner	
12	were to modify data within within a table that	
13	there would be a a notification that that table	
14	is on legal hold and that data cannot be modified	
15	or deleted.	11:26:15
16	Q. Thank you. That's very helpful.	
17	Is it fair to say, then, that these 137	
18	Hive tables can be searched by UID?	
19	MR. FALCONER: Objection. Form.	
20	THE DEPONENT: I don't know the answer to	11:26:31
21	that.	
22	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) Do you see where the	
23	bullet point on the last page, second from the top,	
24	says "UII 90 days maximum. Longer than 90 days UII	
25	has to be deleted. RID replaces UID."	11:26:48
		Page 77

1	Do you see that?	11:26:53
2	A. Uh-huh. I do.	
3	Q. So is one reason that these tables were	
4	put on legal hold was to prevent the process by	
5	which RID replaces UID?	11:27:02
6	MR. FALCONER: Mr. Duffey, same caution	
7	about not revealing any privileged information or	
8	privileged communications in answering that	
9	question.	
10	THE DEPONENT: I don't know the answer to	11:27:21
11	that question.	
12	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) By putting this table on	
13	legal hold, did that prevent UIDs from being	
14	replaced by RIDs?	
15	A. If a UID is present within any of these	11:27:37
16	tables on legal hold, yes.	
17	Q. And you're familiar with the Hive Anon	
18	process; is that right?	
19	A. A little bit, yes.	
20	Q. Okay. And the Hive Anon process is the	11:27:57
21	process we were just discussing where RID replaces	
22	UID; is that correct?	
23	A. Yes.	
24	Q. And so legal hold prevents the Hive Anon	
25	process from operating; is that right?	11:28:12
		Page 78

1	A. If that if that it was one of the,	11:28:16
2	you know one of the you know, it really	
3	depends on on the Hive table, the reason why	
4	we're placing on legal hold. Potentially yes. I	
5	just can't give you an answer specific to any of	11:28:33
6	these 137 tables on legal hold.	
7	Q. Do you know in general if the 137 tables	
8	on legal hold include the Hive tables that are most	
9	frequently in use?	
10	MR. FALCONER: Objection. Form.	11:28:58
11	THE DEPONENT: There's upwards of, I	
12	think, Hive tables. I I don't know.	
13	I don't know what you mean by "most frequently in	
14	use." But I also don't think I would be able to	
15	answer that question, because I I don't know	11:29:23
16	the, you know, specifics of of the 137 tables on	
17	legal hold for this matter.	
18	MS. WEAVER: Okay.	
19	I think we can take a break now. It's	
20	been about an hour.	11:29:47
21	MR. FALCONER: Sure.	
22	THE VIDEOGRAPHER: Okay. And we're off	
23	the record. It's 11:29 a.m.	
24	(Recess taken.)	
25	THE VIDEOGRAPHER: Okay. We're back on	11:42:06
		Page 79

the record. It's 11:42 a.m.	11:42:07
Q. (By Ms. Weaver) Mr. Duffey, in your	
testimony just a moment ago, we were talking about	
the effect of legal hold on Hive tables.	
Do you recall that?	11:42:19
A. Yes.	
Q. And what do you mean by a "legal hold"?	
A. A legal hold is a preservation step that	
the E-discovery team undertakes to preserve	
relevant Hive table data related to a matter.	11:42:44
Q. Okay. And looking back at Exhibit 385,	
there is a definition of a "legal hold notice" on	
the second page of that document ending at Bates	
number -490.	
Do you see that?	11:43:08
A. I do.	
Q. And it says "a legal instruction to	
preserve and not delete, destroy, or otherwise	
modify relevant information relating to a legal	
matter."	11:43:26
Do you see that?	
A. Yes.	
Q. And when you were referring to legal hold	
and when you're referring to legal hold in	
Exhibit 386, do you mean a legal hold notice?	11:43:38
	Page 80
	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) Mr. Duffey, in your testimony just a moment ago, we were talking about the effect of legal hold on Hive tables.  Do you recall that?  A. Yes.  Q. And what do you mean by a "legal hold"?  A. A legal hold is a preservation step that the E-discovery team undertakes to preserve relevant Hive table data related to a matter.  Q. Okay. And looking back at Exhibit 385, there is a definition of a "legal hold notice" on the second page of that document ending at Bates number -490.  Do you see that?  A. I do.  Q. And it says "a legal instruction to preserve and not delete, destroy, or otherwise modify relevant information relating to a legal matter."  Do you see that?  A. Yes.  Q. And when you were referring to legal hold and when you're referring to legal hold in

1	A. No. I I had understood your line of	11:43:45
2	questioning to be specific to Hive Hive tables.	
3	A legal hold notice is is something is not	
4	what I was referring to when I was answering your	
5	questions about Hive.	11:44:02
6	Q. Okay. So you testified that Exhibit 385	
7	is the current legal hold policy, and there was no	
8	formal legal hold policy at Facebook until March of	
9	2020; is that correct?	
10	A. I'm just looking at at Exhibit 385.	11:44:28
11	It indicates that this policy was first posted on	
12	June 10th, 2020. I'm not sure where we're getting	
13	that March date.	
14	Q. Okay. Fine. I stand corrected.	
15	So the first legal hold policy at	11:44:47
16	Facebook at any point in time was June 10th, 2020;	
17	is that right?	
18	A. That is my understanding, yes.	
19	Q. And then in Exhibit 386, when you're	
20	referring to the legal hold on the Hive tables,	11:45:08
21	does that mean this legal hold policy such that the	
22	legal hold could not have happened prior to	
23	June 10th, 2020?	
24	A. No.	
25	Q. Okay. That's why I'm asking.	11:45:25
		Page 81

1	A. Yeah.	11:45:27
2	Q. So when you were yeah. Let me ask the	
3	question again and then you can	
4	So in Exhibit 386, when you were	
5	referring to the legal hold place had on Hive	11:45:33
6	tables, what do you mean?	
7	A. That is the actual preservation step	
8	taken by the E-discovery team at the direction of	
9	legal counsel to preserve the the relevant data	
10	contained within those Hive tables.	11:45:55
11	So that's what I mean by by legal	
12	hold.	
13	Q. And looking again at 386, that page	
14	ending at Bates number 3256, you wrote	
15	"Cambridge Analytica legal hold 469 total	11:46:14
16	custodians on hold as of May 31, 2022."	
17	Do you see that?	
18	A. Yes. One second.	
19	I do, yes.	
20	Q. And that's referring to the legal hold	11:46:31
21	notice; is that right?	
22	A. That's correct.	
23	Q. And is that the same legal hold notice or	
24	one of them that may have triggered the legal hold	
25	in the 137 Hive tables?	11:46:45
		Page 82

1	A. No. It's it's a separate action. The	11:46:54
2	legal hold notice is is sent through a a tool	
3	that that the E-discovery case managers have	
4	access to called "Legal Hold Pro." The legal holds	
5	that are done within Hive are are done,	11:47:16
6	you know, separately.	
7	Q. And those are done by the data science	
8	team; is that right?	
9	A. The preservation of Hive data tables	
10	using legal hold is done by our E-discovery data	11:47:37
11	science team.	
12	Q. Is there a similar procedure for legal	
13	holds to be placed on TAO?	
14	A. My understanding is that	
15		11:48:05
16	, and that is why we take snapshots	
17	in time using Switchboard and DYI.	
18	Q. With regard to the named plaintiffs'	
19	data, has Facebook done anything other than take	
20	the snapshots identified in Exhibit 386?	11:48:34
21	MR. FALCONER: Objection. Form.	
22	THE DEPONENT: We, as I mentioned, have	
23	put 137 Hive Hive tables on legal hold. We also	
24	have a legal hold notification that goes to has	
25	gone to 469 custodians.	11:49:12

1	So so I think more has been done other	11:49:20
2	than the snapshots through DYI and Switchboard.	
3	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) So to be clear, the	
4	actions taken by Facebook in addition to the	
5	snapshots identified in 386 is to put the 137 Hive	11:49:45
6	tables on legal hold and a legal hold notice has	
7	gone to 469 Facebook custodians, correct?	
8	A. As of as of May 31st, 2022, that's	
9	correct.	
10	Q. And is there anything else Facebook has	11:50:05
11	done to preserve the named plaintiffs' data other	
12	than the snapshots and putting the Hive tables in	
13	cold storage?	
14	MR. FALCONER: Objection. Form.	
15	THE DEPONENT: I'm I'm not aware of	11:50:40
16	all the places to for which named plaintiff data	
17	is stored within, you know, Facebook's internal	
18	systems. Unless a user were to delete their	
19	account, we would have potentially additional named	
20	plaintiff data in our internal some of our	11:51:13
21	internal tools and systems.	
22	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) Which internal tools and	
23	systems are you referring to that might also	
24	contain named plaintiff data?	
25	A. There is a a tool called "SRT." It's	11:51:41
		Page 84

1	the single it stands for I think "single	11:51:46
2	review tool," which contains information related to	
3	users and activities of users.	
4	There is an another sort of what we	
5	describe as an investigative tool called "Centra"	11:52:07
6	which we Facebook personnel with access to	
7	Centra could obtain information related to Facebook	
8	users.	
9	Those those are the two main ones that	
10	come to mind for me. Again, I I I'm not sort	11:52:54
11	of familiar with all internal tools that contain	
12	user data, but those are two main ones that I'm	
13	familiar with.	
14	Q. Thank you.	
15	With regard to SRT, or the single review	11:53:11
16	tool, is information available through SRT that is	
17	not captured through the DYI tool or through the	
18	Switchboard tool?	
19	A. That that is a tough question to	
20	answer. The the single review tool is used by	11:53:40
21	many different pillars within the company. I don't	
22	know the answer to that question.	
23	Q. And you said Centra is an investigative	
24	tool. What did you mean by that?	
25	A. It's it's a tool that, you know,	11:54:14
		Page 85

teams for instance, I have access to  id can if I have the appropriate UID  on can look up some basic information  ig to an individual Facebook user.  And when you say "basic information,"  for instance, registration date, email  ised to or phone number used to sign up  count. There are links to posts and  There are could be information about  11:54:20  11:54:20  11:54:20  11:54:20  11:54:20  11:54:20  11:54:20  11:54:20  11:54:20  11:55:24
con can look up some basic information  ag to an individual Facebook user.  And when you say "basic information,"  rou mean?  For instance, registration date, email  ased to or phone number used to sign up  count. There are links to posts and
And when you say "basic information,"  700 mean?  For instance, registration date, email ased to or phone number used to sign up  account. There are links to posts and
And when you say "basic information,"  700 mean?  For instance, registration date, email  81 sed to or phone number used to sign up  82 count. There are links to posts and
For instance, registration date, email used to or phone number used to sign up ecount. There are links to posts and
For instance, registration date, email used to or phone number used to sign up ecount. There are links to posts and
used to or phone number used to sign up
count. There are links to posts and
There are could be information about 11:55:24
they have, for instance, an an ads
or an Instagram account, that basic
on tied to that Facebook user would also
now, present in Centra.
Does Centra make accessible information 11:55:57
able in through the DYI or Switchboard
I'm not sure.
When did SRT first come into use?
I want to say 2017, but but I'm not 11:56:39
on that.
And when did Centra first come into use?
I don't know.
Was it within the last three years?
I I have I don't know. 11:56:58
Page 86
i

1	Q. When did you first get access to Centra?	11:57:00
2	A. I think it was pre-COVID, so 2021 or	
3	no. Excuse me. 2019, early 2020.	
4	Q. Time has flown, hasn't it?	
5	With regard to SRT	11:57:38
6	A. Or stopped.	
7	Q. Something, right? It's in cold storage.	
8	With regard to SRT, is that searchable by	
9	UID or user name?	
10	A. Centra is I don't know if SRT is is	11:58:15
11	searchable by that way.	
12	Q. How does SRT search in general?	
13	A. As I mentioned, there are different	
14	pillars that use SRT, so like depending on the	
15	pillar, that search capability could be different.	11:58:41
16	I haven't attempted to run any searches in SRT	
17	for for a while, so I I don't I don't know	
18	all of the fields or information required to search	
19	within SRT.	
20	Q. Okay. And when you say "different	11:59:03
21	pillars," what do you mean?	
22	A. So, for instance, the research team has a	
23	pillar within SRT. I know that privacy operations	
24	has a pillar within SRT. The one that I was	
25	thinking about was the pillar for community	11:59:37
		Page 87
		I

1	operations, that instance within SRT.	11:59:45
2	Q. And so when I asked where named plaintiff	
3	data might reside and you responded thinking about	
4	SRT, was that because you thought named plaintiff	
5	data might be in community operations?	12:00:04
6	A. In that's correct.	
7	Q. And how would you search for a named	
8	plaintiff data in community operations?	
9	MR. FALCONER: Objection. Beyond the	
10	scope.	12:00:17
11	But go ahead.	
12	THE DEPONENT: I don't know that I would	
13	go into SRT to search for specific named plaintiff	
14	data. The Centra tool is is where I would run a	
15	search for user you know, if I had user	12:00:39
16	identifiable information, and then there could be	
17	links to SRT through Centra. And so that that	
18	is the way that I would think about navigating	
19	between those two tools.	
20	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) And how long does it	12:01:08
21	take to run a search in Centra for one person?	
22	MR. FALCONER: Objection. Form.	
23	THE DEPONENT: If I had I'm sorry.	
24	MR. FALCONER: No. Go ahead.	
25	THE DEPONENT: It depends. If I have	12:01:24
		Page 88

1	exact information about a particular user, the	12:01:28
2	search is is is, you know, within seconds.	
3	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) And do you know if	
4	Centra searches have been run for the named	
5	plaintiffs in this case?	12:01:49
6	MR. FALCONER: Objection. Beyond the	
7	scope.	
8	THE DEPONENT: I don't know. I don't	
9	know.	
10	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) And clarifying question.	12:02:10
11	Is Centra a tool or is it also a	
12	repository of named plaintiff data?	
13	MR. FALCONER: Objection.	
14	THE DEPONENT: I would describe it as a	
15	tool.	12:02:24
16	MR. FALCONER: I want to get the	
17	objection on the record.	
18	This is beyond the scope of the notice.	
19	But go ahead.	
20	MS. WEAVER: Sorry, Russ.	12:02:30
21	MR. FALCONER: It's okay.	
22	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) And what data sources do	
23	Centra and SRT search?	
24	MR. FALCONER: Same objection.	
25	THE DEPONENT: I don't know.	12:02:44
		Page 89

1	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) And do you know if the	12:02:44
2	data sources that Centra and SRT search were	
3	preserved?	
4	MR. FALCONER: Same objection.	
5	THE DEPONENT: Barring a user deleting	12:03:04
6	their their account, that information would be	
7	preserved or retained within either Centra or SRT	
8	without having to, you know, proactively take steps	
9	to to preserve that information.	
10	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) I think I'll come back	12:03:54
11	to that.	
12	For the record, no snapshots were taken	
13	for any named plaintiff between January 23rd,	
14	2020 I'm sorry. Let me ask the question again.	
15	There were no snapshots taken for named	12:04:08
16	plaintiffs between March 9, 2020, and March 15,	
17	2022; is that correct?	
18	A. I think there there are some	
19	exceptions to that. For instance, Bridgett Burke	
20	had, you know, two accounts. It looks like Terry	12:05:05
21	Fischer, a snapshot in DYI was taken on April 20th,	
22	2020.	
23	So so Terry Fischer and Bridgett Burke	
24	are two exceptions. All other named plaintiffs	
25	that that you're correct.	12:05:38
		Page 90

1	Q. Is Facebook intending to take snapshots	12:05:42
2	now on a monthly basis going forward?	
3	MR. FALCONER: Objection. Beyond the	
4	scope of the notice.	
5	THE DEPONENT: I don't know.	12:05:54
6	MS. WEAVER: I think, Russ, we'd like to	
7	know what Facebook's intentions are with ongoing	
8	preservation, and I think that's within the scope	
9	of the notice.	
10	But we can talk about it later.	12:06:09
11	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) Okay. So returning back	
12	again to Exhibit 385.	
13	Do you see where it defines "relevant	
14	information" in this document?	
15	A. Yes.	12:06:35
16	Q. And it defines relevant information as	
17	"ESI, hard copy documents, and/or other tangible	
18	materials that are identified as being relevant to	
19	a legal matter."	
20	Do you see that?	12:06:47
21	A. I do.	
22	Q. And was that the type of relevant	
23	information subject to the legal holds issued in	
24	this case, beginning with the first one that was	
25	issued on March 22nd, 2018?	12:07:06
		Page 91

1	A. Can you repeat the question, please.	12:07:16
2	Q. Is the definition of "relevant	
3	information" set forth in Exhibit 385 consistent	
4	with the relevant information for which Facebook	
5	applied the the legal hold for this case that	12:07:33
6	was first sent on March 22nd, 2018?	
7	A. I haven't reviewed the legal hold notice	
8	for this case in preparation for my deposition.	
9	But I can say that all legal hold notices sent by	
10	the E-discovery team for whatever matter instructs	12:08:03
11	the custodians to preserve and not delete any	
12	information relevant to a matter.	
13	Q. Why haven't you reviewed the legal hold	
14	notice sent in this matter?	
15	MR. FALCONER: So I'm going to just	12:08:26
16	caution Mr. Duffey not to reveal contents of any	
17	conversations you had with counsel about that, and	
18	so if all you know is what you learned from	
19	counsel, you should refuse to answer the question.	
20	If there's anything else you know that's not	12:08:41
21	privileged, you can share that.	
22	THE DEPONENT: I can't answer that	
23	question.	
24	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) Okay. And looking at	
25	Exhibit 386, you wrote that there were six	12:08:52
		Page 92
		ı

# Case 3:18-md-02843-VC Document 1086-54 Filed 12/12/22 Page 94 of 233 CONFIDENTIAL

1	different versions of the legal hold notice sent	12:08:55
2	relating to this action; is that correct?	
3	A. Correct.	
4	Q. And when you say "Cambridge Analytica	
5	legal hold," that means this case; is that right?	12:09:08
6	A. It means this case, the multi-district	
7	litigation, but also means the various state AG	
8	matters, the you know, proceeding FTC	
9	investigation. It's a, you know, overarching legal	
10	hold related to Cambridge Analytica, and so	12:09:36
11	Q. When you say "related to	
12	Cambridge Analytica," what's the subject matter of	
13	the legal hold notice?	
14	MR. FALCONER: So, Mr. Duffey, I will	
15	again just caution you not to reveal anything about	12:09:59
16	the language or the contents of the legal hold	
17	notice to the extent that you remember it from your	
18	work outside the context of preparing for your	
19	deposition. But within that framework, you can	
20	answer it the best you can.	12:10:13
21	THE DEPONENT: As as I stated, I	
22	haven't reviewed the notice in preparation for the	
23	deposition, but in general, our legal hold notices	
24	provide a summary of the matter and then provide a,	
25	you know, listing of relevant topics associated	12:10:38
		Page 93

# Case 3:18-md-02843-VC Document 1086-54 Filed 12/12/22 Page 95 of 233 CONFIDENTIAL

1	with that particular matter. And so that's	12:10:44
2	that's sort of the general construct of our of	
3	our legal hold notices.	
4	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) And do you know if the	
5	subject matter described in the legal hold notices	12:11:07
6	included, for example, a request to preserve ESI	
7	and relevant information relating to the app	
8	developer investigation?	
9	MR. FALCONER: So I'm going to instruct	
10	Mr. Duffey not to answer any question on privilege	12:11:22
11	grounds that relates to the the contents of the	
12	hold notice. The notice itself is privileged and	
13	work product communication, so on that basis I'm	
14	going to instruct him not to answer that question.	
15	MS. WEAVER: Okay. And this legal hold	12:11:36
16	notice was sent to 469 people who work at Facebook,	
17	and Facebook's position is that it's a privileged	
18	document; is that right?	
19	MR. FALCONER: Yes, and work product as	
20	well.	12:11:49
21	MS. WEAVER: And Facebook understands	
22	that if Facebook asserts privilege over this	
23	document and prevents me from conducting inquiries	
24	into it, it may not raise it as a shield, correct?	
25	MR. FALCONER: You're I'm happy to	12:12:01
		Page 94

1	have you ask questions about what	12:12:03
2	SPECIAL MASTER GARRIE: Counsel	
3	Counsel.	
4	MR. FALCONER: Yeah.	
5	SPECIAL MASTER GARRIE: This is Special	12:12:08
6	Master Garrie. We've noted the objection for the	
7	record. We're not going to discuss or or rule	
8	or have any conversations on the objections. It	
9	was noted, he instructed the witness accordingly,	
10	and we will move forward and discuss this once the	12:12:20
11	deposition is over, if necessary, and pursuant to	
12	the prior conversations we've had.	
13	Unless there's a particular issue you're	
14	seeking clarification on, Counsel Weaver.	
15	MS. WEAVER: That's fine. I'm just	12:12:44
16	defining the position.	
17	SPECIAL MASTER GARRIE: The issue is	
18	asserted.	
19	Counsel Falconer, would you like to	
20	respond, since she did seek the clarification, and	12:12:48
21	then we will curb our enthusiasm and limit any	
22	further comments.	
23	MR. FALCONER: Yeah, like I said, I'm	
24	happy to have the witness about the actions the	
25	employees were instructed to take and describe the	12:13:01
		Page 95

# Case 3:18-md-02843-VC Document 1086-54 Filed 12/12/22 Page 97 of 233 CONFIDENTIAL

1	hold notice at a general level, but in a way that	12:13:02
2	doesn't reveal the contents of the notice itself,	
3	which is the subject of the privilege and work	
4	product.	
5	SPECIAL MASTER GARRIE: Okay. Noted for	12:13:12
6	the record.	
7	Counsel Weaver, we note your point for	
8	the record.	
9	Now we will proceed forward accordingly.	
10	MS. WEAVER: Excellent.	12:13:22
11	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) Mr. Duffey, looking at	
12	Exhibit 386 again, on the second page ending with	
13	Bates number -3257. And I'm looking at your	
14	description of the various legal holds that were	
15	issued related to this action. And	12:13:35
16	A. Okay.	
17	Q. Okay. And you referred to a fifth hold	
18	issued on June 16th, 2020.	
19	Do you see that?	
20	A. I do.	12:13:50
21	Q. And it says "	
22	Do you see that,	
23	A. Yes.	
24	Q. So prior to June 16th, 2020, was there a	
25	on the relevant information that	12:14:04
		Page 96

[		
1	custodians were instructed to preserve?	12:14:11
2	A. I don't recall if there	
3	prior or not.	
4	Q. How would I find out?	
5	A. The E-discovery team could could get	12:14:38
6	that information through the Legal Hold Pro	
7	software that we use.	
8	Q. And then the bullet point below says	
9	"added example of a data source that falls within	
10	the hold."	12:15:00
11	Do you see that?	
12	A. Yes.	
13	Q. Do you know what that example is?	
14	MR. FALCONER: So again	
15	THE DEPONENT: I don't	12:15:11
16	MR. FALCONER: instruct Mr. Duffey not	
17	to answer that question. If that was I	
18	didn't didn't hear what he said, but if he got	
19	an answer out, I'd like to move to strike it.	
20	Again, I don't just to reiterate, I	12:15:19
21	don't want any testimony about the actual contents	
22	of the language of the hold notice itself.	
23	MS. WEAVER: So he can testify about his	
24	notes that are a partial description, but I can't	
25	ask any follow-up questions?	12:15:34
		Page 97

# Case 3:18-md-02843-VC Document 1086-54 Filed 12/12/22 Page 99 of 233 CONFIDENTIAL

1	MR. FALCONER: I mean	12:15:39
2	SPECIAL MASTER GARRIE: Is that a	
3	rhetorical question, Counsel Weaver?	
4	MS. WEAVER: Well, I'm just clarifying	
5	his position.	12:15:50
6	SPECIAL MASTER GARRIE: He objected and	
7	instructed the witness not to speak to anything	
8	that may that he constituted attorney-client	
9	privilege or the substance of the the actual	
10	substance of the notice.	12:16:01
11	Is that not correct, Counsel Falconer?	
12	MR. FALCONER: Yeah, that's correct.	
13	SPECIAL MASTER GARRIE: And he has	
14	instructed the witness accordingly. So	
15	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) Do you see where it	12:16:13
16	says, Mr. Duffey, "suspend auto deletion routine"?	
17	A. Yes.	
18	Q. Do you know if prior to June 16th, 2020,	
19	auto deletion routines were suspended with regard	
20	to litigation holds issued relating to this matter?	12:16:30
21	A. There are there are only a couple data	
22	sources that that I am aware of that have a	
23	retention schedule.	
24	So I'm not sure I I understand I	
25	understand the question.	12:17:12
		Page 98

### Case 3:18-md-02843-VC Document 1086-54 Filed 12/12/22 Page 100 of 233 CONFIDENTIAL

1	Q. I'm just asking if prior to June 16th,	12:17:17
2	2020, there were auto deletion routines that were	
3	not suspended with regard to preserving ESI related	
4	to this matter that were then suspended in on	
5	June 16th, 2020.	12:17:34
6	A. I'm not aware of any.	
7	Q. What auto deletion routine did you refer	
8	to when you wrote that bullet point?	
9	MR. FALCONER: Objection. Form.	
10	THE DEPONENT: I believe that that is in	12:18:19
11	reference to the use of ephemeral messaging.	
12	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) And what is ephemeral	
13	messaging?	
14	A. Ephemeral messaging is a a way for	
15	which a a user of a communications app, like	12:18:47
16	WhatsApp, for instance, could set a auto deletion	
17	schedule on their messages.	
18	Q. And do you know if any of the 392	
19	custodians identified to preserve ESI in connection	
20	with this litigation used ephemeral messaging?	12:19:20
21	MR. FALCONER: Objection. Beyond the	
22	scope.	
23	THE DEPONENT: I I can think of one	
24	custodian that that that may have been using	
25	ephemeral messaging at the time this notice went	12:20:10
		Page 99

### Case 3:18-md-02843-VC Document 1086-54 Filed 12/12/22 Page 101 of 233 CONFIDENTIAL

out.	12:20:14
Q. (By Ms. Weaver) Who was that?	
MR. FALCONER: Same objection.	
THE DEPONENT: I believe Mark Zuckerberg	
may have been using ephemeral messaging.	12:20:31
Q. (By Ms. Weaver) And what's the basis for	
that belief?	
MR. FALCONER: Same objection.	
And, again, Mr. Duffey, if caution you	
again, as I have before, any privileged	12:20:49
communications or privileged information you have	
on that shouldn't form part of your answer.	
THE DEPONENT: I don't think I can answer	
that question.	
Q. (By Ms. Weaver) Do you know if any other	12:21:14
Facebook executive used ephemeral messaging during	
the pendency of this litigation?	
MR. FALCONER: Objection. Beyond the	
scope.	
THE DEPONENT: I'm I'm not sure I	12:21:34
understand the question.	
Q. (By Ms. Weaver) Did Sheryl Sandberg use	
ephemeral messaging during the pendency of this	
litigation?	
MR. FALCONER: Objection. Beyond the	12:21:42
	Page 100
	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) Who was that?  MR. FALCONER: Same objection.  THE DEPONENT: I believe Mark Zuckerberg  may have been using ephemeral messaging.  Q. (By Ms. Weaver) And what's the basis for that belief?  MR. FALCONER: Same objection.  And, again, Mr. Duffey, if caution you again, as I have before, any privileged communications or privileged information you have on that shouldn't form part of your answer.  THE DEPONENT: I don't think I can answer that question.  Q. (By Ms. Weaver) Do you know if any other Facebook executive used ephemeral messaging during the pendency of this litigation?  MR. FALCONER: Objection. Beyond the scope.  THE DEPONENT: I'm I'm not sure I understand the question.  Q. (By Ms. Weaver) Did Sheryl Sandberg use ephemeral messaging during the pendency of this litigation?

### Case 3:18-md-02843-VC Document 1086-54 Filed 12/12/22 Page 102 of 233 CONFIDENTIAL

1	scope.	12:21:42
2	And, again, my same instruction as	
3	before. You know, privileged information or	
4	knowledge of a privilege communication, that	
5	shouldn't form a part of your answer.	12:21:53
6	THE DEPONENT: I I think the part	
7	of the reason why I'm struggling with the question	
8	is just you're naming employees of the company,	
9	and I need to know whether or not they are on legal	
10	hold for the Cambridge Analytica multi-district	12:22:09
11	litigation.	
12	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) And do you have a list	
13	or does someone have a list well, strike that.	
14	Does Facebook have a list of who received	
15	the legal hold notifications that you discuss in	12:22:23
16	Exhibit 386?	
17	A. A list could be generated from from	
18	our legal hold tool.	
19	Q. And you could identify from that list	
20	whether or not any of those individuals used	12:22:41
21	ephemeral messaging; is that correct?	
22	MR. FALCONER: Objection. Beyond the	
23	scope.	
24	THE DEPONENT: No, I couldn't identify	
25	from the list whether or not the custodians were	12:22:56
		Page 101

### Case 3:18-md-02843-VC Document 1086-54 Filed 12/12/22 Page 103 of 233 CONFIDENTIAL

1	using or are using ephemeral messaging, no.	12:22:59
2	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) Did Facebook take steps	
3	to determine whether or not custodians subject to	
4	the legal hold in this case were using ephemeral	
5	messaging?	12:23:15
6	A. Yes, that those questions are asked as	
7	part of custodian interviews. We instruct our	
8	custodians to not delete any information or data	
9	relevant to a legal matter if we also instruct	
10	the custodians to notify the legal team and	12:23:58
11	E-discovery if they are aware of information,	
12	documents, ESI are being deleted or have been	
13	deleted.	
14	So those those are samples of steps	
15	that that we undertake as a a E-discovery	12:24:25
16	team.	
17	Q. What ephemeral messaging platform was	
18	Mr. Zuckerberg using?	
19	MR. FALCONER: Objection. Beyond the	
20	scope.	12:24:38
21	THE DEPONENT: The only one that I can	
22	think of is is WhatsApp.	
23	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) And was any well,	
24	strike that.	
25	And looking at back at Exhibit 385, it	12:25:06
		Page 102

### Case 3:18-md-02843-VC Document 1086-54 Filed 12/12/22 Page 104 of 233 CONFIDENTIAL

1		
1	defines "ephemeral messaging," doesn't it?	12:25:11
2	A. Yes.	
3	Q. And what does the policy say about	
4	ephemeral messaging?	
5	A. It says "once receiving a legal hold,	12:25:59
6	custodians should not use ephemeral messaging to	
7	communicate relevant information and preserve	
8	should preserve any existing relevant information	
9	that would otherwise auto delete or disappear after	
10	a short period of time."	12:26:14
11	I I am aware of our electronic	
12	communications policy where there are exceptions to	
13	the use of ephemeral messaging.	
14	Q. And what are these	
15	A. But that's	12:26:38
16	I'd have to I'd have to have the	
17	document in front of me.	
18	Q. Okay.	
19	(Exhibit 387 was marked for	
20	identification by the court reporter and is	12:26:57
21	attached hereto.)	
22	MS. WEAVER: Let's mark tab 48 as	
23	Exhibit 387.	
24	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) And while we're	
25	waiting well, let me	12:27:54
		Page 103
Į.		

### Case 3:18-md-02843-VC Document 1086-54 Filed 12/12/22 Page 105 of 233 CONFIDENTIAL

1	А.	I think it just appeared.	12:27:57
2	Q.	Apologies.	
3	Α.	I'm sorry. I didn't hear.	
4	Q.	I didn't hear what you said either.	
5	А.	Oh.	12:28:05
6	Q.	Do you have Exhibit 387?	
7	Α.	I do now.	
8	Q.	Great.	
9		Do you recognize it?	
10	А.	Yes.	12:28:16
11	Q.	Is this the document you were referring	
12	to?		
13	Α.	No. No, I was referring to the	
14	electroni	c communications policy.	
15	Q.	Okay. Well, just for the moment, what is	12:28:30
16	the wh	nat is Exhibit 387?	
17	A.	It is the email and Workplace Chat	
18	retention	n policy.	
19		MS. WEAVER: And, Josh, will you please	
20	mark tab	26 as Exhibit 388.	12:28:47
21		(Exhibit 388 was marked for	
22	identific	cation by the court reporter and is	
23	attached	hereto.)	
24	Q.	(By Ms. Weaver) And let me know when you	
25	have it.		12:29:38
			Page 104

### Case 3:18-md-02843-VC Document 1086-54 Filed 12/12/22 Page 106 of 233 CONFIDENTIAL

1	A. I have it now.	12:29:49
2	Q. And what is Exhibit 388?	
3	A. That is the electronic communications	
4	policy.	
5	Q. And it defines "ephemeral messaging"; is	12:29:58
6	that correct? At the Bates number ending at -463?	
7	A. It does.	
8	Q. And at paragraph 3.3 it says "ephemeral	
9	messaging means messaging that automatically	
10	disappears or expires from the recipient's screen	12:30:13
11	after a period of time"; is that correct?	
12	A. Yes, that's correct.	
13	Q. And 3.2 defines business communication as	
14	"substantive work-related electronic communications	
15	made and/or received by Meta personnel for the	12:30:32
16	purposes of communicating about communicating	
17	about or conducting Meta business."	
18	Do you see that?	
19	A. I do.	
20	Q. And is this a document that you were	12:30:44
21	referring to earlier?	
22	A. That is the document I was referring to	
23	earlier. I was specifically thinking of section	
24	6 at Bates number -466 to -467, in section 6.1	
25	where it where it has a paragraph regarding	12:31:13
		Page 105

### Case 3:18-md-02843-VC Document 1086-54 Filed 12/12/22 Page 107 of 233 CONFIDENTIAL

1	exceptions.	12:31:19
2	Q. And what do you understand the exceptions	
3	to be?	
4	A. That that legal can preauthorize these	
5	exceptions to protect, for instance, highly	12:31:35
6	sensitive information related to investigations or	
7	security and to protect the safety or security of	
8	an individual, data, and/or facilities.	
9	Q. Is it your understanding that	
10	Mark Zuckerberg was exempted from this policy in	12:31:55
11	general?	
12	MR. FALCONER: I'm going to object to	
13	that question as beyond the scope of the notice.	
14	And also, Mr. Duffey, remind you not to	
15	reveal any privileged information or privileged	12:32:06
16	communication that would answer that question.	
17	THE DEPONENT: I don't know the answer to	
18	the question.	
19	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) When did this policy	
20	take effect for the first time?	12:32:20
21	A. Which policy are we referring to?	
22	Q. The policy regarding ephemeral messaging.	
23	A. Are are we talking about the	
24	electronic communications policy?	
25	Q. Sure. We can say that. Let's start with	12:32:48
		Page 106

### Case 3:18-md-02843-VC Document 1086-54 Filed 12/12/22 Page 108 of 233 CONFIDENTIAL

1	that.	12:32:49
2	At what point in time did the electronic	
3	communications policy first take effect?	
4	A. I believe we've had an electronic	
5	communications policy prior to the pendency of this	12:33:13
6	case. I don't know when when when it was	
7	first created, though.	
8	Q. Was it a written policy?	
9	A. I believe so, yes.	
10	Q. And have you seen it in preparation for	12:33:35
11	your deposition today?	
12	A. I don't understand the question.	
13	Q. Have you reviewed a written policy	
14	strike that.	
15	You've testified that there was a an	12:33:57
16	electronic communications policy prior to the	
17	pendency of this case, correct?	
18	A. That is my understanding, yes.	
19	Q. Have you ever reviewed it in writing?	
20	A. I don't know that I reviewed it in	12:34:20
21	preparation for this deposition, but I am fairly	
22	certain that I had reviewed it as part of the,	
23	you know, normal course of business, yes.	
24	Q. And what was the substance of that	
25	policy?	12:34:38
		Page 107

# Case 3:18-md-02843-VC Document 1086-54 Filed 12/12/22 Page 109 of 233 CONFIDENTIAL

1	MR. FALCONER: Objection. Beyond the	12:34:43
2	scope of the notice.	
3	But go ahead, Mike.	
4	THE DEPONENT: I don't recall beyond the	
5	substance being related to, you know, guidance	12:34:56
6	and and policies surrounding electronic	
7	communications.	
8	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) Did that policy	
9	specifically address ephemeral messaging?	
10	MR. FALCONER: Same objection.	12:35:09
11	THE DEPONENT: I don't know.	
12	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) It would be possible to	
13	find that policy and produce it in this action,	
14	wouldn't it?	
15	MR. FALCONER: Objection. Beyond the	12:35:21
16	scope of the notice.	
17	THE DEPONENT: Yes, I believe so.	
18	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) Are you aware of any	
19	policy specifically addressing ephemeral messaging	
20	prior to November 16th, 2021?	12:35:40
21	A. I'm not sure.	
22	Q. Were Mark Zuckerberg's ephemeral messages	
23	subject to litigation hold in this case?	
24	A. I don't know.	
25	Q. Who would know?	12:37:10
		Page 108

# Case 3:18-md-02843-VC Document 1086-54 Filed 12/12/22 Page 110 of 233 CONFIDENTIAL

1	A. The usual way we would identify any	12:37:28
2	relevant ESI would be through custodian interview.	
3	Q. And looking back again at Exhibit 385, in	
4	the definition of "relevant information," you see	
5	that WhatsApp messages are specifically defined	12:37:43
6	there, correct?	
7	A. Yes.	
8	Q. Do you know if the litigation hold issued	
9	in this case in March of 2018 referenced WhatsApp	
10	messages?	12:37:58
11	MR. FALCONER: So, again, I'm going to	
12	instruct the witness not to any answer question for	
13	privilege and work product reason about the	
14	language of the hold notice.	
15	THE DEPONENT: I don't know.	12:38:14
16	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) Were WhatsApp messages	
17	preserved in connection with this litigation from	
18	March 2018 to today?	
19	A. It is up to the custodian to preserve	
20	relevant information, and that would include	12:38:33
21	WhatsApp messages.	
22	Q. Do you see a reference in Exhibit 285 or	
23	385 to Facebook messages as well?	
24	A. Yes.	
25	Q. Is it up to the custodian to delete	12:39:00
		Page 109

### 

1	Facebook messages?	12:39:02
2	MR. FALCONER: Objection. Form.	
3	THE DEPONENT: I don't understand the	
4	question.	
5	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) Well, you said it is up	12:39:13
6	to the custodian to preserve relevant information,	
7	including WhatsApp messages, correct?	
8	A. Yes.	
9	Q. Is it up to the custodian to preserve	
10	Facebook Messenger messages?	12:39:26
11	A. Yes. However, employee-to-employee	
12	Facebook Messenger messages were were captured	
13	using our our email and work chat archive up to,	
14	I believe, March 2019.	
15	Q. And does that include an archive for	12:40:14
16	Mr. Zuckerberg?	
17	A. I believe	
18	MR. FALCONER: That's beyond the scope of	
19	the notice.	
20	But go ahead.	12:40:31
21	THE DEPONENT: I believe I believe	
22	Mark has been on legal hold for this matter since	
23	the original legal hold notice went out.	
24	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) He was named as a	
25	defendant initially, correct?	12:40:40
		Page 110

# Case 3:18-md-02843-VC Document 1086-54 Filed 12/12/22 Page 112 of 233 CONFIDENTIAL

1	A. I don't know.	12:40:44
2	Q. Are you aware that at a certain point in	
3	time, Mr. Zuckerberg had the ability to delete	
4	messages in his Facebook Messenger box?	
5	MR. FALCONER: Objection. Beyond the	12:41:07
6	scope of the notice.	
7	THE DEPONENT: I don't understand the	
8	question.	
9	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) Are you aware if at any	
10	point in time following the filing of this	12:41:19
11	lawsuit well, strike that.	
12	Are you aware of whether or not Facebook	
13	executives had the ability to delete Facebook	
14	messages contained within their message in-box?	
15	MR. FALCONER: Objection. Beyond the	12:41:43
16	scope of the notice.	
17	THE DEPONENT: Employees can delete their	
18	Facebook Messenger messages.	
19	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) Are you aware of whether	
20	or not at any point in time Mr. Zuckerberg had the	12:42:11
21	power to delete his messages in other Facebook	
22	users' in-boxes?	
23	MR. FALCONER: Objection. Beyond the	
24	scope of the notice.	
25	THE DEPONENT: No.	12:42:29
		Page 111

# Case 3:18-md-02843-VC Document 1086-54 Filed 12/12/22 Page 113 of 233 CONFIDENTIAL

1	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) Are you aware of whether	12:42:29
2	at any point in time Facebook users using the	
3	Download Your Information tool became aware that	
4	Facebook messages they exchanged with	
5	Mark Zuckerberg were no longer there?	12:42:42
6	MR. FALCONER: Objection. Form and	
7	beyond the scope of the notice.	
8	THE DEPONENT: I I I don't I	
9	didn't follow that question.	
10	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) Sure.	12:42:56
11	Are you aware of whether at any point in	
12	time Facebook users could see, using the Download	
13	Your Information tool, that Facebook messages they	
14	exchanged with Mr. Zuckerberg had been deleted?	
15	MR. FALCONER: Same two objections.	12:43:13
16	THE DEPONENT: I don't know.	
17	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) Do you know if	
18	Mr. Zuckerberg or someone on his behalf deleted	
19	messages from Mr. Zuckerberg in the Facebook	
20	Messenger in-box of other users?	12:43:25
21	MR. FALCONER: Same two objections.	
22	THE DEPONENT: I don't know the answer to	
23	that.	
24	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) Do you know who would	
25	know?	12:43:36
		Page 112

# Case 3:18-md-02843-VC Document 1086-54 Filed 12/12/22 Page 114 of 233 CONFIDENTIAL

1	A. No.	12:43:39
2	MR. FALCONER: Same objection. Beyond	
3	the scope of the notice.	
4	MS. WEAVER: Okay. I think we can break	
5	for lunch if you would like.	12:43:56
6	MR. FALCONER: Okay.	
7	THE VIDEOGRAPHER: Okay. We're off the	
8	record. It's 12:44 p.m.	
9	(Recess taken.)	
10	THE VIDEOGRAPHER: Okay. We're back on	01:18:05
11	the record. It's 1:18 p.m.	
12	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) Mr. Duffey, did you have	
13	a delightful lunch?	
14	A. I did. Thank you.	
15	Q. Excellent.	01:18:13
16	(Discussion off the stenographic record.)	
17	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) You understand you're	
18	still under oath, correct?	
19	A. Yes, I do.	
20	Q. Do you know whether or not any directors	01:18:33
21	or executives subject to the litigation hold in	
22	this case used Wickr or HipChat or programs that	
23	had self-destruction features?	
24	MR. FALCONER: Objection. Form and	
25	beyond the scope of the notice.	01:18:52
		Page 113

# Case 3:18-md-02843-VC Document 1086-54 Filed 12/12/22 Page 115 of 233 CONFIDENTIAL

1	THE DEPONENT: No, I am not.	01:18:58
2	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) And you testified that	
3	you reviewed correspondence between plaintiffs'	
4	counsel and Gibson Dunn in this case, correct?	
5	A. I did.	01:19:09
6	Q. And I'll ask you to take a look at what	
7	we've marked as Exhibit 389.	
8	(Exhibit 389 was marked for	
9	identification by the court reporter and is	
10	attached hereto.)	01:19:20
11	MS. WEAVER: And while it's pulling up	
12	and the record, this is a letter dated September 6,	
13	2018, from Gibson Dunn to me and to Mr. Loeser in	
14	this case.	
15	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) And let me know when	01:19:44
16	you've had a chance to review it.	
17	A. Okay. It just appeared. Let me	
18	Okay.	
19	Q. Have you seen this letter before?	
20	A. I don't recall.	01:20:16
21	Q. Do you know if it was identified by	
22	Mr. Falconer in emails preparing for this for	
23	this deposition today?	
24	A. Can you can you repeat the question.	
25	Q. Do you know if this was one of the pieces	01:20:34
		Page 114
		I

# Case 3:18-md-02843-VC Document 1086-54 Filed 12/12/22 Page 116 of 233 CONFIDENTIAL

1	of correspondence identified by Mr. Falconer as	01:20:37
2	something you had reviewed in preparation for your	
3	deposition today?	
4	A. I don't know.	
5	Q. And did you review this letter?	01:20:51
6	A. I don't recall.	
7	Q. I'll direct your attention to page 2 of	
8	the letter. And by way of explanation, in this	
9	letter Gibson Dunn is responding to questions	
10	interposed by plaintiffs' counsel, and in No. 6 in	01:21:13
11	italics it has a quote from correspondence we sent	
12	to Gibson Dunn.	
13	It says "Your August 17th letter states	
14	that 'counsel is unaware of the use of Wickr or	
15	HipChat or other similar programs that include	01:21:29
16	self-destruction features by any employees who were	
17	issued the litigation hold notices.'"	
18	Does that statement apply to directors	
19	and executives as well?	
20	Do you see that?	01:21:42
21	A. Yes.	
22	Q. And then counsel responded "Yes. That	
23	statement applies to directors and executives to	
24	whom the litigation notice were issued."	
25	Do you see that?	01:21:55
		Page 115

# Case 3:18-md-02843-VC Document 1086-54 Filed 12/12/22 Page 117 of 233 CONFIDENTIAL

1	A. Yes.	01:21:56
2	Q. Do you know if that's true?	
3	A. As of the date of this letter on	
4	September 6, 2018, I have I have no reason to	
5	believe that it's not true.	01:22:17
6	Q. Are you aware that at some point in time	
7	Mark Zuckerberg began using programs that had a	
8	self-destruction feature?	
9	MR. FALCONER: Objection. Beyond the	
10	scope.	01:22:31
11	THE DEPONENT: I don't know.	
12	MS. WEAVER: Okay.	
13	Counsel, we'll ask that you respond to	
14	that question.	
15	We can do it outside of the deposition.	01:22:42
16	(Exhibit 390 was marked for	
17	identification by the court reporter and is	
18	attached hereto.)	
19	MS. WEAVER: We'll mark as tab 77 the	
20	next exhibit. That will be Exhibit 390.	01:22:47
21	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) While you're	
22	Are you familiar with an archiving system	
23	called Proofpoint?	
24	A. Yes, I am.	
25	Q. What is that?	01:23:31
		Page 116

# Case 3:18-md-02843-VC Document 1086-54 Filed 12/12/22 Page 118 of 233 CONFIDENTIAL

1	A. Proofpoint is our email and work chat	01:23:38
2	archiving tool.	
3	Q. And how does it function?	
4	MR. FALCONER: Objection. Form.	
5	THE DEPONENT: On a daily basis, emails	01:24:14
6	and work chats are stored within Proofpoint for a	
7	retention period that includes legal holds.	
8	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) Okay.	
9	And do you have Exhibit 390 now?	
10	A. I do.	01:24:46
11	MS. WEAVER: And I'll state for the	
12	record that this is a letter dated December 9,	
13	2019, from Gibson, Dunn & Crutcher, again to myself	
14	and Mr. Loeser in this case.	
15	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) Have you seen this	01:25:00
16	document before?	
17	A. It looks familiar. I'm I'm not	
18	100 percent sure.	
19	Q. Do you understand it to be one of the	
20	letters that Mr. Falconer indicated you would be	01:25:38
21	prepared to discuss today?	
22	A. I I'm not sure.	
23	Q. Okay. I'll direct your attention to page	
24	5 at No. 11.	
25	A. Okay.	01:25:56
		Page 117

# Case 3:18-md-02843-VC Document 1086-54 Filed 12/12/22 Page 119 of 233 CONFIDENTIAL

1	Q. Okay. And do you see in paragraph 11	01:25:58
2	where it says "As we have explained previously,	
3	Facebook is preserving Exchange, Facebook	
4	Messenger, and Facebook Workplace communications	
5	(which are automatically archived in Proofpoint)."	01:26:16
6	And then "Facebook is preserving	
7	additional data stored through online sources,	
8	including Quip, Dropbox, Workplace Groups, internal	
9	web pages, company Wikis, and O365. Facebook is	
10	also preserving identified data stored on specific	01:26:36
11	individual devices, including laptops, desktops,	
12	mobile devices, and tablets."	
13	Do you see that?	
14	A. Yes.	
15	Q. Were WeChat messages achieved in	01:26:47
16	Proofpoint?	
17	A. WeChat messages are not archived in	
18	Proofpoint.	
19	Q. Are WhatsApp messages archive in	
20	Proofpoint?	01:27:12
21	A. No.	
22	Q. Are they archived anywhere?	
23	A. WhatsApp messages are stored on on a	
24	user's phone. It is up to the custodian to	
25	preserve any any messages that would be relevant	01:27:34
		Page 118

# Case 3:18-md-02843-VC Document 1086-54 Filed 12/12/22 Page 120 of 233 CONFIDENTIAL

1	to the legal hold notice issued to the custodians.	01:27:45
2	Q. Okay.	
3	I'll ask you to turn back to 3	
4	Exhibit 385. And I'm looking at the definition of	
5	"relevant information" again.	01:28:13
6	A. Okay.	
7	Q. And specifically, there's that long list	
8	of items where it begins with "email, Workplace	
9	Chats and Groups."	
10	Do you see that?	01:28:22
11	A. Yes.	
12	Q. I'd like to just go through and give	
13	those kinds of ESI, if you don't mind.	
14	So email, we discussed. That is archived	
15	in Proofpoint; is that right?	01:28:32
16	A. It is, correct.	
17	Q. Workplace Chats and Groups, is that	
18	archived in Proofpoint?	
19	A. Workplace Chats are are archived in	
20	Proofpoint. Groups are not.	01:28:47
21	Q. And what are Groups?	
22	A. I use that sort of Groups example for	
23	Facebook. Similarly Workplace, which is a Meta	
24	product used within the company that is very	
25	similar to Facebook in that you can join groups	01:29:14
		Page 119

# Case 3:18-md-02843-VC Document 1086-54 Filed 12/12/22 Page 121 of 233 CONFIDENTIAL

1	relevant to your work or interests and and	01:29:23
2	that's what Groups are in reference to in this	
3	definition of "relevant information."	
4	Q. Were Groups searched for and preserved in	
5	the collection of ESI related to this litigation?	01:29:47
6	MR. FALCONER: Objection. Form.	
7	THE DEPONENT: Yes. When a custodian	
8	identifies a Workplace Group or Workplace Groups	
9	relevant to a matter, the E-discovery team will	
10	take a snapshot of that Workplace Group and	01:30:17
11	preserve it.	
12	Otherwise, Workplace Groups are not	
13	subject to a retention period. Posts within a	
14	Workplace Group remain unless deleted by a user who	
15	has access to that point.	01:30:49
16	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) And why aren't they	
17	subject to retention?	
18	A. Because	
19	MR. FALCONER: Objection. Form.	
20	But go ahead.	01:30:59
21	THE DEPONENT: There is no retention	
22	period. They will live in perpetuity unless a	
23	person who posts within that group deletes	
24	information within that Workplace Group.	
25	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) Okay. Were OneDrive,	01:31:25
		Page 120

# Case 3:18-md-02843-VC Document 1086-54 Filed 12/12/22 Page 122 of 233 CONFIDENTIAL

1	Dropbox, Axe, SharePoint, and Google Drive all	01:31:32
2	subject to litigation hold in this case?	
3	A. They are data sources that company	
4	personnel uses. These are cloud-based third-party	
5	data sources that are, again, not subject to a	01:32:05
6	retention period, disposition period. Those	
7	documents and within those cloud sources remain	
8	accessible unless unless deleted from from	
9	those data sources.	
10	Q. And the same is true for Quips?	01:32:38
11	A. That's correct.	
12	I do want to say one clarifying thing:	
13	That all all custodians are, you know, told to	
14	preserve any relevant information stored in any	
15	data source, including all of these cloud-based	01:33:03
16	sources. The E-discovery team has the ability to	
17	collect deleted items as well.	
18	Q. And how do they collect deleted items?	
19	A. They would be collected through the admin	
20	tool for these particular cloud sources.	01:33:29
21	Q. And do you mean each cloud source has its	
22	own admin tool?	
23	A. I believe that's correct.	
24	Q. Were any was any deleted ESI collected	
25	in this case?	01:33:48
		Page 121
		ı

# Case 3:18-md-02843-VC Document 1086-54 Filed 12/12/22 Page 123 of 233 CONFIDENTIAL

1	MR. FALCONER: Objection. Beyond the	01:33:52
2	scope of the notice.	
3	Go ahead, Mike.	
4	THE DEPONENT: I'm not aware of any	
5	instance where a custodian indicated that a	01:34:09
6	relevant ESI would have been deleted. So I'm not	
7	sure I can answer that question.	
8	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) And is the reference	
9	here to Facebook messages the same as Facebook	
10	Messenger?	01:34:41
11	A. Yeah, I I believe it's in reference to	
12	Facebook Messenger messages.	
13	Q. And you see a reference here to hard copy	
14	files; is that right?	
15	A. Yes.	01:34:59
16	Q. What does that mean?	
17	A. Paper files, written notes, not	
18	electronic files.	
19	Q. Were hard copy files preserved and	
20	searched for production in this litigation?	01:35:19
21	A. Yes. Our custodians are instructed to	
22	preserve all relevant information, and that	
23	includes hard copy files. If a custodian	
24	identifies that they have hard copy files relevant,	
25	then the E-discovery team would collect and scan	01:35:46
		Page 122

# Case 3:18-md-02843-VC Document 1086-54 Filed 12/12/22 Page 124 of 233 CONFIDENTIAL

1	and preserve those relevant hard copy files.	01:35:51
2	Q. Do you know if Facebook has preserved any	
3	notebooks or notes in hard copy files in response	
4	to this litigation?	
5	A. Can you repeat the question.	01:36:17
6	Q. Do you know if Facebook preserved any	
7	notebooks or notes in hard copy files in connection	
8	with this litigation?	
9	A. I believe so.	
10	Q. And what what do you recall about	01:36:34
11	that?	
12	A. As I mentioned, through the custodian	
13	interview process, if a custodian identifies hard	
14	copy files as something they have and is relevant	
15	to a matter, the E-discovery team would collect and	01:36:58
16	scan those materials.	
17	Q. And I'm asking, I guess, specifically,	
18	are you aware of any specific hard copy documents	
19	that you know were preserved for this case?	
20	A. I believe that we have collected hard	01:37:28
21	copy files. I couldn't tell you the names of the	
22	custodians or what the content of those hard copy	
23	files were, but I do recall that that was that	
24	is that has been a data data source that we	
25	have collected from.	01:37:50
		Page 123

### 

1	Q. Are you aware of whether or not there was	01:37:53
2	a search in 2018 for notebooks maintained by	
3	Mr. Zuckerberg?	
4	A. I don't know that.	
5	Q. Are you aware of it at all?	01:38:07
6	A. No.	
7	Q. Turning back to Exhibit 390.	
8	A. Okay.	
9	Q. Turning to page 7 at No. 7, do you see it	
10	says "the relevant subject matter identified in the	01:39:03
11	litigation holds and any updates thereto"?	
12	Do you see that?	
13	A. I do.	
14	Q. And then do you see the paragraph that	
15	says "Without waiving Facebook's attorney-client	01:39:13
16	privilege, Facebook responds that the litigation	
17	hold notice requires the preservation of documents	
18	potentially relevant to the litigation and	
19	regulatory proceedings stemming from the	
20	Cambridge Analytica events, including Aleksandr	01:39:28
21	Kogan's use of the Facebook Platform and	
22	collaboration with Cambridge Analytica; access to	
23	and potential misuse of Facebook user data by	
24	Cambridge Analytica and other third-party apps;	
25	Facebook's device integration partnerships;	01:39:47
		Page 124

# Case 3:18-md-02843-VC Document 1086-54 Filed 12/12/22 Page 126 of 233 CONFIDENTIAL

1	agreements between Facebook and third parties	01:39:51
2	regarding access to user data; and internal	
3	investigations or audits into alleged misuse of	
4	user data by third parties."	
5	Do you see that?	01:40:04
6	A. Yes.	
7	Q. Do you know if Facebook updated the	
8	relevant subject matter and litigation holds to	
9	include, for example, discussions of exchange of	
10	data with data brokers?	01:40:15
11	MR. FALCONER: So, again, I'm going to	
12	instruct Mr. Duffey not to any question about the	
13	language that was included in any version of the	
14	legal hold on privilege and work product basis.	
15	MS. WEAVER: And to clarify, even though	01:40:28
16	he wrote a letter in 2019 defining what was in the	
17	litigation hold?	
18	SPECIAL MASTER GARRIE: Noted for the	
19	record. We will move forward.	
20	Counsel [sic] Duffey received instruction	01:40:44
21	from counsel. Please advise if you want to respond	
22	accordingly.	
23	MR. FALCONER: So, Mr. Duffey, my	
24	instruction to you is not to answer that question	
25	on work product and privilege grounds.	01:40:58
		Page 125
		I I

# Case 3:18-md-02843-VC Document 1086-54 Filed 12/12/22 Page 127 of 233 CONFIDENTIAL

1	THE DEPONENT: I'll take counsel's	01:41:02
2	instructions.	
3	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) And going back to	
4	Exhibit 386.	
5	Do you see I'm looking back at the	01:41:32
6	sixth issued litigation hold sent on September 3,	
7	2021. And you have a bullet point there that says	
8	"reference ephemeral messaging (do not use it or	
9	take steps to preserve)."	
10	Do you see that?	01:41:45
11	A. Yes.	
12	Q. Do you know whether WhatsApp added	
13	ephemeral messages as an optional feature in	
14	November of 2020?	
15	MR. FALCONER: Objection. Beyond the	01:42:00
16	scope of the notice.	
17	THE DEPONENT: I do not know that.	
18	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) Do you know if anyone	
19	subject to the litigation hold in this case used	
20	ephemeral messaging on WhatsApp during the pendency	01:42:10
21	of this case?	
22	MR. FALCONER: Objection. Beyond the	
23	scope.	
24	THE DEPONENT: Other than my earlier	
25	testimony, I'm I'm not aware of any custodians	01:42:38
		Page 126

# Case 3:18-md-02843-VC Document 1086-54 Filed 12/12/22 Page 128 of 233 CONFIDENTIAL

1	using ephemeral messaging.	01:42:43
2	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) Okay.	
3	Did Facebook send litigation holds or	
4	preservation letters to any third parties relating	
5	to this case?	01:42:55
6	A. I don't know.	
7	Q. Do you know if Facebook sent preservation	
8	letters to FTI or Stroz?	
9	MR. FALCONER: I'm going to object to	
10	that as beyond the scope of the notice.	01:43:24
11	THE DEPONENT: Can you can you repeat	
12	the question.	
13	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) Yes. No problem.	
14	Did Facebook send preservation letters to	
15	FTI Consulting or Stroz?	01:43:39
16	MR. FALCONER: Same objection.	
17	THE DEPONENT: Yes, I believe so. The	
18	the individuals from either FTI or Stroz who had	
19	an who had an FB.com email address received	
20	litigation holds, preservation notices.	01:44:27
21	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) And did anyone from PwC	
22	or EY also receive preservation notices in	
23	connection with this litigation?	
24	A. I don't know.	
25	Q. Do you know if members of the ADI	01:44:56
		Page 127

# Case 3:18-md-02843-VC Document 1086-54 Filed 12/12/22 Page 129 of 233 CONFIDENTIAL

1		
	custodian list created by Facebook received the	01:44:59
2	litigation hold in this case?	
3	MR. FALCONER: Objection. Form.	
4	But you can go ahead, Mike.	
5	THE DEPONENT: Do you mind repeating the	01:45:17
6	question, please.	
7	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) Are you aware of a group	
8	of custodians being identified by Facebook as "EDI	
9	custodians"?	
10	MR. FALCONER: Objection. Form.	01:45:26
11	THE DEPONENT: I know I know there is	
12	a legal hold notice called "the app developer	
13	investigation."	
14	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) And do you know when the	
15	legal hold notice was sent to EDI custodians in	01:45:45
16	this case?	
17	MR. FALCONER: Objection. Form.	
18	But go ahead, Mike.	
19	THE DEPONENT: I I I couldn't	
20	answer when EDI custodians would have received the	01:46:00
21	Cambridge Analytica litigation hold notice.	
22	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) Thank you. I apologize	
23	for interrupting.	
24	Do you know whether they received the	
25	first litigation hold letter, or was it later in	01:46:16
		Page 128

# Case 3:18-md-02843-VC Document 1086-54 Filed 12/12/22 Page 130 of 233 CONFIDENTIAL

1	time?	01:46:20
2	A. I don't know.	
3	Q. Do you know who would know?	
4	A. We have a reporting mechanism within the	
5	Legal Hold Pro tool that would show generate a	01:46:37
6	list of legal hold custodians and when they first	
7	received the preservation notice.	
8	MS. WEAVER: Okay. Thank you. Let's	
9	We're going to mark as Exhibit 391.	
10	(Exhibit 391 was marked for	01:47:05
11	identification by the court reporter and is	
12	attached hereto.)	
13	MS. WEAVER: This will be tab 32,	
14	Mr. Samra. This is a document bearing Bates	
15	numbers ADVANCE-META -504 through -509.	01:47:11
16	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) And when it's up, if you	
17	could just tell me what it is, that would be	
18	helpful.	
19	A. It still hasn't arrived.	
20	Q. I have	01:48:29
21	A. I just got it.	
22	Is it Exhibit 391?	
23	Q. Exactly, yes.	
24	A. This is US privacy program records	
25	management policy.	01:48:40
		Page 129

# Case 3:18-md-02843-VC Document 1086-54 Filed 12/12/22 Page 131 of 233 CONFIDENTIAL

1	Q. And when did it first take effect?	01:48:42
2	A. April 20, 2021.	
3	Q. And was there such a policy prior to that	
4	time?	
5	A. I'm not aware of a prior version of the	01:49:16
6	US privacy program records management policy.	
7	Q. And was there an informal policy that	
8	addressed the issues covered in the US privacy	
9	program records management policy prior to the time	
10	that when Exhibit 32 was implemented?	01:49:32
11	MR. FALCONER: Objection. Beyond the	
12	scope.	
13	THE DEPONENT: I'm aware of the the	
14	existence of a US privacy program prior to this	
15	policy going into effect, but I'm not aware of	01:49:52
16	of a written formal policy that existed prior to	
17	this.	
18	(Exhibit 392 was marked for	
19	identification by the court reporter and is	
20	attached hereto.)	01:50:00
21	MS. WEAVER: And now we're marking	
22	Exhibit 392, which for the record is	
23	ADVANCE-META -516 through -531.	
24	THE DEPONENT: I have it now.	
25	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) And what is Exhibit 392?	01:50:40
		Page 130
		I I

# Case 3:18-md-02843-VC Document 1086-54 Filed 12/12/22 Page 132 of 233 CONFIDENTIAL

1	A. Exhibit 392 is the US privacy program	01:50:45
2	records retention schedule.	
3	Q. And when did it first take effect?	
4	A. April 20th, 2021.	
5	Q. And prior to April 20th, 2021, was there	01:51:13
6	a records retention schedule similar to the one	
7	reflected in Exhibit 392?	
8	MR. FALCONER: Objection. Form.	
9	THE DEPONENT: I don't believe so.	
10	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) And so do you see in the	01:51:42
11	first paragraph it says, in the second sentence,	
12	"The records that the US privacy program must	
13	retain are audit records and reports, consumer	
14	inquiry and response records, contracts/agreements	
15	and third-party assessment records, data subject	01:52:01
16	requests, government relations and policy records,	
17	incident and investigation records (permanent),	
18	incident and investigation records (temporary),	
19	policies and procedures, privacy program operations	
20	records, privacy review and decision records, risk	01:52:20
21	assessments and remediation and response records,	
22	training records, user consent records, and user	
23	privacy communications and statements external"?	
24	Do you see that?	
25	A. I do.	01:52:37
		Page 131

# Case 3:18-md-02843-VC Document 1086-54 Filed 12/12/22 Page 133 of 233 CONFIDENTIAL

1		
1	Q. And so this paragraph reflects that as of	01:52:37
2	April 20th, 2021, Facebook required that the	
3	company retain those records that I just read into	
4	the record, correct?	
5	A. Yes, under the retention schedule that is	01:53:05
6	laid out throughout the document.	
7	Q. So prior to the time that Exhibit 392	
8	took effect, what was the retention schedule for	
9	consumer inquiry and response records?	
10	MR. FALCONER: Objection. Form.	01:53:24
11	THE DEPONENT: I'm not aware of of a,	
12	you know, similar retention schedule that preceded	
13	this document, so I I don't know the answer to	
14	the question.	
15	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) Do you see a reference	01:54:03
16	to "user consent records"?	
17	A. I do.	
18	Q. What what does that mean?	
19	A. "User consent records are records related	
20	to user consents, preferences, and settings	01:54:48
21	specific to legal, regulatory obligations, which	
22	constitutes user consent, preference, and setting	
23	records responsive to the FTC order."	
24	Q. And are you reading from the record	
25	series description at page 529?	01:55:06
		Page 132

# Case 3:18-md-02843-VC Document 1086-54 Filed 12/12/22 Page 134 of 233 CONFIDENTIAL

1	A. I am.	01:55:11
2	Q. Prior to the time that Exhibit 392 took	
3	effect in April 20th, 2021, did Facebook preserve	
4	those records that you just described?	
5	MR. FALCONER: Objection. Form.	01:55:24
6	THE DEPONENT: If they were the subject	
7	of legal or regulatory obligations or the subject	
8	of legal hold, they would have been preserved. I'm	
9	not aware of a a prior retention disposition	
10	schedule for these types of records.	01:56:02
11	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) And do you know for this	
12	case whether these records were preserved?	
13	MR. FALCONER: Objection. Form.	
14	But go ahead, Mike.	
15	THE DEPONENT: I don't know.	01:56:26
16	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) Who would know?	
17	A. I think that would be like an an	
18	inquiry that would be conducted between our	
19	in-house and outside counsel and the E-discovery	
20	team and any custodians working on these types of	01:56:59
21	records.	
22	Q. And with regard to these records, where	
23	it says "user consent," does that mean every	
24	Facebook user?	
25	A. I'd I'd want to look at the file plan	01:57:31
		Page 133

# Case 3:18-md-02843-VC Document 1086-54 Filed 12/12/22 Page 135 of 233 CONFIDENTIAL

1	associated with the US privacy program records	01:57:35
2	management policy to confirm that. I don't know	
3	the answer.	
4	Q. What is a file plan?	
5	A. That is a spreadsheet that is part of the	01:57:58
6	US privacy program records management policy.	
7	It's	
8	MS. WEAVER: Josh	
9	That's fine. I think we have.	
10	Josh, can you mark, please, tabs 37 and	01:58:18
11	38.	
12	(Exhibit 393 was marked for	
13	identification by the court reporter and is	
14	attached hereto.)	
15	(Exhibit 394 was marked for	01:58:22
16	identification by the court reporter and is	
17	attached hereto.)	
18	MS. WEAVER: These, for the record, will	
19	be Exhibits 392 and 393. Exhibit 392 bears the	
20	words "US privacy program records retention	01:58:53
21	schedule" and bears Bates numbers ADVANCE-META -555	
22	through -568.	
23	And Exhibit 393 is a spreadsheet that	
24	says "Meta US privacy program records file plan"	
25	bearing Bates number -569 to -577.	01:59:12
		Page 134

# Case 3:18-md-02843-VC Document 1086-54 Filed 12/12/22 Page 136 of 233 CONFIDENTIAL

1	THE DEPONENT: I'm not sure can we	01:59:26
2	read that back? Because I'm not mapping to the	
3	exhibit number and the Bates numbers that you	
4	just	
5	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) Oh yeah, Mr. Duffey.	01:59:31
6	I'm marking two new exhibits for you to look at.	
7	I'm sorry for being unclear. So they're going to	
8	load, and you're looking at Exhibit 391, I think,	
9	but Exhibits	
10	A. I'm sorry. I was looking I think you	01:59:44
11	already marked 392	
12	MR. FALCONER: Yeah.	
13	THE DEPONENT: as the schedule as	
14	the schedule plan.	
15	MS. WEAVER: I see. And it will be 393	01:59:52
16	and 394. I apologize.	
17	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) And 393, I believe, is	
18	up.	
19	A. Oh, I'm loading it's uploading right	
20	now.	02:00:20
21	Q. And so the first I want to comment on	
22	what those exhibits are, and then we'll return to	
23	the question of the records relating to user	
24	consents.	
25	Do you have Exhibit 393?	02:00:48
		Page 135

### 

1	A. I have it, but I'm still a little	02:00:50
2	confused, because I think 392 and 393 are the same	
3	document.	
4	Q. I see. And then when you see 394, you'll	
5	see that the spreadsheet attached bears a	02:01:08
6	consecutive Bates number.	
7	Well, you know what, Mr. Duffey? This is	
8	your expertise.	
9	Exhibit 392 didn't have a corresponding	
10	spreadsheet in the production that you gave us, and	02:01:20
11	so I'm trying to copy or mark for the record the	
12	version of the privacy program records retention	
13	schedule that was followed immediately by a	
14	spreadsheet. And maybe you can	
15	A. I see.	02:01:31
16	Q authenticate that one. Right.	
17	A. Okay.	
18	Q. So Exhibit 394 is up.	
19	A. I see it.	
20	Q. Okay. And then let me just go back to	02:01:45
21	Exhibit 393 and ask you: What is Exhibit 393?	
22	A. Okay. Just a moment.	
23	3 Exhibit 393 is the US privacy	
24	program records retention schedule.	
25	Q. And what is Exhibit 394?	02:02:21
		Page 136

# Case 3:18-md-02843-VC Document 1086-54 Filed 12/12/22 Page 138 of 233 CONFIDENTIAL

1	A. Exhibit 394 is the US privacy program	02:02:49
2	records file plan.	
3	Q. And is this the document that you were	
4	testifying you would need to seek to answer the	
5	question about what records relating to user	02:03:00
6	consents constitute?	
7	A. That's correct.	
8	Q. And if I direct your attention to the	
9	page ending in Bates number -576 on the lower	
10	left-hand corner, do you see where it says "user	02:03:16
11	consent records"?	
12	A. Yes.	
13	Q. So the question is: Do these user	
14	consent records relate to every Facebook user?	
15	While you're reading, I'll read into the	02:04:16
16	record that in the fourth column in that row, it	
17	reads: "Records relating to Meta's attempt to	
18	obtain the consent of users referred to in part 2	
19	of the order titled Changes to Sharing of Covered	
20	Information, which constitutes a copy of each	02:04:33
21	relevant screenshot/screen cast of user consent	
22	statements, consent flows, and privacy settings, a	
23	copy of each relevant record sufficient to show	
24	each user's consent in a part 3 scenario and a copy	
25	of each relevant report sufficient to demonstrate	02:04:51
		Page 137

# Case 3:18-md-02843-VC Document 1086-54 Filed 12/12/22 Page 139 of 233 CONFIDENTIAL

1	on an aggregate basis the number of users for whom	02:04:54
2	each such privacy setting was in effect at any time	
3	Meta has attempted to obtain or has been required	
4	to obtain such consent in a" I think it says	
5	"part 2 scenario."	02:05:08
6	Do you see that?	
7	A. I do see it.	
8	Q. Prior to the time well, strike that.	
9	When did Exhibits 393 and 394 take	
10	effect?	02:05:22
11	A. I don't know when Exhibit 394 went into	
12	effect. Exhibit 393 is is loading now. And I	
13	believe it went into effect on April 20th yes,	
14	April 20th, 2021.	
15	Q. And Exhibit 394, is that an explication,	02:06:16
16	if you will, of the kinds of documents identified	
17	in Exhibit 393?	
18	A. I don't know if I understand what that	
19	that word is.	
20	Q. It means	02:06:32
21	A. Sorry.	
22	Q explanation, I guess. Right?	
23	Let me ask the question again.	
24	Is Exhibit 394 a part of Exhibit 393?	
25	A. It's it's they all 393 and 394	02:06:53
		Page 138
		The state of the s

# Case 3:18-md-02843-VC Document 1086-54 Filed 12/12/22 Page 140 of 233 CONFIDENTIAL

1	are part you know, part of the US privacy	02:06:56
2	program records management policy. I would	
3	consider them separate documents, but the file plan	
4	provides additional information including the	
5	you know, the record class, records category,	02:07:23
6	approved repository, and maybe maybe some	
7	additional columns that are not referenced in in	
8	the retention schedule.	
9	Q. And with regard to the records described	
10	in the cell that I just read into the record about	02:07:50
11	user consents, prior of April of 2021, did Facebook	
12	maintain such records?	
13	A. I don't know.	
14	Q. Did Facebook preserve the documents	
15	described in that cell for purposes of this	02:08:20
16	litigation?	
17	A. I don't know.	
18	Q. Who would know?	
19	A. I can't name a specific individual, but I	
20	would I would suggest that that going to	02:09:17
21	somebody working on the, you know, US privacy	
22	program or somebody within the privacy team.	
23	Q. And can you name anybody by name who is	
24	on that team or involved with that program?	
25	A. I can't. But somebody on on our	02:09:54
		Page 139

# Case 3:18-md-02843-VC Document 1086-54 Filed 12/12/22 Page 141 of 233 CONFIDENTIAL

1	information governance team could.	02:10:02
2	Q. And who	
3	A. I would imagine.	
4	Q. Sorry.	
5	And who on your information governance	02:10:09
6	team by name might be able to let us know how to	
7	find out if those documents relating to user	
8	consents were preserved or collected prior to	
9	April 21st, 2021?	
10	A. Two people come to mind. One would be	02:10:32
11	Yodi, Y-O-D-I, Hailemariam, H-A-I-L-E-M-A-R-I-A-M.	
12	And Daniel Proko, D-A-N-I-E-L P-R-O-K-O.	
13	Q. Mr. Hailemariam is identified on Exhibit	
14	386, correct?	
15	A. Yes. Yodi is a woman	02:11:06
16	Q. I'm sorry.	
17	A but that's correct.	
18	Q. My apologies.	
19	A. No, it's fine. I just wanted to clarify.	
20	Q. That's nice.	02:11:15
21	You spoke with Yodi in preparation for	
22	your deposition; is that correct?	
23	A. I did speak with her, yes.	
24	Q. And the second person you identified, is	
25	that person also listed in your notes?	02:11:27
		Page 140

# Case 3:18-md-02843-VC Document 1086-54 Filed 12/12/22 Page 142 of 233 CONFIDENTIAL

1	A. No.	02:11:32
2	Q. And did you speak with that person to	
3	prepare for your deposition today?	
4	A. No.	
5	Q. Looking a little further ahead and	02:11:46
6	turning back to Exhibit 394, there's a category of	
7	documents called "User Privacy Communications and	
8	Statements."	
9	Do you see that?	
10	That's at Bates number ending at -577.	02:11:56
11	A. Yes, I see it.	
12	Q. And do you see in the fifth column it	
13	describes those as "records of external statements	
14	made by Meta that describe the extent to which Meta	
15	maintains and protects the privacy, security, and	02:12:25
16	confidentiality of any covered information	
17	according to the FTC order, including but not	
18	limited to any statement related to a change in any	
19	website or service controlled by Meta that relates	
20	to the privacy of such information along with all	02:12:42
21	materials relied upon in making such" and then	
22	it looks like it's an incomplete sentence.	
23	Do you see that?	
24	A. I do.	
25	Q. Do you know if prior to April 2021	02:12:54
		Page 141

# Case 3:18-md-02843-VC Document 1086-54 Filed 12/12/22 Page 143 of 233 CONFIDENTIAL

1	Facebook maintained these kind of records?	02:12:59
2	MR. FALCONER: Objection. Beyond the	
3	scope of the notice.	
4	THE DEPONENT: I I don't know.	
5	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) Do you know who would?	02:13:42
6	A. I would I would start with Yodi and	
7	Daniel.	
8	Q. Okay. Thank you.	
9	I'll ask you to look now at what we're	
10	marking as Exhibit 395.	02:13:56
11	(Exhibit 395 was marked for	
12	identification by the court reporter and is	
13	attached hereto.)	
14	MS. WEAVER: That's tab 39. That bears	
15	Bates number ADVANCE-META -578 through -585.	02:14:03
16	And for the record, it bears the words	
17	"FTC order records management policy."	
18	THE DEPONENT: I have it up.	
19	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) What is Exhibit 395?	
20	A. It is the FTC order records management	02:14:38
21	policy that went into effect April 28th, 2020.	
22	Q. And did you review it in preparing for	
23	your deposition today?	
24	A. I did review it, yes.	
25	Q. And to what issue did you find it	02:14:57
		Page 142

# Case 3:18-md-02843-VC Document 1086-54 Filed 12/12/22 Page 144 of 233 CONFIDENTIAL

1	relevant to prepare for your deposition today?	02:15:02
2	MR. FALCONER: Objection. Beyond the	
3	scope of the notice.	
4	And, Mike or excuse me Mr. Duffey,	
5	don't reveal the contents of any conversations you	02:15:16
6	had with counsel in the course of giving an answer.	
7	If the only thing that you know about that question	
8	is something you learned from counsel, I would	
9	instruct you not to answer the question.	
10	THE DEPONENT: I'll follow my counsel's	02:15:35
11	instruction.	
12	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) Do you have an	
13	understanding as to what Exhibit 395 is?	
14	A. Yes. This is the policy that was put in	
15	place in compliance to the FTC's order that went	02:15:51
16	into effect on April 28th, 2020.	
17	Q. And turning to the second page.	
18	Do you see a definition there called	
19	"covered information"?	
20	A. Yes.	02:16:21
21	Q. And is it your understanding that under	
22	this order there is a records retention schedule	
23	that addresses whether covered information is	
24	retained by Facebook?	
25	A. I'm not sure I understood the question.	02:16:52
		Page 143

# Case 3:18-md-02843-VC Document 1086-54 Filed 12/12/22 Page 145 of 233 CONFIDENTIAL

1	Q. What is the purpose of the policy with	02:16:55
2	regard to covered information?	
3	MR. FALCONER: Objection. Form.	
4	Go ahead, Mike.	
5	THE DEPONENT: I would I would have to	02:17:11
6	refer to the policy itself. The covered	
7	information looks to be, you know, referenced in	
8	in multiple places on this records management	
9	policy.	
10	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) So there's a definition	02:17:49
11	for "covered information."	
12	Do you see that?	
13	A. I do.	
14	Q. And a definition for "covered third	
15	party."	02:17:55
16	Do you see that?	
17	A. Yes.	
18	Q. And the definition for "covered	
19	information" includes "information from or about an	
20	individual consumer, including but not limited to	02:18:03
21	first or last name; geolocation information	
22	sufficient to identify a street name and name of	
23	city or town; email address or other online contact	
24	information, such as instant messaging identifier	
25	or screen name; mobile or other telephone number;	02:18:21
		Page 144

# Case 3:18-md-02843-VC Document 1086-54 Filed 12/12/22 Page 146 of 233 CONFIDENTIAL

1	photos and videos; IP address, user ID, or other	02:18:24
2	persistent identifier that can be used to	
3	recognized a user over time and across different	
4	device, websites, or online services; social	
5	security number, driver's license, or other	02:18:39
6	government-issued identification number; financial	
7	account number; credit or debit information; date	
8	of birth, biometric information, any information	
9	combined with any of the above or nonpublic user	
10	information."	02:18:53
11	Do you see that?	
12	A. Yes, I do.	
13	Q. Excluding nonpublic user information, is	
14	it does Facebook understand covered information	
15	to be personal information?	02:19:04
16	MR. FALCONER: Objection. Form and	
17	beyond the scope of the notice.	
18	Go ahead, Mike.	
19	THE DEPONENT: I've seen some of these	
20	descriptions in the covered information definition	02:19:46
21	used to define personal information.	
22	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) What is Facebook's	
23	understanding of what personal information is?	
24	MR. FALCONER: Objection. Beyond the	
25	scope of the notice.	02:20:06
		Page 145

# Case 3:18-md-02843-VC Document 1086-54 Filed 12/12/22 Page 147 of 233 CONFIDENTIAL

1	THE DEPONENT: I would I would define	02:20:39
2	"personal information" as information that you	
3	could use to identify a specific person, like an	
4	email address or phone number, social security	
5	information, bank information, driver's license,	02:21:00
6	and, you know, govern government-issued	
7	identification number. Also credit card	
8	information.	
9	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) Looking at definition	
10	9 in Exhibit 384, which is the deposition notice.	02:21:15
11	Do you see that it defines "personal	
12	information" in the notice?	
13	You have to go back to the very first	
14	exhibit that we marked today, Mr. Duffey.	
15	A. Okay. I see it.	02:21:38
16	Q. Is the definition of "personal	
17	information" set forth in definition	
18	No. 9 consistent with your understanding of what	
19	Facebook's understanding personal information is?	
20	MR. FALCONER: Objection. Beyond the	02:22:02
21	scope of the notice.	
22	MS. WEAVER: It's literally in the	
23	notice, Russ.	
24	THE DEPONENT: The definition in the	
25	30(b)(6) notice seems to be a fair and accurate	02:22:23
		Page 146

# Case 3:18-md-02843-VC Document 1086-54 Filed 12/12/22 Page 148 of 233 CONFIDENTIAL

1	definition of what personal information is.	02:22:33
2	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) And going back to	
3	Exhibit 395.	
4	A. Okay.	
5	Q. Do you see there's a definition there for	02:22:48
6	"nonpublic user information"?	
7	A. I see.	
8	Q. Do you see it's defined as "any user	
9	profile information (i.e., information that a user	
10	adds to or is listed on a user's Facebook profile),	02:23:10
11	or user-generated content (e.g., status updates,	
12	photos) that is restricted by one or more privacy	
13	settings."	
14	Do you see that?	
15	A. Yes.	02:23:25
16	Q. Is that Facebook's understanding of what	
17	nonpublic user information is?	
18	MR. FALCONER: Objection. Form.	
19	Go ahead, Mike.	
20	THE DEPONENT: Yes.	02:23:40
21	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) And then turning to the	
22	page ending at -581.	
23	Do you see where it says "scope of FTCO	
24	records"?	
25	A. Yes.	02:24:01
		Page 147

# Case 3:18-md-02843-VC Document 1086-54 Filed 12/12/22 Page 149 of 233 CONFIDENTIAL

1	Q. And is this describing categories of	02:24:01
2	records which must be created and retained by	
3	Facebook or Meta?	
4	A. These are the the scope of records	
5	that must be created and maintained and retained	02:24:17
6	for a certain period of time as part of the FTC's	
7	order that went into effect on on April 28th,	
8	2020.	
9	Q. And there's a reference below to "covered	
10	third party," correct?	02:24:44
11	A. In section B?	
12	Q. Yes.	
13	A. Yes, I see it.	
14	Q. And "covered third party" is defined	
15	earlier at page ending -579 as "any individual or	02:25:04
16	entity that uses or receives covered information	
17	obtained by or on behalf of Facebook outside of a	
18	user-initiated transfer of covered information,"	
19	and then it lists a few exceptions.	
20	Do you see that?	02:25:26
21	A. I do.	
22	Q. Is that Facebook's definition of a	
23	covered third party?	
24	MR. FALCONER: Objection. Form and	
25	beyond the scope of the notice.	02:25:33
		Page 148

# Case 3:18-md-02843-VC Document 1086-54 Filed 12/12/22 Page 150 of 233 CONFIDENTIAL

1	Go ahead, Mike.	02:25:35
2	THE DEPONENT: Yes, this is Facebook's	
3	definition of a covered third party.	
4	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) And so going back to the	
5	page ending at -581, is Meta currently required to	02:25:43
6	retain documents sufficient to identify the types	
7	of covered information that Facebook provides or	
8	makes available to any covered third party, subject	
9	to the requirements set forth there?	
10	MR. FALCONER: Objection. Form.	02:26:09
11	Go ahead, Mike.	
12	THE DEPONENT: Yes, I believe so. I	
13	would want to review there's also a schedule	
14	plan and a file plan attached to to this policy	
15	as well that further provides information about the	02:26:34
16	types of records that would be covered by the	
17	section that you just went by went off of the	
18	documents sufficient to identify the types of	
19	covered information that Facebook provides to any	
20	covered third party.	02:27:03
21	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) And for all of the kinds	
22	of documents listed here in subtopics A through G,	
23	which describes the scope of the FTCO records, is	
24	Meta complying with retention requirements?	
25	A. Yes, I believe so.	02:27:25
		Page 149

# Case 3:18-md-02843-VC Document 1086-54 Filed 12/12/22 Page 151 of 233 CONFIDENTIAL

1	MR. FALCONER: We've been going a little	02:27:28
2	more than an hour. When you get to a stepping	
3	point	
4	MS. WEAVER: I'd just like to finish	
5	this	02:27:34
6	MR. FALCONER: Yeah, you're fine.	
7	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) Would it be possible for	
8	Meta to produce these retained documents in this	
9	litigation without any technical difficulty?	
10	MR. FALCONER: Objection. Beyond the	02:27:45
11	scope of the notice.	
12	THE DEPONENT: There are there are a	
13	number of approved repositories that are listed in	
14	the FTC or records management file plan. I	
15	can't speak to the effort that would be needed to	02:28:08
16	collect all records.	
17	So I don't know that I can that I can	
18	answer that specific question.	
19	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) Prior to April 2021, did	
20	Facebook preserve documents of the type described	02:28:33
21	in subcategory B?	
22	MR. FALCONER: Objection. Form.	
23	Go ahead.	
24	MS. WEAVER: Oh, I misspoke.	
25	THE DEPONENT: I don't know.	02:29:04
		Page 150

# Case 3:18-md-02843-VC Document 1086-54 Filed 12/12/22 Page 152 of 233 CONFIDENTIAL

1	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) Prior to April 2020, did	02:29:04
2	Facebook preserve documents of the type described	
3	in subcategory B?	
4	MR. FALCONER: Same objection.	
5	THE DEPONENT: I don't know the answer.	02:29:27
6	MS. WEAVER: Okay. We can take a break	
7	now.	
8	THE VIDEOGRAPHER: Okay. Now we're off	
9	the record. It's 2:29 p.m.	
10	(Recess taken.)	02:29:34
11	THE VIDEOGRAPHER: Okay. We're back on	
12	the record. It's 2:43 p.m.	
13	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) Mr. Duffey, for	
14	custodians who received the litigation hold letter	
15	relating to this case, did Facebook preserve their	02:43:25
16	devices as well?	
17	A. Any data stored on a device in use by a	
18	custodian, that data is you know, custodians are	
19	instructed to preserve any data stored on either	
20	on a device potentially relevant to a matter. We	02:44:02
21	have a policy, legal hold policy, where if a device	
22	is being replaced, that device is preserved. The	
23	same is true for departing employees on legal hold	
24	as well.	
25	Q. And when you say the device is preserved,	02:44:38
		Page 151

# Case 3:18-md-02843-VC Document 1086-54 Filed 12/12/22 Page 153 of 233 CONFIDENTIAL

1	what do you mean? Do you mean a physical device is	02:44:40
2	preserved, or is there a forensic image, or how it	
3	is preserved?	
4	A. The physical device is preserved.	
5	Q. Ensuring that the litigation hold was	02:45:01
6	complied with in this case, did Facebook ask	
7	custodians if they used text to communicate?	
8	A. Yes.	
9	Q. And did Facebook preserve texts for the	
10	custodians identified for this case?	02:45:30
11	A. Any text messages that are deemed	
12	potentially relevant by the custodian, the	
13	custodian is obligated to preserve those text	
14	messages. When we conduct custodian interviews and	
15	text messages are identified, the E-discovery team	02:46:01
16	will collect those text messages.	
17	Q. Does that include texts on phones and	
18	tablets and any other devices?	
19	A. It would cover any devices, yes.	
20	Q. Does Facebook provide devices or did	02:46:22
21	Facebook provide devices to any of the custodians	
22	related to this litigation?	
23	MR. FALCONER: Object to that	
24	THE DEPONENT: Yes.	
25	MR. FALCONER: as beyond the scope.	02:46:42
		Page 152

# Case 3:18-md-02843-VC Document 1086-54 Filed 12/12/22 Page 154 of 233 CONFIDENTIAL

1	But go ahead and answer the best you can.	02:46:45
2	THE DEPONENT: Yes.	
3	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) And what devices are	
4	those?	
5	MR. FALCONER: Same objections.	02:47:00
б	THE DEPONENT: Typically Facebook will	
7	provide a laptop and a phone. Through the course	
8	of my work, I have experienced some custodians	
9	using a desktop computer or a tablet.	
		02.47.20
10	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) And were all such	02:47:30
11	devices searched and had responsive data preserved	
12	for this litigation?	
13	MR. FALCONER: Objection. Form.	
14	THE DEPONENT: Again, the custodian is	
15	obligated to preserve all relevant information,	02:47:51
16	potentially relevant information, related to a	
17	matter, no matter where it's stored. If a	
18	custodian identifies relevant data on a device, the	
19	E-discovery team will collect from those devices,	
20	yes.	02:48:12
21	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) Are you aware of any	
22	failures of any custodian related to this	
23	litigation to preserve relevant information?	
24	A. I'm not.	
25	Q. Okay. Are you aware of whether Facebook	02:48:25
		Page 153

# Case 3:18-md-02843-VC Document 1086-54 Filed 12/12/22 Page 155 of 233 CONFIDENTIAL

1	preserved account level privacy settings for the	02:48:43
2	named plaintiffs' accounts in this case?	
3	A. We discussed this morning the snapshots	
4	that Facebook undertook to preserve account	
5	information through Switchboard and DYI. I believe	02:49:09
6	there are privacy settings captured in Switchboard,	
7	so I believe my answer would be would be yes.	
8	Q. And those privacy settings also	
9	maintained in Hive or TAO?	
10	MR. FALCONER: Objection. Beyond the	02:49:50
11	scope of the notice.	
12	But go ahead, Mike.	
13	THE DEPONENT: I'm not sure.	
14	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) Did Facebook preserve	
15	account level privacy settings for the named	02:50:04
16	plaintiffs' accounts prior to 2020?	
17	A. I'm not sure if historical privacy	
18	settings are captured in either the DYI or	
19	Switchboard snapshot. I also am not sure whether	
20	or not account level privacy settings have been	02:50:53
21	preserved within the 137 Hive tables that we have	
22	on legal hold.	
23	Long answer is you know, short answer	
24	is I I don't know.	
25	Q. And are you familiar with the phrase "set	02:51:14
		Page 154

# Case 3:18-md-02843-VC Document 1086-54 Filed 12/12/22 Page 156 of 233 CONFIDENTIAL

1	permissions"?	02:51:16
2	A. No.	
3	Q. Do you know whether account level	
4	permission settings on posts have been preserved	
5	prior to 2020 for the named plaintiffs?	02:51:31
6	A. I don't know.	
7	Q. Are you familiar with what an identifier	
8	is?	
9	MR. FALCONER: Objection. Form.	
10	THE DEPONENT: I've heard of the term	02:52:15
11	used. If if you could give me some context	
12	about	
13	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) Yes.	
14	A what you mean by "identifier."	
15	Q. Well, it's really what Facebook means	02:52:23
16	that I'm worried about. But fair enough. It's not	
17	a great question.	
18	You're familiar with the Facebook user	
19	ID, correct?	
20	A. Yes.	02:52:33
21	Q. And are you familiar with the replacement	
22	ID?	
23	A. I'm familiar with it, yes.	
24	Q. And are you familiar with other	
25	identifiers such as the ASID or ADID that can be	02:52:46
		Page 155

# Case 3:18-md-02843-VC Document 1086-54 Filed 12/12/22 Page 157 of 233 CONFIDENTIAL

1	associated with users?	02:52:50
2	A. No.	
3	Q. Do you know if Facebook took any steps to	
4	preserve identifiers associated with the named	
5	plaintiffs in this case?	02:53:00
6	A. If if that information is part of the	
7	137 Hive tables that we have placed on legal hold,	
8	then then the answer would be yes.	
9	Q. Are you familiar with what a cookie is?	
10	A. Yes.	02:53:31
11	Q. Did Facebook preserve cookies that are	
12	associated with the named plaintiffs in this case,	
13	including the full name of datr cookies, for	
14	example?	
15	A. I'm not sure if that information is	02:53:55
16	captured in a Switchboard or DYI snapshot or if it	
17	was if it is information that we are preserving	
18	as part of the, you know, Hive tables that we have	
19	on legal hold for this matter. If that information	
20	is contained with within any of those snapshots	02:54:13
21	or tables that are being preserved, then yes, we	
22	would have.	
23	Q. You're aware that hashed versions of the	
24	datr cookie values are contained, or at least some	
25	of them, in the DYI files; is that true?	02:54:32
		Page 156

# Case 3:18-md-02843-VC Document 1086-54 Filed 12/12/22 Page 158 of 233 CONFIDENTIAL

1	MR. FALCONER: Objection.	02:54:37
2	THE DEPONENT: I don't know.	
3	MR. FALCONER: Beyond the scope.	
4	THE DEPONENT: I don't know.	
5	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) Okay.	02:54:46
6	For the named plaintiffs who are active	
7	on Facebook, are there objects and associations	
8	that were once in TAO but are no longer there?	
9	A. Can you repeat the question, please.	
10	Q. Yes.	02:55:15
11	For the named plaintiffs who are still	
12	active on Facebook, are there objects and	
13	associations that were once in TAO but are no	
14	longer there?	
15	A. Yes, potentially. TAO is part of our	02:55:33
16	production system, and it's a live system.	
17	Facebook does not have a tool that prevents user	
18	from interacting with the product. An example of	
19	object in association that may no longer be	
20	available through a snapshot would be something	02:56:05
21	that was deleted by the user or, in the instance of	
22	an interaction, by the user's friends.	
23	Q. What has Facebook done to maintain the	
24	objects and associations since the onset of this	
25	litigation?	02:56:31
		Page 157

# Case 3:18-md-02843-VC Document 1086-54 Filed 12/12/22 Page 159 of 233 CONFIDENTIAL

1	A. We've taken snapshots in the Switchboard	02:56:45
2	tool and the DYI tool for for each of the named	
3	plaintiffs that had data available at the time of	
4	the snapshot.	
5	Q. Does Switchboard also record	02:57:02
6	named plaintiffs?	
7	A. I don't know.	
8	Q. Has Facebook taken any steps to identify	
9	and preserve data relating to the named plaintiffs	
10	that Facebook received from third parties?	02:57:44
11	A. If that data is part of the data	
12	contained within the 137 Hive tables that we are	
13	preserving, then the answer is yes.	
14	Q. Do you know if the 137 tables includes	
15	data received from companies like data brokers such	02:58:17
16	as Acxiom?	
17	A. I don't know the answer to that. That	
18	analysis would would be required from somebody	
19	on our E-discovery data science team.	
20	Q. Has Facebook taken any steps to preserve	02:58:39
21	information sufficient to show if any data relating	
22	to the named plaintiffs has been sent to third	
23	parties for academic research?	
24	A. I don't know. That would be another	
25	answer the same answer where our our	02:59:05
		Page 158

# Case 3:18-md-02843-VC Document 1086-54 Filed 12/12/22 Page 160 of 233 CONFIDENTIAL

1	E-discovery data science team would have to do that	02:59:09
2	analysis within the preserved Hive tables.	
3	Q. For example, Aleksandr Kogan was a	
4	researcher, correct? And he received data from	
5	Facebook separate from the This is Your Digital	02:59:24
6	Life app, right?	
7	MR. FALCONER: I'm going to object to	
8	this as beyond the scope of the notice and also	
9	object to form.	
10	THE DEPONENT: I am aware that	02:59:37
11	Aleksandr Kogan was an app developer.	
12	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) Did Facebook preserve	
13	information showing which users' data Kogan	
14	received?	
15	A. I'm not sure, but that would be	03:00:02
16	information that I think would be captured in Hive,	
17	and if it were part of the tables that we have	
18	placed on hold, the answer would be yes.	
19	Q. Did Facebook take any steps to preserve	
20	data which would show which users received the	03:00:36
21	notice that they may have had their data viewed by	
22	Cambridge Analytica?	
23	A. If if that information or data is in	
24	the custody or control of any of the custodians	
25	on on legal hold, they're under the obligation	03:01:19
		Page 159
		I

# Case 3:18-md-02843-VC Document 1086-54 Filed 12/12/22 Page 161 of 233 CONFIDENTIAL

1	to preserve that information. And then the same	03:01:23
2	would be true for the Hive data tables that we have	
3	preserved for this matter.	
4	Q. Did Facebook preserve the list of users	
5	who downloaded the This is Your Digital Life app?	03:01:41
6	A. The same answer. If any of the	
7	custodians on legal hold for this matter have that	
8	information, they would be instructed to preserve	
9	that list. If that information is contained within	
10	the preserved Hive data tables, those would be	03:02:13
11	that information would also be preserved.	
12	Q. Did Facebook preserve any information	
13	regarding whose data was sent to Aleksandr Kogan	
14	beyond the named plaintiffs?	
15	A. I don't know.	03:02:46
16	Q. Are there logs that reflect whether or	
17	not Cambridge Analytica received named plaintiffs'	
18	data that can be sorted by user ID?	
19	MR. FALCONER: I'm going to object to	
20	that as outside the scope of the notice.	03:03:04
21	But go ahead.	
22	THE DEPONENT: I don't know.	
23	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) And if there were, do	
24	you know if they were preserved?	
25	MR. FALCONER: Objection. Form.	03:03:13
		Page 160

# Case 3:18-md-02843-VC Document 1086-54 Filed 12/12/22 Page 162 of 233 CONFIDENTIAL

1	THE DEPONENT: If that data was part of	03:03:19
2	137 data Hive tables that we have preserved,	
3	then yes. But I don't know the answer to that	
4	specific question.	
5	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) And if they were not	03:03:31
6	preserved in those 137 tables, is the answer no?	
7	A. Unless that information is in the	
8	possession, custody, or control of one of our legal	
9	hold custodians, it's possible that that	
10	information could be preserved through custodial	03:03:58
11	preservation.	
12	Q. Is there any other kind of data that	
13	could identify which Facebook users could have had	
14	their data viewed by Cambridge Analytica other than	
15	what you have just described?	03:04:48
16	MR. FALCONER: Objection. Beyond the	
17	scope of the notice.	
18	THE DEPONENT: I don't know.	
19	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) What steps has Facebook	
20	taken in this case to preserve information relating	03:05:08
21	to the identification of class members?	
22	MR. FALCONER: Objection. Form.	
23	THE DEPONENT: I I don't know what the	
24	term "class members" means.	
25	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) Does Facebook have a	03:05:30
		Page 161

# Case 3:18-md-02843-VC Document 1086-54 Filed 12/12/22 Page 163 of 233 CONFIDENTIAL

1	record of who was signed up for a Facebook account	03:05:31
2	from 2007 to the present?	
3	MR. FALCONER: Objection. Beyond the	
4	scope of the notice.	
5	THE DEPONENT: I don't know.	03:05:48
6	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) At the time the	
7	litigation hold was sent, did Facebook make any	
8	attempt to preserve a record of every person who	
9	had signed up for a Facebook account prior to that	
10	time?	03:05:59
11	MR. FALCONER: Objection. Form.	
12	Go ahead, Mike.	
13	THE DEPONENT: Can you repeat the	
14	question, please.	
15	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) Yeah.	03:06:16
16	At the time the first litigation hold was	
17	sent relating to this matter, did Facebook make any	
18	attempt to preserve a record that identified every	
19	person who signed up for a Facebook account prior	
20	to the time the litigation hold was sent?	03:06:28
21	MR. FALCONER: Objection. Form.	
22	THE DEPONENT: I don't know.	
23	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) What steps has Facebook	
24	taken to preserve data relating to what is shared	
25	about the class members in this case?	03:06:53
		Page 162

# Case 3:18-md-02843-VC Document 1086-54 Filed 12/12/22 Page 164 of 233 CONFIDENTIAL

_ [		22 24
1	MR. FALCONER: Objection. Form.	03:06:59
2	THE DEPONENT: I don't know I don't	
3	know what you mean by "class members."	
4	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) Okay. For your	
5	edification, everybody who held a Facebook account	03:07:15
6	from January 1, 2007 forward is a class member in	
7	the terms of our complaint.	
8	So	
9	A. Okay.	
10	Q. The question is: What steps has Facebook	03:07:28
11	taken to preserve information which would identify	
12	what information is shared about class members in	
13	this case?	
14	A. I don't know.	
15	Q. Has Facebook made an attempt to preserve	03:07:51
16	data or logs that which would show what	
17	information third parties have received about the	
18	class members in this case?	
19	A. I don't know.	
20	Q. Has Facebook made any attempt to preserve	03:08:12
21	data or logs which would show what information	
22	third parties have received about the named	
23	plaintiffs in this case?	
24	A. As I mentioned, we we have 137 Hive	
25	data tables preserved and on legal hold for this	03:08:33
		Page 163

# Case 3:18-md-02843-VC Document 1086-54 Filed 12/12/22 Page 165 of 233 CONFIDENTIAL

1	matter. If that data is within those tables, that	03:08:42
2	information would be preserved. I'm not sure	
3	whether or not that data is or that information	
4	is contained within a Switchboard or DYI snapshot,	
5	but if it is, we would have preserved it at the	03:09:06
6	time of this snapshot.	
7	Q. Has Facebook taken any steps to preserve,	
8	for example, API call logs or records that would	
9	reflect what information third parties received	
10	about the named plaintiffs in this case?	03:09:22
11	MR. FALCONER: Objection. Form.	
12	THE DEPONENT: Russ, I don't know if this	
13	one of those potentially privileged questions or	
14	answers.	
15	MR. FALCONER: Okay.	03:09:54
16	MS. WEAVER: You can consult. You want	
17	to go to a breakout room or	
18	MR. FALCONER: Sure.	
19	Yeah, why we don't we do we'll go off	
20	the record for a second.	03:10:06
21	Mike, can you go into the breakout room?	
22	MS. WEAVER: We can go off the record.	
23	THE VIDEOGRAPHER: We're off the record,	
24	3:10 p.m.	
25	(Recess taken.)	03:10:29
		Page 164

# Case 3:18-md-02843-VC Document 1086-54 Filed 12/12/22 Page 166 of 233 CONFIDENTIAL

1	THE VIDEOGRAPHER: Okay. We're back on	03:18:20
2	the record. It's 3:18 p.m.	
3	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) I'll restate the	
4	question.	
5	Mr. Duffey, has Facebook taken any steps	03:18:30
6	to preserve, for example, API call logs or records	
7	that could reflect what information third parties	
8	received about the named plaintiffs in this case?	
9	MR. FALCONER: I'm going to object to the	
10	form of the question.	03:18:47
11	And then, Mr. Duffey, I'll instruct you	
12	to limit your answer to this question to	
13	nonprivileged information.	
14	THE DEPONENT: Understood.	
15	If if if that information regarding	03:19:00
16	API call logs is stored within any of the 137 Hive	
17	tables we have preserved for this matter or is	
18	information stored by or by any of other legal hold	
19	custodians, that information would be preserved for	
20	this matter.	03:19:42
21	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) But specifically with	
22	regard to API call logs, has Facebook preserved any	
23	information in API call logs that would reflect	
24	what information about class members was shared	
25	with third parties?	03:20:02
		Page 165

# Case 3:18-md-02843-VC Document 1086-54 Filed 12/12/22 Page 167 of 233 CONFIDENTIAL

1	MR. FALCONER: Objection. Form.	03:20:07
2	And, again, same instruction, Mr. Duffey,	
3	not to reveal any privileged communications or	
4	privileged information in the course of your	
5	answer.	03:20:18
6	THE DEPONENT: Same same answer in	
7	respect to class members as I answered with respect	
8	to the named plaintiffs.	
9	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) What steps has Facebook	
10	taken to preserve data that could be associated	03:20:33
11	with the named plaintiffs from systems that have	
12	been deprecated since the onset of the litigation?	
13	A. I'm not aware of any systems that have	
14	been deprecated since the onset of the litigation.	
15	I was informed that Facebook is in the process of	03:21:02
16	deprecating one system called EverStore, which	
17	which stores, from what I'm told, large files like	
18	photos and videos.	
19	That that EverStore system, we're in	
20	the process of migrating that data over to a new	03:21:35
21	system called Manifold, and common practice for	
22	Facebook is to for any deprecated system to	
23	ensure that the data is is appropriately	
24	migrated to the new system.	
25	Q. Are you aware of any deprecated	03:22:07
		Page 166

# Case 3:18-md-02843-VC Document 1086-54 Filed 12/12/22 Page 168 of 233 CONFIDENTIAL

1	practices?	03:22:09
2	MR. FALCONER: Objection. Form. And	
3	beyond the scope of the notice.	
4	But go ahead, Mike.	
5	THE DEPONENT: I'm not sure what you mean	03:22:21
6	by "practice."	
7	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) Do you know what	
8	whitelisting is as it is used in this case?	
9	A. I've heard the term "whitelisting"	
10	before. As it's used in this case, I'm not sure.	03:22:39
11	Q. What is your understanding	
12	A. If I	
13	Q. Oh, I'm sorry, Mr. Duffey.	
14	What were you saying? I didn't mean to	
15	cut you off.	03:22:57
16	A. Yeah, I've heard the term "whitelisting,"	
17	but I'm just I don't have an understanding of	
18	of what that term means in context with this	
19	matter. But if you could explain it to me, I can	
20	attempt to answer your question.	03:23:11
21	Q. At some point in time, did Facebook	
22	transition from Graph API version 1.0 to 2.0?	
23	MR. FALCONER: Objection. Beyond the	
24	scope of the notice.	
25	THE DEPONENT: I understand that that did	03:23:30
		Page 167

# Case 3:18-md-02843-VC Document 1086-54 Filed 12/12/22 Page 169 of 233 CONFIDENTIAL

1	happen, yes.	03:23:33
2	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) And you understand that	
3	part of the allegations in this complaint, for	
4	which you were partly responsible for identifying	
5	custodians and preserving evidence, is that certain	03:23:40
6	third parties were whitelisted or exempted from	
7	being cut off from certain data available in Graph	
8	API version 1.0; is that right?	
9	MR. FALCONER: Objection. Beyond the	
10	scope.	03:24:01
11	Again, go ahead, Mike.	
12	THE DEPONENT: I have general minimum	
13	understanding of this, yes.	
14	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) Did Facebook preserve a	
15	list of the third parties who were whitelisted	03:24:18
16	after the transition from Graph API version 1.0 to	
17	2.0?	
18	A. If any of the 469 custodians placed on	
19	legal hold for this matter have that information of	
20	the of the companies that were whitelisted, they	03:24:51
21	would have preserved that information. I'm not	
22	sure whether or not that information is contained	
23	within any of our Hive tables, but if it were part	
24	of the 137 Hive tables that we have preserved for	
25	this matter, again, that that information would	03:25:13
		Page 168

# Case 3:18-md-02843-VC Document 1086-54 Filed 12/12/22 Page 170 of 233 CONFIDENTIAL

1	be preserved in those the Hive tables on legal	03:25:15
2	hold.	
3	Q. Did Facebook take any any steps to	
4	preserve records of which third parties received	
5	the named plaintiffs' data after they were	03:25:28
6	whitelisted?	
7	A. Same answer.	
8	Q. There are logs that reflect what third	
9	parties have accessed in terms of user data,	
10	correct?	03:25:49
11	MR. FALCONER: Objection. Form.	
12	THE DEPONENT: Can you repeat the	
13	question, please.	
14	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) Sure.	
15	There are APIs or interfaces that	03:26:03
16	reflect strike that.	
17	Are there logs or records that reflect	
18	what data third parties have accessed from Facebook	
19	that existed at the time the litigation hold in	
20	this case was set	03:26:27
21	MR. FALCONER: Objection. Beyond the	
22	scope.	
23	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) correct?	
24	A. I don't know.	
25	Q. So other than the Hive tables and the	03:26:33
		Page 169

# Case 3:18-md-02843-VC Document 1086-54 Filed 12/12/22 Page 171 of 233 CONFIDENTIAL

1	snapshots we've discussed, did Facebook take any	03:26:38
2	steps to preserve data in Facebook's systems that	
3	could be used to identify what information third	
4	parties received from Facebook about users?	
5	A. I just want to make sure I understand the	03:27:17
6	question. Do you mind repeating it one more time,	
7	please.	
8	Q. No problem.	
9	Other than Hive tables and the snapshots	
10	we have discussed and other than custodial files,	03:27:26
11	did Facebook take any steps to preserve data in	
12	Facebook's systems, for example, APIs or logs, that	
13	could be used to identify what information third	
14	parties received from Facebook about class members?	
15	MR. FALCONER: Objection. Form.	03:27:53
16	THE DEPONENT: I don't know.	
17	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) You're aware that as	
18	part of the ADI investigation, Facebook disallowed	
19	access to user data for certain third parties,	
20	correct?	03:28:22
21	MR. FALCONER: Objection. Beyond the	
22	scope of the notice.	
23	THE DEPONENT: I didn't I wasn't I	
24	don't think I was aware of that, no.	
25	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) Do you know if Facebook	03:28:32
		Page 170

# Case 3:18-md-02843-VC Document 1086-54 Filed 12/12/22 Page 172 of 233 CONFIDENTIAL

1	maintained a list of the third parties whose access	03:28:33
2	to Facebook's data was cut off following Cambridge	
3	Analytica?	
4	MR. FALCONER: Objection. Beyond the	
5	scope.	03:28:51
6	THE DEPONENT: I don't understand the	
7	question.	
8	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) Following the	
9	Cambridge Analytica scandal, what steps did	
10	Facebook take to preserve information relating to	03:29:05
11	which third parties were improperly accessing class	
12	members' data?	
13	A. We sent legal hold notifications to	
14	custodians in the Cambridge Analytica matter as	
15	well as legal hold custodians in the app developer	03:29:35
16	investigation matter and instructed those	
17	custodians to preserve all relevant data related to	
18	those matters.	
19	We also placed Hive tables on legal hold	
20	for both the Cambridge Analytica matter as well as	03:29:59
21	the app developer investigation matter.	
22	Q. Does Facebook maintain a record of what	
23	third parties are accessing information through its	
24	APIs?	
25	MR. FALCONER: Objection. Beyond the	03:30:22
		Page 171

# Case 3:18-md-02843-VC Document 1086-54 Filed 12/12/22 Page 173 of 233 CONFIDENTIAL

1	scope of the notice.	03:30:22
2	THE DEPONENT: I don't know.	
3	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) Did Facebook make any	
4	attempt to preserve in back-end logs data that	
5	would allow Facebook to identify whether class	03:30:32
6	members' data was accessed by third parties?	
7	MR. FALCONER: Objection to form.	
8	THE DEPONENT: I don't know what the term	
9	"back-end logs" means.	
10	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) So front-end logs are	03:30:53
11	where data is received and back-end logs is where	
12	it is sent out through the platform.	
13	Does Facebook maintain a record of which	
14	third parties are accessing the data of class	
15	members?	03:31:10
16	MR. FALCONER: I'm going to object to the	
17	form of the question and also object as beyond the	
18	scope of the notice.	
19	THE DEPONENT: I don't know.	
20	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) What steps has Facebook	03:31:23
21	taken since the filing of this lawsuit to track or	
22	monitor what third parties have been receiving	
23	named plaintiffs' data?	
24	MR. FALCONER: Objection. Beyond the	
25	scope of the notice.	03:31:38
		Page 172

# Case 3:18-md-02843-VC Document 1086-54 Filed 12/12/22 Page 174 of 233 CONFIDENTIAL

1	THE DEPONENT: We have sent the legal	03:31:42
2	hold notification to the legal hold notice to	
3	469 custodians as well as placed 137 tables on	
4	legal hold. Those were the the preservation	
5	steps.	03:32:04
6	MR. FALCONER: Lesley, you're on mute.	
7	THE DEPONENT: I can hear you.	
8	(Discussion off the stenographic record.)	
9	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) Okay. I'll direct your	
10	attention to page 3 of Exhibit 389 please.	03:32:28
11	And for the record, it reads in point 8	
12	there: "Please provide definitions for the	
13	departments identified in your August 17th letter."	
14	And I'll note for the record	
15	MR. FALCONER: Can you give me just a	03:32:47
16	second to get there? I'm sorry.	
17	MS. WEAVER: No problem.	
18	MR. FALCONER: Can you state where you	
19	are again.	
20	MS. WEAVER: Exhibit 389, page 3.	03:32:53
21	MR. FALCONER: Page 3. Okay.	
22	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) And for the record, this	
23	lists the departments that Gibson Dunn identified	
24	as having received the legal hold notice in 2018.	
25	Do you see that?	03:33:14
		Page 173
		I

# Case 3:18-md-02843-VC Document 1086-54 Filed 12/12/22 Page 175 of 233 CONFIDENTIAL

1	A. Okay. I do.	03:33:15
2	Q. And it lists management which are members	
3	of the leadership team.	
4	Do you see that?	
5	A. Uh-huh. Yes.	03:33:23
6	Q. Do you know who in management received	
7	the legal hold notice?	
8	A. I don't recall the names of all of the	
9	individuals on the leadership team as of	
10	September 6th, 2018.	03:33:59
11	I can confirm, though, that we do have	
12	members of the leadership team on on legal hold.	
13	Q. And do you know by name who?	
14	A. I just don't recall who was who was	
15	part of the leadership team at that time. I can	03:34:29
16	confirm that both Mark Zuckerberg and	
17	Sheryl Sandberg were on the the Cambridge legal	
18	hold at that time. But but other management	
19	members, I'm not sure.	
20	Q. Do you know if Javier Olivan was?	03:34:43
21	A. I can't confirm that at the time of this	
22	letter. I do believe Mr. Olivan is on legal hold	
23	for Cambridge Analytica.	
24	Q. And then legal the legal department	
25	also received a legal hold notice; is that right?	03:35:14
		Page 174

# Case 3:18-md-02843-VC Document 1086-54 Filed 12/12/22 Page 176 of 233 CONFIDENTIAL

1	A. Members of the legal department I believe	03:35:22
2	received the legal hold notice, yes.	
3	Q. And then members of the policy department	
4	and communications department received the legal	
5	hold notice; is that correct?	03:35:37
6	A. I have no reason to believe that this	
7	that statement those two statements are	
8	inaccurate.	
9	Q. And do you see it refers here to	
10	"platform and development operations"?	03:35:53
11	A. I do.	
12	Q. And did they receive the legal hold	
13	notice?	
14	A. Members of the platform team development	
15	operations team did did receive a copy of the	03:36:08
16	legal hold notice, yes.	
17	Q. And what is platform operations?	
18	A. I believe that at one time it was	
19	called if I feel like this might be a a	
20	typo here. I think what was intended to say is	03:36:44
21	"developer operations" instead of "development	
22	operations."	
23	And I know that that team formally	
24	referred to as "developer operations" is now	
25	referred to as "platform operations."	03:37:01
		Page 175

# Case 3:18-md-02843-VC Document 1086-54 Filed 12/12/22 Page 177 of 233 CONFIDENTIAL

1		
1	Q. And what does platform operations do?	03:37:07
2	A. I'm not sure of their their job	
3	function.	
4	Q. So other than	
5	MR. FALCONER: I'm sorry.	03:37:53
6	Mike, are you done?	
7	THE DEPONENT: Yeah, I'm just I'm just	
8	trying to think if there's there's a summary or	
9	a description that I can provide.	
10	MR. FALCONER: While you're thinking, I	03:38:06
11	just had did not an objection out before you	
12	started your answer.	
13	This question is beyond the scope of the	
14	notice. But I wanted to put that objection in.	
15	Go ahead. Keep thinking. You can	03:38:17
16	answer. I just wanted to make that record.	
17	THE DEPONENT: Yeah, I'm sorry. I don't	
18	know that I can can provide like an accurate	
19	description of what the platform operations team	
20	does.	03:38:52
21	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) Do you know if platform	
22	and development operations teams as described here	
23	took any steps to preserve on a systemwide basis	
24	information that would allow Facebook to identify	
25	what information it was sending to third parties	03:39:09
		Page 176
		I

# Case 3:18-md-02843-VC Document 1086-54 Filed 12/12/22 Page 178 of 233 CONFIDENTIAL

1	about the class members in this case?	03:39:14
2	MR. FALCONER: Objection. Form.	
3	THE DEPONENT: If through the course of	
4	our custodian interviews of members of either of	
5	these two teams identified Hive tables relevant	03:39:36
6	to to your question, those Hive tables would	
7	have been placed on legal hold for preservation.	
8	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) Anything else you can	
9	think of?	
10	A. Members of those teams who received the	03:40:07
11	legal hold notice would be instructed to preserve	
12	any and all data related to the topics listed in	
13	the legal hold notice.	
14	Q. When you say "any and all data," what do	
15	you mean?	03:40:23
16	A. All ESI, hard copy materials, or	
17	structured data like the data that is stored in	
18	Hive tables.	
19	Q. Are you aware of any data not kept in	
20	Hive tables and not kept in custodial files that	03:40:40
21	was preserved that could identify what information	
22	third parties received about class members in this	
23	case?	
24	MR. FALCONER: Objection. Form.	
25	THE DEPONENT: In general, most of our	03:41:02
		Page 177

# Case 3:18-md-02843-VC Document 1086-54 Filed 12/12/22 Page 179 of 233 CONFIDENTIAL

1	our data or ESI is not under a retention schedule	03:41:05
2	or deletion schedule, so unless unless an	
3	employee were to proactively delete that	
4	information, we would have preserved that	
5	information through our various data sources that	03:41:44
6	we use within the company.	
7	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) Okay. I understand your	
8	answer, but I'm really trying to ask something	
9	very, very specific.	
10	Did Facebook take any steps on a systemic	03:42:03
11	basis to preserve information in logs such as the	
12	API call logs that would identify what data third	
13	parties received about the class members in this	
14	case?	
15	MR. FALCONER: I'm going to object to the	03:42:24
16	form of that question.	
17	And then, again, Mr. Duffey, remind you	
18	to exclude any privileged information or contents	
19	of any privileged communications in your answer.	
20	THE DEPONENT: Beyond the data that is on	03:42:41
21	legal hold in the 137 tables that we have on on	
22	hold, Hive tables, I'm not aware of any, you know,	
23	additional measures to preserve that data.	
24	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) And then is it your	
25	understanding that members of the advertising,	03:43:11
		Page 178

# Case 3:18-md-02843-VC Document 1086-54 Filed 12/12/22 Page 180 of 233 CONFIDENTIAL

1	sales, and marketing departments, the security	03:43:13
2	department, the privacy team, human resources,	
3	growth, academic research, engineering, and user	
4	research all received litigation hold notices in	
5	this case on or around March of 2018?	03:43:33
6	MR. FALCONER: Objection. Form.	
7	THE DEPONENT: This this letter is	
8	dated December 6th, 2018. I have no reason to	
9	to not believe or that the accuracy of these	
10	statements as it pertains to the various teams	03:44:05
11	within our organization that were placed on legal	
12	hold.	
13	So by by the September 6th, 2018, I	
14	would agree that that members from all of these	
15	groups or teams were placed on legal hold.	03:44:24
16	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) Are you aware of any	
17	other departments that received the legal hold	
18	notice in 2018?	
19	MR. FALCONER: Objection. Form.	
20	Go ahead, Mike.	03:44:43
21	THE DEPONENT: No, this seems like	
22	like a comprehensive list.	
23	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) Okay.	
24	MS. WEAVER: We'll take a quick break and	
25	we'll be back in like five. We can go off the	03:45:14
		Page 179
		I

## Case 3:18-md-02843-VC Document 1086-54 Filed 12/12/22 Page 181 of 233 CONFIDENTIAL

1	record.	03:45:17
2	THE VIDEOGRAPHER: Okay. We're off the	
3	record. It's 3:45 p.m.	
4	(Recess taken.)	
5	THE VIDEOGRAPHER: Okay. We're back on	03:51:22
6	the record. It's 3:51 p.m.	
7	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) Mr. Duffey, were you	
8	aware of a motion that Facebook brought in this	
9	case that (inaudible) permission not to preserve	
10	data?	03:51:36
11	MR. FALCONER: Objection. Form and	
12	outside the scope of the notice.	
13	And, Mr. Duffey, I want to exclude from	
14	your answer anything you learned from conversations	
15	with counsel in this case, privileged	03:51:45
16	conversations.	
17	THE DEPONENT: No, I'm not.	
18	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) Do you know what a	
19	method table is?	
20	A. I've heard of I've heard of the the	03:52:05
21	term "method table." I I do not know what it	
22	is, no.	
23	Q. When Facebook was implementing its	
24	preservation program in response to this lawsuit,	
25	did it consult with engineers to consider whether	03:52:30
		Page 180

## Case 3:18-md-02843-VC Document 1086-54 Filed 12/12/22 Page 182 of 233 CONFIDENTIAL

1	API call logs should be preserved in order to keep	03:52:34
2	a record of what data third parties obtained about	
3	the plaintiffs in this case?	
4	MR. FALCONER: So objection to form.	
5	And, again, Mr. Duffey, if there were any	03:52:51
6	privileged conversations that you were part of that	
7	would otherwise be responsive to that question, you	
8	should exclude from your answer.	
9	THE DEPONENT: I heard you mention that	
10	phrase "preservation programs," and I'm not sure I	03:53:08
11	understand what that means. I just want to make	
12	sure I get clarity on that before I attempt to	
13	answer your question.	
14	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) I just mean attempts to	
15	preserve. But I can restate the question.	03:53:18
16	When Facebook implemented its retention	
17	policy in response to this lawsuit, did Facebook	
18	consult with engineers to consider whether API call	
19	logs should be preserved in order to keep a record	
20	of what data third parties obtained about class	03:53:36
21	members in this case?	
22	MR. FALCONER: Again, objection. Form.	
23	And, Mr. Duffey, the same instruction on	
24	privilege, which I can repeat if you need me to.	
25	THE DEPONENT: I don't know.	03:54:05
		Page 181

## Case 3:18-md-02843-VC Document 1086-54 Filed 12/12/22 Page 183 of 233 CONFIDENTIAL

1	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) Who would know?	03:54:06
2	A. Custodian interviews are conducted by our	
3	outside counsel and in-house counsel. I think I	
4	think they would be the appropriate people to ask	
5	that question.	03:54:47
6	Q. Other than custodial linked data sources,	
7	did Facebook preserve ESI in central repositories?	
8	A. What do you mean by "central repository"?	
9	Q. For example, is financial information	
10	preserved at Facebook in a centralized repository	03:55:34
11	that is not custodially limited?	
12	A. I'm aware of teams that use central	
13	repositories like a Google Drive or a SharePoint or	
14	a network share. So if you can repeat the question	
15	I I think I I can attempt to answer.	03:56:28
16	Q. Other than custodial data sources, did	
17	Facebook preserve ESI in central repositories?	
18	A. I think I mentioned this before. Central	
19	repositories like Google Drive or like a network	
20	share or like a SharePoint are not under any	03:56:54
21	auto-deletion or retention period. Data that lives	
22	within a central repository would have to be	
23	deleted by some lady who had access to those	
24	central repositories.	
25	And as I stated earlier, I'm not aware	03:57:26
		Page 182

## Case 3:18-md-02843-VC Document 1086-54 Filed 12/12/22 Page 184 of 233 CONFIDENTIAL

1	I have never our E-discovery team has not been	03:57:29
2	made aware of any deletion that has occurred in a	
3	central repository for this matter.	
4	Q. Did Facebook take any steps to preserve	
5	logs that reflect what data SDKs were obtaining	03:57:57
6	that related to class member data?	
7	MR. FALCONER: Objection. Form.	
8	THE DEPONENT: I don't know what an SDK	
9	is, but if that were data that is part of the Hive	
10	tables that have been preserved for this matter,	03:58:25
11	then yes, we would have preserved it.	
12	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) Okay. Is it Facebook's	
13	usual practice that data in Hive tables subject to	
14	legal holds are automatically put in cold storage?	
15	MR. FALCONER: Objection. Form.	03:58:59
16	THE DEPONENT: It has been the	
17	E-discovery E-discovery data science team's	
18	approach or mechanism for placing Hive tables on	
19	legal hold to move that data into cold storage.	
20	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) How long does it take to	03:59:34
21	get data out of cold storage?	
22	MR. FALCONER: Objection. Beyond the	
23	scope of the notice.	
24	THE DEPONENT: I think it would depend	
25	on on the size of the data that would be needed	03:59:51
		Page 183

## Case 3:18-md-02843-VC Document 1086-54 Filed 12/12/22 Page 185 of 233 CONFIDENTIAL

1	to be taken out of cold storage. So I so I	03:59:56
2	don't know I don't know how long it would take.	
3	But it it certainly would depend on the size of	
4	the the data or the Hive table.	
5	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) Do you know whether the	04:00:17
6	data in the 137 Hive tables is available anywhere	
7	else at Facebook?	
8	A. I don't know I don't know that I can	
9	answer that question. I don't know.	
10	Q. When you said it would depend on the size	04:00:55
11	of the data, can you give a rough estimate as to	
12	how long it would take to get Hive tables out of	
13	cold storage?	
14	MR. FALCONER: Objection. Beyond the	
15	scope.	04:01:07
16	THE DEPONENT: I can't I can't. I	
17	mean Hive tables, especially ones that are on legal	
18	hold, grow in size every single day that new data	
19	is put into cold storage. I'm I I have no	
20	idea how long it would take, but I know that it	04:01:30
21	would be dependent on on the size of the tables.	
22	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) Is	
23	A. Our data science I would ask our data	
24	science team on on sort of a timetable depending	
25	on which tables were were you're referring	04:01:49
		Page 184

## Case 3:18-md-02843-VC Document 1086-54 Filed 12/12/22 Page 186 of 233 CONFIDENTIAL

1	to.	04:01:52
2	Q. Are we talking weeks or months?	
3	MR. FALCONER: Same objection.	
4	THE DEPONENT: Possibly. I don't know.	
5	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) Has Facebook ever	04:02:07
6	brought tables out of cold storage that have been	
7	put in there on a litigation hold?	
8	MR. FALCONER: Same objection.	
9	THE DEPONENT: I believe so.	
10	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) On how many occasions?	04:02:33
11	MR. FALCONER: Objection. Beyond the	
12	scope.	
13	THE DEPONENT: I don't I don't know.	
14	I've only work on a subset of a total number of	
15	active regulatory and litigation matters within	04:02:47
16	within our legal department, so I don't know the	
17	answer to that question.	
18	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) How many times are you	
19	aware of that Facebook has brought data out of cold	
20	storage?	04:03:00
21	MR. FALCONER: Objection. Beyond the	
22	scope.	
23	THE DEPONENT: I don't have a number.	
24	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) Is it more than ten?	
25	MR. FALCONER: Same objection.	04:03:14
		Page 185

## Case 3:18-md-02843-VC Document 1086-54 Filed 12/12/22 Page 187 of 233 CONFIDENTIAL

1	THE DEPONENT: I don't know.	04:03:18
2	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) Have you ever personally	
3	been involved in a matter where Facebook brought	
4	data out of cold storage?	
5	MR. FALCONER: Objection. Beyond the	04:03:34
6	scope.	
7	THE DEPONENT: Yeah, I'm I'm	
8	struggling with this question because I've never	
9	heard sort of the term "taking data out of cold	
10	storage."	04:04:26
11	I am aware of our E-discovery data	
12	science team producing structured data in in	
13	matters. Whether or not it was taken out of cold	
14	storage or not, I'm I'm just not clear on that	
15	process.	04:04:52
16	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) And in what matters did	
17	Facebook's data science team produce structured	
18	data out of cold storage?	
19	MR. FALCONER: Objection. Beyond the	
20	scope.	04:05:08
21	THE DEPONENT: No no specific matters	
22	come to mind that I can I can tell you sitting	
23	here.	
24	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) Who is involved with	
25	producing the structured data out of cold storage?	04:05:57
		Page 186

## Case 3:18-md-02843-VC Document 1086-54 Filed 12/12/22 Page 188 of 233 CONFIDENTIAL

1	MR. FALCONER: Objection. Beyond the	04:06:05
2	scope.	
3	THE DEPONENT: Any any data that is	
4	produced from Hive tables goes through a stat	
5	review process that involves different	04:06:26
6	cross-functional partners within the company,	
7	including E E-discovery, legal. It depends	
8	on on what the data is and who the owners of	
9	that data are.	
10	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) Does putting Hive logs	04:07:02
11	in cold storage make it less accessible?	
12	MR. FALCONER: Objection. Form and	
13	beyond the scope of the notice.	
14	THE DEPONENT: When data is put into cold	
15	storage, only the E-discovery team would would	04:07:27
16	have access to that data. So I I believe it	
17	does make it more difficult to access the data,	
18	yes.	
19	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) What is cold storage,	
20	exactly?	04:07:53
21	MR. FALCONER: Same objection.	
22	THE DEPONENT: I'm not a data scientist.	
23	All I know is that that's the storage space for	
24	which, for instance, legal hold data, Hive data is	
25	preserved.	04:08:20
		Page 187

## Case 3:18-md-02843-VC Document 1086-54 Filed 12/12/22 Page 189 of 233 CONFIDENTIAL

1		
1	Q. (By Ms. Weaver) You understand that you	04:08:23
2	were to testify today regarding the	
3	Special Master's question "were any high Hive	
4	tables containing named plaintiff data placed in	
5	cold storage during the pendency of this	04:08:32
6	litigation," right?	
7	A. Yes.	
8	Q. So what does it mean to place Hive tables	
9	in cold storage?	
10	A. That is our our mechanism for placing	04:08:44
11	Hive data on legal hold so that it cannot be	
12	altered, modified, or deleted.	
13	Q. Does placing it in cold storage make it	
14	less accessible, meaning in terms of being able to	
15	search or access the data?	04:09:07
16	MR. FALCONER: Objection. Beyond the	
17	scope.	
18	But go ahead.	
19	THE DEPONENT: I don't know. I I	
20	would have to ask our our data science team that	04:09:20
21	specific question.	
22	MS. WEAVER: Okay. I have no further	
23	questions at this time. We will seek a deponent to	
24	answer on the questions that the witness was not	
25	able to answer.	04:09:38
		Page 188

## Case 3:18-md-02843-VC Document 1086-54 Filed 12/12/22 Page 190 of 233 CONFIDENTIAL

1	But, Mr. Duffey, I want to thank you	04:09:39
2	very, very much for your time and effort and the	
3	time you took to prepare for this deposition.	
4	THE DEPONENT: And thank you, Ms. Weaver.	
5	MR. FALCONER: We'll reserve all rights.	04:09:48
6	We'd like to read and sign, and mark the transcript	
7	"Confidential" pending the final confidentiality	
8	designations.	
9	MS. WEAVER: Okay. We can go off the	
10	record.	04:09:58
11	THE VIDEOGRAPHER: Thank you.	
12	We're off the record. It's 4:10 p.m.	
13	(TIME NOTED: 4:10 p.m.)	
14		
15		
16		
17	000	
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		
		Page 189

### Case 3:18-md-02843-VC Document 1086-54 Filed 12/12/22 Page 191 of 233 CONFIDENTIAL

1 I, Rebecca L. Romano, a Registered Professional Reporter, Certified Shorthand 2 3 Reporter, Certified Court Reporter, do hereby 4 certify: 5 That the foregoing proceedings were taken before me remotely at the time and place herein set 6 7 forth; that any deponents in the foregoing 8 proceedings, prior to testifying, were administered an oath; that a record of the proceedings was made 9 by me using machine shorthand which was thereafter 10 transcribed under my direction; that the foregoing 11 12 transcript is true record of the testimony given. 13 Further, that if the foregoing pertains to the 14 original transcript of a deposition in a Federal Case, before completion of the proceedings, review 15 16 of the transcript [ ] was [X] was not requested. 17 I further certify I am neither financially 18 interested in the action nor a relative or employee 19 of any attorney or any party to this action. 20 IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have this date 21 subscribed my name this 7th day of June, 2022. 22 23 24 Rebecca L. Romano, RPR, CCR 25 CSR. No 12546

### Case 3:18-md-02843-VC Document 1086-54 Filed 12/12/22 Page 192 of 233 CONFIDENTIAL

```
1
     RUSSELL H. FALCONER
 2
     rfalconer@gibsondunn.com
                                                      June 7, 2022
 3
     RE: FACEBOOK, INC., CONSUMER USER PROFILE LITIGATION
 4
     JUNE 2, 2022, MICHAEL DUFFEY, JOB NO. 5234611
 5
6
     The above-referenced transcript has been
      completed by Veritext Legal Solutions and
7
8
     review of the transcript is being handled as follows:
9
      ___ Per CA State Code (CCP 2025.520 (a)-(e)) - Contact Veritext
10
         to schedule a time to review the original transcript at
         a Veritext office.
11
12
      ___ Per CA State Code (CCP 2025.520 (a)-(e)) - Locked .PDF
         Transcript - The witness should review the transcript and
13
14
         make any necessary corrections on the errata pages included
        below, notating the page and line number of the corrections.
15
16
         The witness should then sign and date the errata and penalty
17
         of perjury pages and return the completed pages to all
         appearing counsel within the period of time determined at
18
19
         the deposition or provided by the Code of Civil Procedure.
       _ Waiving the CA Code of Civil Procedure per Stipulation of
20
         Counsel - Original transcript to be released for signature
21
         as determined at the deposition.
22
      ___ Signature Waived - Reading & Signature was waived at the
23
24
         time of the deposition.
25
                                                            Page 191
```

#### 

1	xx Federal R&S Requested (FRCP 30(e)(1)(B)) - Locked .PDF	
2	Transcript - The witness should review the transcript and	
3	make any necessary corrections on the errata pages included	
4	below, notating the page and line number of the corrections.	
5	The witness should then sign and date the errata and penalty	
6	of perjury pages and return the completed pages to all	
7	appearing counsel within the period of time determined at	
8	the deposition or provided by the Federal Rules.	
9	Federal R&S Not Requested - Reading & Signature was not	
10	requested before the completion of the deposition.	
11		
12		
13		
14		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		
	Page 192	

## Case 3:18-md-02843-VC Document 1086-54 Filed 12/12/22 Page 194 of 233 CONFIDENTIAL

1	I, MICHAEL DUFFEY, do hereby declare under
2	penalty of perjury that I have read the foregoing
3	transcript; that I have made any corrections as
4	appear notes; that my testimony as contained
5	herein, as corrected, is true and correct.
6	Executed this, day of,
7	2022, at
8	
9	
10	
11	
12	MICHAEL DUFFEY
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	
	Page 193

# 

RE: FAC	EBOOK, IN	NC., CONSUMER	USER	PROFILE	LITIGATION
MICHAEL	DUFFEY	(JOB NO. 5234	611)		
		ERRATA	S H	E E T	
PAGE	LINE	CHANGE			
REASON_					
PAGE	LINE	CHANGE			
REASON_					
PAGE	LINE	CHANGE			
REASON_					
PAGE	LINE	CHANGE			
REASON_					
PAGE	LINE	CHANGE			
PAGE	LINE	CHANGE			
REASON_					
MICHAEL	DUF'F'EY			Date	
					Page 194

### [& - 2nd]

&	<b>114</b> 10:4	<b>2.0</b> 167:22 168:17	61:3 87:2 108:20
	<b>116</b> 10:7	<b>20</b> 8:20 9:6,10	126:7 130:2 131:4
<b>&amp;</b> 1:14 2:19 3:5	<b>11:29</b> 79:23	10:12,18 11:6	131:5 132:2 133:3
4:16 5:5 6:5 9:14	<b>11:42</b> 80:1	79:12 130:2	138:14 139:11
12:16 15:15,15,22	<b>1201</b> 4:8	<b>20-0466</b> 1:22	140:9 141:25
117:13 191:23	<b>12546</b> 1:21 190:25	<b>2001</b> 4:19	150:19
192:9	<b>129</b> 10:10	<b>2007</b> 96:22 162:2	<b>2022</b> 1:16 2:18
0	<b>12:44</b> 113:8	163:6	9:16 12:1,6 26:16
<b>00003256</b> 9:8	<b>12th</b> 3:10	<b>2017</b> 14:21 49:21	36:14 82:16 84:8
<b>00003259</b> 9:12	<b>130</b> 10:16	50:2,4 68:3 86:20	90:17 190:21
<b>0000462</b> 9:23	<b>134</b> 11:4,10	<b>2018</b> 10:5 16:25	191:3,5 193:7
<b>0000470</b> 9:24	<b>137</b> 69:13,19,23	22:18 25:15 27:2	<b>20221</b> 47:8
<b>0000489</b> 8:21 9:7	70:13 72:21 73:18	27:11 29:11 35:8	<b>2025.520</b> 191:9,12
9:11 33:4	75:10,19 77:17	38:3,24 50:2,5	<b>206</b> 4:11
<b>0000493</b> 8:22	79:6,7,16 82:25	75:2,12,22 76:5,12	<b>20th</b> 90:21 131:4,5
<b>0000504</b> 10:13	83:23 84:5 154:21	91:25 92:6 109:9	132:2 133:3
<b>0000509</b> 10:14	156:7 158:12,14	109:18 114:13	138:13,14
<b>0000516</b> 10:19	161:2,6 163:24	116:4 124:2	<b>2100</b> 4:20
<b>0000531</b> 10:20	165:16 168:24	173:24 174:10	<b>213</b> 5:10 6:20
<b>0000555</b> 11:7	173:3 178:21	179:5,8,13,18	<b>214</b> 4:22
<b>0000568</b> 11:8	184:6	<b>2019</b> 10:8 39:8	<b>21st</b> 140:9
<b>0000578</b> 11:15	14 8:5	87:3 110:14	<b>229-7907</b> 5:10
<b>0000585</b> 11:16	<b>142</b> 11:13	117:13 125:16	<b>22nd</b> 91:25 92:6
<b>0000692</b> 9:17	<b>15</b> 90:16	<b>2020</b> 8:20 9:6,10	<b>23</b> 66:6
<b>0000694</b> 9:18	<b>16</b> 9:22	11:15 35:10 36:14	<b>23rd</b> 90:13
<b>02843</b> 1:6 2:4	<b>1600</b> 3:11	38:23 39:3,8,10	<b>253-9706</b> 6:20
1	<b>16th</b> 96:18,24	44:16 46:14 52:1	<b>26</b> 104:20
1 1:25 29:23 31:8	98:18 99:1,5	60:10,13,15 61:11	<b>27th</b> 47:8 52:2
31:9,20,23 163:6	108:20	61:19 62:24 66:7	<b>28</b> 9:16 11:14
192:1	<b>17</b> 8:11	66:15,24 81:9,12	<b>2843</b> 1:4 2:3
<b>1.0</b> 167:22 168:8	<b>17th</b> 115:13	81:16,23 87:3	<b>285</b> 109:22
168:16	173:13	90:14,16,22 96:18	<b>28th</b> 142:21
<b>100</b> 117:18	<b>18</b> 1:6 2:4	96:24 98:18 99:2	143:16 148:7
<b>103</b> 9:14	<b>1801</b> 5:16	99:5 126:14	<b>29</b> 32:19
<b>104</b> 9:20	<b>18th</b> 26:16 36:13	142:21 143:16	<b>298-5700</b> 5:19
<b>10:19</b> 48:19	<b>194</b> 1:25	148:8 151:1	<b>2:29</b> 151:9
<b>10:35</b> 48:22	<b>1:18</b> 113:11	154:16 155:5	<b>2:43</b> 151:12
10th 35:10 81:12	2	<b>2021</b> 9:22 10:12,18	<b>2nd</b> 12:6
81:16,23	<b>2</b> 1:16 12:1 115:7	11:6 14:19,22	
<b>11</b> 21:2 117:24	137:18 138:5	15:2 52:2 59:1,6	
118:1	191:5	60:6,9,14,16,20	
	171.3		

#### [3 - 9th]

3	82:13 83:20 84:5	4	6
<b>3</b> 2:18 25:19,21	92:25 96:12	<b>415</b> 3:13 6:11	<b>6</b> 1:12 8:15 9:4
26:12 30:12,16	101:16 126:4	<b>4200</b> 5:17	10:5 17:18 36:12
35:4 119:3 126:6	140:14	<b>445-4003</b> 3:13	37:14 105:24
136:23 137:24	<b>387</b> 9:14 103:19,23	<b>463</b> 105:6	114:12 115:10
173:10,20,21	104:6,16	<b>466</b> 105:24	116:4 146:25
<b>3.2</b> 105:13	<b>388</b> 9:20 104:20,21	<b>467</b> 105:24	<b>6.1</b> 105:24
<b>3.2</b> 105.13 <b>3.3</b> 105:8	105:2	<b>469</b> 82:15 83:25	<b>6/2/2022</b> 9:5
<b>30</b> 1:12 8:15 9:4	<b>389</b> 10:4 114:7,8	84:7 94:16 168:18	<b>623-1900</b> 4:11
17:18 36:12 37:14	173:10,20	173:3	<b>698-3170</b> 4:22
146:25 192:1	<b>39</b> 142:14	<b>48</b> 103:22	6th 174:10 179:8
	<b>390</b> 10:7 116:16,20	<b>490</b> 80:14	179:13
<b>3000</b> 6:9	117:9 124:7		
<b>303</b> 5:19	<b>391</b> 10:10 129:9,10	<b>493</b> 33:4	7
<b>31</b> 82:16	129:22 135:8	<b>4:10</b> 189:12,13	<b>7</b> 21:1 30:12,16
31st 84:8	<b>392</b> 10:16 99:18	5	124:9,9 191:3
<b>32</b> 8:19 129:13	130:18,22,25	<b>5</b> 117:24	<b>7321</b> 190:23
130:10	131:1,7 132:7	<b>50</b> 20:1	<b>75201</b> 4:21
<b>3200</b> 4:9	133:2 134:19,19	<b>504</b> 129:15	<b>77</b> 116:19
<b>3256</b> 82:14	135:11 136:2,9	<b>509</b> 129:15	<b>7th</b> 190:21
<b>3257</b> 63:5,19 66:5	<b>393</b> 11:4 134:12,19	<b>516</b> 130:23	8
68:22 96:13	134:23 135:15,17	<b>52</b> 9:4 58:25 59:17	
<b>3258</b> 52:23 63:13	135:25 136:2,21	60:4,13 61:2	8 29:23 30:9,14,25
65:5 67:21	136:21,23 138:9	<b>5234611</b> 1:24	173:11
<b>3259</b> 70:19	138:12,17,24,25	191:5 194:2	<b>80202-2642</b> 5:18
<b>32nd</b> 6:18	<b>393-8247</b> 6:11	<b>529</b> 132:25	<b>827</b> 1:22
<b>333</b> 5:8	<b>394</b> 11:10 134:15	<b>531</b> 130:23	<b>84</b> 25:20
<b>3491</b> 1:23	135:16 136:4,18	<b>555</b> 3:10 6:8,17	9
<b>37</b> 134:10	136:25 137:1	134:21	9 10:8 61:19 62:24
<b>38</b> 36:3 134:11	138:9,11,15,24,25	<b>568</b> 134:22	90:16 117:12
<b>384</b> 8:11 17:17,21	141:6	<b>569</b> 134:25	146:10,18
20:12 29:21,23	<b>395</b> 11:13 142:10	<b>576</b> 137:9	<b>90</b> 74:18 77:24,24
30:6 146:10	142:11,19 143:13	<b>577</b> 134:25 141:10	<b>90013</b> 6:19
<b>385</b> 8:19 32:15,19	147:3	<b>578</b> 142:15	<b>90071-3197</b> 5:9
32:20 33:3,19	<b>3:10</b> 164:24	<b>579</b> 148:15	<b>90th</b> 74:21
34:7,17,23 80:11		<b>581</b> 147:22 149:5	<b>94105-0921</b> 6:10
81:6,10 91:12		<b>585</b> 142:15	<b>94607</b> 3:12
92:3 102:25 109:3	<b>3:45</b> 180:3 <b>3:51</b> 180:6	5th 6:17	<b>98101</b> 4:10
109:23 119:4	<b>3:51</b> 180:6	<b>U</b> U.17	<b>9:14</b> 2:18 12:2,6
<b>386</b> 9:4 52:8,9,16			9th 38:23,23 39:3
52:23 63:6 67:22			39:10 44:16 46:14
80:25 81:19 82:4			52:1 60:10,13,15
			32.1 00.10,13,13

#### [9th - analytics]

61:11	50:17 53:5 55:4	addressed 130:8	108:3 110:20
a	55:16 59:1,11	addresses 143:23	120:20 122:3
	60:11,16,18 61:12	addressing 108:19	128:4,18 133:14
<b>a.m.</b> 2:18 12:2	61:19,20 62:9,10	adds 147:10	141:5 144:4
48:19,22 79:23	62:17,17,24 66:6	adi 127:25 170:18	145:18 147:19
80:1	90:20 154:2,16	adid 155:25	149:1,11 150:23
ability 41:18 42:4	accuracy 179:9	admin 121:19,22	153:1 154:12
56:10,17 57:21	accurate 75:5	administered 14:2	160:21 162:12
58:12 71:2 111:3	146:25 176:18	190:8	167:4 168:11
111:13 121:16	achieved 118:15	administrator	176:15 179:20
<b>able</b> 58:20 60:25	acronym 32:8	40:12	188:18
79:14 140:6	act 73:9	admins 59:2,9	akins 46:15
188:14,25	<b>action</b> 26:3 31:14	60:18	aleksandr 124:20
absolutely 18:24	32:3 44:7 46:11	ads 40:17,20 59:1	159:3,11 160:13
academic 158:23	47:10 59:18 83:1	60:18 86:11	allegations 168:3
179:3	93:2 96:15 108:13	<b>advance</b> 8:21,22	alleged 125:3
access 57:12 77:8 83:4 85:6 86:1	190:18,19	9:7,8,11,12,17,18	<b>allen</b> 38:13 53:9
87:1 120:15	<b>actions</b> 1:8 2:7	9:23,24 10:13,14	53:10 54:20 60:25
124:22 125:2	57:16 84:4 95:24	10:19,20 11:7,8,15	allow 83:15 172:5
170:19 171:1	active 73:1 74:23	11:16 33:4 129:15	176:24
	157:6,12 185:15	130:23 134:21	<b>allows</b> 62:13 70:20
182:23 187:16,17 188:15	activities 85:3	142:15	71:2
accessed 169:9,18	activity 42:6 54:5	advertisers 40:19	altered 188:12
172:6	67:19	advertising 40:6,9	<b>alto</b> 1:15 2:17 12:1
accessible 86:15	actual 82:7 97:21	40:14,15,23 53:5	amended 8:11
121:8 187:11	98:9	55:4,16 59:11	17:18 20:18
188:14	<b>acxiom</b> 158:16	178:25	<b>amount</b> 71:14
accessing 171:11	adavis 3:15	<b>advise</b> 125:21	analysis 158:18
171:23 172:14	<b>added</b> 96:21 97:9	<b>ag</b> 23:12 93:7	159:2
account 38:2,5,15	126:12	aggregate 58:24	analytica 16:23
38:17,21,24 39:25	addition 84:4	138:1	17:9 22:2,24
44:15 45:17 46:11	additional 29:16	<b>ago</b> 15:23 36:6	23:13 29:9,15
47:6,8 52:2 57:13	40:4 54:1 65:3	37:6 67:6 69:6	69:15 75:23 76:5
61:21,23 62:3,18	75:13,14 84:19	80:3	82:15 93:4,10,12
62:19 84:19 86:9	118:7 139:4,7	<b>agree</b> 179:14	101:10 124:20,22
86:12,12 90:6	178:23	<b>agreed</b> 13:9,11	124:24 128:21
145:7 154:1,4,15	address 17:16	agreements 125:1	159:22 160:17
154:20 155:3	25:18 74:17 86:8	131:14	161:14 171:3,9,14
162:1,9,19 163:5	108:9 127:19	<b>ahead</b> 16:5 24:11	171:20 174:23
accounts 39:7 40:6	144:23 145:1	35:21,23 58:15	analytics 67:19
40:9,14,16,19,23	146:4	88:11,24 89:19	

#### [angeles - automatically]

angeles 5:0 6:10	anthony 17.2	120.2 121.4 5	103:21 104:23
angeles 5:9 6:19	anthony 47:2	130:2 131:4,5 132:2 133:3	103:21 104:23
anne 3:7 12:18	anybody 29:7 43:3		
anon 78:17,20,24	139:23	138:13,14 139:11	129:12 130:20
anonymization	<b>api</b> 164:8 165:6,16	140:9 141:25	134:14,17 136:5
45:23	165:22,23 167:22	142:21 143:16	142:13 149:14
anonymized 45:13	168:8,16 178:12	148:7 150:19	attempt 17:1
73:14	181:1,18	151:1	18:21 38:16 44:22
answer 16:5 18:21	apis 169:15 170:12	archive 72:2,6	137:17 162:8,18
18:25 29:2 35:24	171:24	110:13,15 118:19	163:15,20 167:20
43:2 47:22,24	apologies 26:9	archived 71:7	172:4 181:12
56:15 58:20 61:5	104:2 140:18	72:12 118:5,17,22	182:15
61:7,8 64:5 66:20	apologize 62:21	119:14,18,19	attempted 38:22
70:5,14 75:5	128:22 135:16	archiving 116:22	39:5 44:13 87:16
77:20 78:10 79:5	<b>app</b> 58:4 94:7	117:2	138:3
79:15 85:20,22	99:15 128:12	area 71:7 72:3,12	attempts 39:2,9
92:19,22 93:20	158:5 159:6,11	ariciu 47:2	45:16 181:14
94:10,14 97:17,19	160:5 171:15,21	arrived 129:19	attention 21:3
100:12,13 101:5	appear 193:4	asid 155:25	25:21 115:7
106:16,17 109:12	appearances 3:1	aside 42:7	117:23 137:8
112:22 122:7	4:1 5:1 6:1 7:1	<b>asked</b> 88:2 102:6	173:10
125:24 128:20	appeared 104:1	<b>asking</b> 26:18 30:5	<b>attorney</b> 4:18 5:7
132:13 134:3	114:17	31:2,20 55:8 74:7	6:7 12:14 13:7,7
137:4 143:6,9	appearing 3:2 4:2	81:25 99:1 123:17	98:8 124:15
150:18 151:5	5:2 6:2 7:2 191:18	asserted 95:18	190:19
153:1 154:7,23,23	192:7	asserts 94:22	attorneys 3:9 4:7
156:8 158:13,17	applied 92:5	assessment 131:15	5:15 21:9,14,15,23
158:25,25 159:18	applies 115:23	assessments	22:2 27:16
160:6 161:3,6	<b>apply</b> 115:18	131:21	audibly 18:25
165:12 166:5,6	approach 183:18	assist 29:16	<b>audit</b> 131:13
167:20 169:7	appropriate 54:22	assisting 12:19	audits 125:3
176:12,16 178:8	71:1 86:2 182:4	associate 7:5	august 115:13
178:19 180:14	appropriately	associated 26:2	173:13
181:8,13 182:15	166:23	45:14 60:18 93:25	<b>auld</b> 3:5 12:16
184:9 185:17	approved 139:6	134:1 156:1,4,12	authenticate
188:24,25	150:13	166:10	136:16
answered 166:7	approximately	association 157:19	<b>auto</b> 98:16,19 99:2
answering 18:16	36:3	associations 64:9	99:7,16 103:9
23:25 41:13 66:19	<b>apps</b> 57:22 58:2,9	65:7,9 67:7 157:7	182:21
78:8 81:4	58:12 124:24	157:13,24	automatically
answers 19:1	<b>april</b> 10:12,18	attached 17:23	105:9 118:5
164:14	11:6,14 90:21	32:17 52:11	183:14

#### [available - bunch]

	1		1
available 38:25	126:5 135:2	34:10 35:2,5,9	148:25 150:10
41:19,23 44:14,18	136:20 141:6	36:4,6 37:18	152:25 154:10
44:20 45:5,6,7,8	146:13 147:2	38:24 39:7 40:13	157:3 159:8
49:23 61:24 65:15	149:4 151:11	42:9 43:8,17 44:4	160:14 161:16
66:3 85:16 86:16	165:1 172:4,9,11	44:20 45:5 47:16	162:3 167:3,23
149:8 157:20	179:25 180:5	52:6 53:12,13,25	168:9 169:21
158:3 168:7 184:6	<b>bad</b> 73:7	56:12 59:21 64:19	170:21 171:4,25
avenue 4:8,19 5:8	<b>bank</b> 146:5	65:2 73:24 75:25	172:17,24 176:13
aware 48:6 58:8	barring 90:5	76:3 99:10 100:4	178:20 183:22
59:25 84:15 98:22	<b>based</b> 53:9 121:4	107:4,9 108:17	184:14 185:11,21
99:6 102:11	121:15	110:14,17,21,21	186:5,19 187:1,13
103:11 108:18	<b>basic</b> 86:3,5,12	116:5 121:23	188:16
111:2,9,12,19	<b>basis</b> 56:16,19	122:11 123:9,20	bfalaw.com 3:14
112:1,3,11 116:6	91:2 94:13 100:6	127:17 131:9	3:15,16
122:4 123:18	117:5 125:14	135:17 138:13	biometric 145:8
124:1,5 126:25	138:1 176:23	149:12,25 154:5,7	<b>birth</b> 145:8
128:7 130:5,13,15	178:11	174:22 175:1,6,18	<b>bit</b> 78:19
132:11 133:9	<b>bates</b> 32:23,25	179:9 185:9	bleichmar 3:5
153:21,25 156:23	33:1,3 52:22	187:16	12:16
159:10 166:13,25	80:13 82:14 96:13	<b>bell</b> 47:2	<b>box</b> 59:15 111:4
170:17,24 177:19	105:6,24 129:14	<b>best</b> 93:20 153:1	111:14 112:20
178:22 179:16	134:21,25 135:3	<b>beth</b> 43:10	<b>boxes</b> 111:22
180:8 182:12,25	136:6 137:9	<b>beyond</b> 16:3,18	<b>break</b> 19:8,9 48:14
183:2 185:19	141:10 142:15	17:4 21:20 22:20	48:16 49:1 79:19
186:11	bearing 129:14	25:6 27:4,13 38:6	113:4 151:6
axe 121:1	134:25	41:8 42:20 43:21	179:24
b	bears 33:3 134:19	43:23 45:18 47:12	breakout 164:17
<b>b</b> 1:12 6:15 8:8,15	134:21 136:5	47:19 48:4 49:7	164:21
9:1,4 10:1 11:1	142:14,16	49:18 50:22 51:3	breaks 19:6
17:18 36:12 37:14	<b>began</b> 116:7	58:13 59:19 63:22	<b>bridgett</b> 47:2,5
	beginning 12:13	88:9 89:6,18 91:3	52:2 90:19,23
146:25 148:11		· ·	
146:25 148:11 150:21 151:3	91:24	99:21 100:18,25	<b>brokers</b> 125:10
150:21 151:3	91:24 <b>begins</b> 119:8	99:21 100:18,25 101:22 102:19	158:15
150:21 151:3 192:1	91:24 begins 119:8 behalf 2:16 12:17	99:21 100:18,25 101:22 102:19 106:13 108:1,4,15	158:15 <b>brought</b> 180:8
150:21 151:3 192:1 <b>back</b> 23:16,18	91:24 <b>begins</b> 119:8 <b>behalf</b> 2:16 12:17 12:23 13:4 14:16	99:21 100:18,25 101:22 102:19 106:13 108:1,4,15 110:18 111:5,15	158:15 <b>brought</b> 180:8 185:6,19 186:3
150:21 151:3 192:1 <b>back</b> 23:16,18 26:25 29:20 48:21	91:24 begins 119:8 behalf 2:16 12:17 12:23 13:4 14:16 19:14,18,24 21:13	99:21 100:18,25 101:22 102:19 106:13 108:1,4,15 110:18 111:5,15 111:23 112:7	158:15 <b>brought</b> 180:8 185:6,19 186:3 <b>bullet</b> 65:7 67:8,13
150:21 151:3 192:1 <b>back</b> 23:16,18 26:25 29:20 48:21 63:13,19 67:8	91:24 begins 119:8 behalf 2:16 12:17 12:23 13:4 14:16 19:14,18,24 21:13 26:11 34:6 112:18	99:21 100:18,25 101:22 102:19 106:13 108:1,4,15 110:18 111:5,15 111:23 112:7 113:2,25 116:9	158:15 <b>brought</b> 180:8 185:6,19 186:3 <b>bullet</b> 65:7 67:8,13 68:21 70:19 71:6
150:21 151:3 192:1 <b>back</b> 23:16,18 26:25 29:20 48:21 63:13,19 67:8 68:21 69:5 76:6	91:24 begins 119:8 behalf 2:16 12:17 12:23 13:4 14:16 19:14,18,24 21:13 26:11 34:6 112:18 148:17	99:21 100:18,25 101:22 102:19 106:13 108:1,4,15 110:18 111:5,15 111:23 112:7 113:2,25 116:9 122:1 126:15,22	158:15 <b>brought</b> 180:8 185:6,19 186:3 <b>bullet</b> 65:7 67:8,13 68:21 70:19 71:6 76:20 77:23 97:8
150:21 151:3 192:1 <b>back</b> 23:16,18 26:25 29:20 48:21 63:13,19 67:8 68:21 69:5 76:6 79:25 80:11 90:10	91:24 begins 119:8 behalf 2:16 12:17 12:23 13:4 14:16 19:14,18,24 21:13 26:11 34:6 112:18 148:17 belief 49:24 100:7	99:21 100:18,25 101:22 102:19 106:13 108:1,4,15 110:18 111:5,15 111:23 112:7 113:2,25 116:9 122:1 126:15,22 127:10 130:11	158:15 brought 180:8 185:6,19 186:3 bullet 65:7 67:8,13 68:21 70:19 71:6 76:20 77:23 97:8 99:8 126:7
150:21 151:3 192:1 <b>back</b> 23:16,18 26:25 29:20 48:21 63:13,19 67:8 68:21 69:5 76:6 79:25 80:11 90:10 91:11 102:25	91:24 begins 119:8 behalf 2:16 12:17 12:23 13:4 14:16 19:14,18,24 21:13 26:11 34:6 112:18 148:17 belief 49:24 100:7 believe 18:7 19:15	99:21 100:18,25 101:22 102:19 106:13 108:1,4,15 110:18 111:5,15 111:23 112:7 113:2,25 116:9 122:1 126:15,22 127:10 130:11 142:2 143:2	158:15 <b>brought</b> 180:8 185:6,19 186:3 <b>bullet</b> 65:7 67:8,13 68:21 70:19 71:6 76:20 77:23 97:8
150:21 151:3 192:1 <b>back</b> 23:16,18 26:25 29:20 48:21 63:13,19 67:8 68:21 69:5 76:6 79:25 80:11 90:10	91:24 begins 119:8 behalf 2:16 12:17 12:23 13:4 14:16 19:14,18,24 21:13 26:11 34:6 112:18 148:17 belief 49:24 100:7	99:21 100:18,25 101:22 102:19 106:13 108:1,4,15 110:18 111:5,15 111:23 112:7 113:2,25 116:9 122:1 126:15,22 127:10 130:11	158:15 brought 180:8 185:6,19 186:3 bullet 65:7 67:8,13 68:21 70:19 71:6 76:20 77:23 97:8 99:8 126:7

#### [burke - collect]

<b>burke</b> 47:3,5 52:2	<b>card</b> 146:7	<b>central</b> 182:7,8,12	class 139:5 161:21
90:19,23	cari 4:5 12:20	182:17,18,22,24	161:24 162:25
business 105:13	case 1:5 2:4 14:11	183:3	163:3,6,12,18
105:17 107:23	14:23 15:3,5,7	centralized 182:10	165:24 166:7
c	21:14 37:19 38:12	certain 86:21	170:14 171:11
_	48:3 51:25 69:2,9	107:22 111:2	172:5,14 177:1,22
ca 191:9,12,20	69:12 72:22 83:3	148:6 168:5,7	178:13 181:20
<b>california</b> 1:2,15 1:21 2:2,17 3:12	89:5 91:24 92:5,8	170:19	183:6
	93:5,6 102:4	certainly 24:25	claufenberg 4:12
5:9,16 6:10,19 12:1	107:6,17 108:23	184:3	<b>clean</b> 46:25
call 38:19 64:12,15	109:9 113:22	certified 2:20,21	clear 18:17,22
164:8 165:6,16,22	114:4,14 117:14	190:2,3	61:10 62:22 73:7
165:23 178:12	121:2,25 123:19	<b>certify</b> 190:4,17	84:3 186:14
181:1,18	126:19,21 127:5	cetera 21:7 31:11	client 98:8 124:15
called 39:12 64:14	128:2,16 133:12	31:25	<b>cloud</b> 121:4,7,15
83:4 84:25 85:5	151:15 152:6,10	<b>chance</b> 114:16	121:20,21
116:23 128:12	154:2 156:5,12	<b>change</b> 141:18	cocounsel 12:20
141:7 143:18	161:20 162:25	194:4,7,10,13,16	<b>code</b> 191:9,12,19
166:16,21 175:19	163:13,18,23	194:19	191:20
<b>cambridge</b> 16:23	164:10 165:8	changed 34:12	<b>cogent</b> 18:17
17:9,11 21:23	167:8,10 169:20	changes 137:19	<b>cold</b> 71:23 72:3,7
22:2,24 23:13	177:1,23 178:14	<b>chart</b> 66:5	72:13,15,17,22,25
29:9,15 46:4	179:5 180:9,15	<b>chat</b> 9:14 104:17	73:11,15 74:9,13
69:15 75:23 76:5	181:3,21 190:15	110:13 117:1	74:14,22 84:13
82:15 93:4,10,12	cast 137:21	<b>chats</b> 117:6 119:9	87:7 183:14,19,21
101:10 124:20,22	<b>catch</b> 31:16	119:17,19	184:1,13,19 185:6
124:24 128:21	categories 148:1	<b>chen</b> 7:5 13:2 17:6	185:19 186:4,9,13
159:22 160:17	category 139:5	cheryl 47:3	186:18,25 187:11
161:14 171:2,9,14	141:6	city 144:23	187:14,19 188:5,9
171:20 174:17,23	cause 72:12	<b>civil</b> 8:15 191:19	188:13
campen 4:5	caution 23:23	191:20	collaborate 28:25
capability 87:15	41:10 61:5 78:6	clarification 95:14	29:5
capable 18:16	92:16 93:15 100:9	95:20	collaboration
captured 40:3	<b>ccp</b> 191:9,12	<b>clarify</b> 125:15	124:22
42:7,14 59:12	ccr 1:20,22,23	140:19	collaborative 25:1
62:4 67:9 68:24	190:24	clarifying 89:10	27:20
85:17 110:12	cell 139:10,15	98:4 121:12	colleagues 12:25
154:6,18 156:16	centra 85:5,7,23	clarity 13:6 22:25	<b>collect</b> 16:2 42:17
159:16	86:2,14,15,22 87:1	59:13 181:12	56:10,14,17,24
captures 54:1	87:10 88:14,17,21	<b>clark</b> 22:8 25:10	57:22 65:2,3
67:18	89:4,11,23 90:2,7		121:17,18 122:25
020			

#### [collect - copy]

123:15 150:16	141:7 166:3 175:4	confidentiality	contain 40:8 64:24
152:16 153:19	178:19	141:16 189:7	74:13,14 84:24
collected 65:4	community 87:25	confirm 134:2	85:11
121:19,24 123:20	88:5,8	174:11,16,21	contained 42:4
123:25 140:8	companies 158:15	confirmation 38:2	61:23 82:10
collecting 21:13	168:20	confused 62:9	111:14 156:20,24
27:1,11	company 29:13	136:2	158:12 160:9
collection 15:10	32:14 34:1,3,11	connection 99:19	164:4 168:22
16:8,14,16 21:18	36:16 41:13 49:20	109:17 123:7	193:4
24:4 31:12 32:1	68:2 85:21 101:8	127:23	containing 188:4
120:5	118:9 119:24	consecutive 136:6	contains 85:2
colorado 5:18	121:3 132:3 178:6	consent 131:22	<b>content</b> 26:1,22
<b>column</b> 137:16	187:6	132:16,19,22	31:13 32:2 123:22
141:12	company's 33:22	133:23 137:11,14	147:11
columns 139:7	33:23	137:18,21,22,24	contents 92:16
combined 145:9	compared 53:3	138:4	93:16 94:11 96:2
come 22:6 85:10	54:15	consents 132:20	97:21 143:5
86:19,22 90:10	complaint 163:7	135:24 137:6	178:18
140:10 186:22	168:3	139:11 140:8	context 93:18
<b>comes</b> 76:16	completed 191:7	consider 139:3	155:11 167:18
comfortable 46:17	191:17 192:6	180:25 181:18	continue 36:25
commencing 2:17	completion 190:15	consistent 92:3	74:10
<b>comment</b> 135:21	192:10	146:18	continued 52:20
comments 95:22	compliance	constantly 72:24	continuing 23:9
<b>common</b> 166:21	143:15	constitute 137:6	contracts 131:14
commonly 50:20	complied 152:6	constituted 98:8	<b>control</b> 159:24
communicate	complies 13:17	constitutes 132:22	161:8
103:7 152:7	complying 149:24	137:20	controlled 141:19
communicating	comprehensive	construct 94:2	controls 57:10
105:16,16	179:22	consult 164:16	conversations
communication	computer 68:5	180:25 181:18	66:18 92:17 95:8
94:13 101:4	153:9	consulting 52:3	95:12 143:5
105:13 106:16	<b>conduct</b> 152:14	75:5 127:15	180:14,16 181:6
communications	conducted 133:18	<b>consumer</b> 1:5 2:4	<b>cookie</b> 156:9,24
9:20 23:24 32:13	182:2	12:8 131:13 132:9	<b>cookies</b> 156:11,13
32:13 41:11 47:23	conducting 94:23	144:20 191:4	copies 13:11
78:8 99:15 100:11	105:17	194:1	<b>copy</b> 72:25 91:17
103:12 104:14	conducts 70:8	<b>cont'd</b> 5:1 6:1 7:1	122:13,19,23,24
105:3,14 106:24	conferred 68:18	9:1 10:1 11:1	123:1,3,7,14,18,21
107:3,5,16 108:7	confidential 1:10	<b>contact</b> 144:23	123:22 136:11
118:4 131:23	189:7	191:9	137:20,23,24

#### [copy - data]

175:15 177:16	13:11,13 15:8	<b>covid</b> 87:2	129:6 133:20
<b>cor</b> 37:9	16:10,10,22,24	created 51:25 56:2	151:14,18 152:7
<b>corner</b> 137:10	17:7,8,10 21:17	107:7 128:1 148:2	152:10,21 153:8
corporate 1:13	23:11,14 25:2	148:5	159:24 160:7
14:15 19:14	26:15 27:20,21	<b>credit</b> 145:7 146:7	161:9 165:19
<b>correct</b> 14:16,23	28:18 30:1 31:17	<b>cross</b> 187:6	168:5,18 171:14
14:24 15:18,21	35:14 36:2 37:18	<b>crutcher</b> 4:16 5:5	171:15,17 173:3
18:1 21:15 22:10	39:4 64:2 70:8	6:5 117:13	<b>custody</b> 159:24
22:15 30:21 32:25	75:16 76:7 82:9	csr 1:20,21,22	161:8
40:21 43:16 48:24	92:17,19 95:2,3,14	190:25	<b>cut</b> 167:15 168:7
52:4 53:12 59:15	95:19 96:7 98:3	<b>curb</b> 95:21	171:2
59:16 60:6,7 63:6	98:11 114:4	<b>current</b> 34:7 43:15	d
63:7,11,12,16,17	115:10,14,22	43:17 81:7	<b>d</b> 8:1 14:11 46:5
66:11 68:11,20	116:13 125:20,21	currently 17:7	140:11,12
69:23 78:22 81:9	133:19 143:6,8	44:24 63:8 149:5	daily 117:5
82:22 84:7,9 88:6	180:15 182:3,3	custodial 161:10	dallas 4:21
90:17,25 93:2,3	191:18,21 192:7	170:10 177:20	daniel 6:15 140:12
94:24 98:11,12	counsel's 126:1	182:6,16	142:7
101:21 105:6,11	143:10	custodially 182:11	data 26:1,21 31:13
105:12 107:17	<b>couple</b> 98:21	custodian 70:9	32:2,13 38:25
109:6 110:7,25	course 23:25	99:24 102:7 109:2	44:23 45:12,17,25
113:18 114:4	33:17 36:3 41:12	109:19,25 110:6,9	46:3 64:15,17,20
119:16 121:11,23	52:18 66:19 70:5	118:24 120:7	67:9,17,18 68:3,5
132:4 137:7	107:23 143:6	122:5,23 123:12	68:8,24 69:1,8,11
140:14,17,22	153:7 166:4 177:3	123:13 128:1	69:19,20,24 70:17
148:10 155:19	<b>court</b> 1:1 2:1,21	151:18 152:12,13	71:14,16,19,22,23
159:4 169:10,23	13:5,15,18 17:22	152:14 153:14,18	72:6,12,19 73:12
170:20 175:5	32:16 46:19 52:10	153:22 177:4	73:15,24 74:9,13
193:5	103:20 104:22	182:2	74:20,23 75:6,16
corrected 81:14	114:9 116:17	custodians 16:12	76:8,11 77:12,14
193:5	129:11 130:19	16:13 24:21,23,25	80:10 82:9 83:7,9
corrections 191:14	134:13,16 142:12	25:14 27:1,10,18	83:10,19 84:11,16
191:15 192:3,4	190:3	28:9,12,17,19,22	84:20,24 85:12
193:3	<b>cover</b> 152:19	29:10,15,16 70:7	88:3,5,8,14 89:12
correspondence	covered 130:8	82:16 83:25 84:7	89:22 90:2 97:9
30:4 36:7,13 37:9	137:19 141:16	92:11 97:1 99:19	98:21 102:8 106:8
114:3 115:1,11	143:19,23 144:2,6	101:25 102:3,8,10	118:7,10 121:3,5,9
corresponding	144:11,14,18	103:6 119:1	121:15 123:24,24
136:9	145:14,20 148:9	121:13 122:21	124:23 125:2,4,10
<b>counsel</b> 3:1 4:1 5:1	148:14,16,18,23	123:22 126:25	125:10 131:15
6:1 7:5 12:13	149:3,7,8,16,19,20	128:8,9,15,20	151:17,18,19
			131.17,10,17

#### [data - deponent]

153:11,18 158:3,9	<b>day</b> 42:11 66:12	definitions 173:12	<b>deponent</b> 2:16 8:2
158:11,11,15,15	71:17,18 74:21	degree 15:12	13:17,23 16:20
158:19,21 159:1,4	184:18 190:21	<b>delete</b> 42:12 80:18	19:19,20 21:22
159:13,20,21,23	193:6	84:18 92:11 102:8	22:22 23:10 24:1
160:2,10,13,18	dayna 5:13	103:9 109:25	24:12 25:12 27:6
161:1,2,12,14	dayne 12:25 22:14	111:3,13,17,21	27:15 28:1,5,8,15
162:24 163:16,21	days 74:18 77:24	178:3	30:9 31:16 32:5
163:25 164:1,3	77:24	<b>deleted</b> 38:3,24	34:1,10 38:8 40:2
166:10,20,23	<b>debit</b> 145:7	42:5,14 65:9 71:7	41:14 42:22,25
168:7 169:5,9,18	december 10:8	71:12,21,23 72:20	43:25 45:1,20
170:2,11,19 171:2	117:12 179:8	73:14,16,16 74:21	47:14,25 48:6
171:12,17 172:4,6	<b>decision</b> 30:12,16	74:23 77:15,25	49:9,20 50:14,24
172:11,14,23	131:20	102:12,13 112:14	51:5,8,15 57:25
177:12,14,17,17	<b>decisions</b> 30:17,18	112:18 120:14	58:16 59:21 60:3
177:19 178:1,5,12	30:19	121:8,17,18,24	60:23 61:8 62:1
178:20,23 180:10	declaration 20:2	122:6 157:21	63:24 66:20 70:6
181:2,20 182:6,16	declarations 19:23	182:23 188:12	72:9 73:4 75:4,10
182:21 183:5,6,9	declare 193:1	deletes 42:10	77:20 78:10 79:11
183:13,17,19,21	<b>deemed</b> 152:11	120:23	83:22 84:15 88:12
183:25 184:4,6,11	defendant 8:13	deleting 90:5	88:23,25 89:8,14
184:18,23,23	20:19 21:5,5	<b>deletion</b> 98:16,19	89:25 90:5 91:5
185:19 186:4,9,11	110:25	99:2,7,16 178:2	92:22 93:21 97:15
186:12,17,18,25	defending 13:8	182:21 183:2	99:10,23 100:4,13
187:3,8,9,14,16,17	<b>define</b> 145:21	delightful 113:13	100:20 101:6,24
187:22,24,24	146:1	demonstrate	102:21 106:17
188:4,11,15,20	defined 109:5	137:25	108:4,11,17
<b>database</b> 64:10,12	147:8 148:14	denver 5:18	109:15 110:3,21
64:14	<b>defines</b> 91:13,16	departing 151:23	111:7,17,25 112:8
date 37:7 59:22	103:1 105:5,13	department 14:12	112:16,22 114:1
81:13 86:7 96:21	146:11	174:24 175:1,3,4	116:11 117:5
96:25 97:2 116:3	defining 95:16	179:2 185:16	120:7,21 122:4
145:7 190:20	125:16	departments	126:1,17,24
191:16 192:5	definition 45:12	173:13,23 179:1	127:11,17 128:5
194:24	72:17 80:12 92:2	179:17	128:11,19 130:13
<b>dated</b> 10:4,7	109:4 119:4 120:3	<b>depend</b> 183:24	130:24 131:9
114:12 117:12	143:18 144:10,14	184:3,10	132:11 133:6,15
179:8	144:18 145:20	dependent 184:21	135:1,13 142:4,18
<b>dates</b> 73:20	146:9,16,17,24	depending 31:4	143:10 144:5
datr 156:13,24	147:1,5 148:22	87:14 184:24	145:19 146:1,24
davis 3:7 12:18	149:3	depends 79:3	147:20 149:2,12
		88:25 187:7	150:12,25 151:5

#### [deponent - document]

152:24 153:2,6,14	depositions 12:7	determined	directors 113:20
154:13 155:10	deprecate 65:13	191:18,22 192:7	115:18,23
157:2,4 159:10	deprecated 65:24	develop 67:24	<b>disallowed</b> 170:18
160:22 161:1,18	166:12,14,22,25	68:12	disappear 103:9
161:23 162:5,13	<b>deprecates</b> 65:8	developer 94:8	disappears 105:10
162:22 163:2	deprecating	128:12 159:11	disclosures 37:19
164:12 165:14	166:16	171:15,21 175:21	discovery 14:11
166:6 167:5,25	deprecation 65:17	175:24	14:19,22 15:4
168:12 169:12	66:2	development	27:17 38:12 45:25
170:16,23 171:6	derek 4:6 12:20	175:10,14,21	50:16 64:4 69:20
172:2,8,19 173:1,7	describe 31:9,23	176:22	70:17 73:24 75:17
176:7,17 177:3,25	71:1,13 85:5	<b>device</b> 124:25	76:8,11,17 80:9
178:20 179:7,21	89:14 95:25	145:4 151:17,20	82:8 83:3,10
180:17 181:9,25	141:14	151:21,22,25	92:10 97:5 102:11
183:8,16,24	described 71:17	152:1,4 153:18	102:15 120:9
184:16 185:4,9,13	94:5 133:4 139:9	<b>devices</b> 118:11,12	121:16 122:25
185:23 186:1,7,21	139:15 150:20	151:16 152:18,19	123:15 133:19
187:3,14,22	151:2 161:15	152:20,21 153:3	152:15 153:19
188:19,23 189:4	176:22	153:11,19	158:19 159:1
deponent's 1:15	describes 141:13	dgarrie 6:21	183:1,17,17
deponents 190:7	149:23	<b>differ</b> 60:13	186:11 187:7,15
deposed 17:25	describing 148:1	difference 14:25	<b>discuss</b> 95:7,10
18:6	description 8:10	62:10	101:15 117:21
deposition 1:12	9:3 10:3 11:3	differences 62:2,5	discussed 119:14
2:15 8:12 9:4	30:17 69:16,16	62:7 65:1	154:3 170:1,10
12:20 13:8,14,20	96:14 97:24	different 39:23	discussing 49:1
17:19 18:13 19:7	132:25 176:9,19	61:13,24 62:12	70:12 78:21
20:8,19 34:16,21	descriptions	64:20 85:21 87:13	discussion 113:16
35:13,21 37:17,20	145:20	87:15,20 93:1	173:8
37:25 46:20 52:18	designations 189:8	145:3 187:5	discussions 28:23
54:25 68:4,13,19	<b>desktop</b> 153:9	difficult 43:6	53:9 68:3 77:3
74:4 92:8 93:19	desktops 118:11	187:17	125:9
93:23 95:11	destroy 80:18	difficulty 150:9	disposition 121:6
107:11,21 114:23	destruction	digital 159:5 160:5	133:9
115:3 116:15	113:23 115:16 116:8	direct 15:3 21:3	<b>district</b> 1:1,2 2:1,2
140:22 141:3		25:21 115:7	16:23 23:11 93:6
142:23 143:1 146:10 189:3	<b>detail</b> 54:19 63:3 <b>detailed</b> 36:18	117:23 137:8 173:9	101:10 <b>dloeser</b> 4:13
190:14 191:19,22	determine 71:2	direction 82:8	document 1:7 2:6
190:14 191:19,22	102:3	190:11	20:16 34:24 80:13
171.27 172.0,10	102.3	170.11	91:14 94:18,23
			71.17 77.10,43

#### [document - entails]

103:17 104:11	167:13 178:17	102:15 120:9	electronic 9:20
105:20,22 117:16	180:7,13 181:5,23	121:16 122:25	32:13 103:11
129:14 132:6,13	189:1 191:5 193:1	123:15 133:19	104:14 105:3,14
136:3 137:3	193:12 194:2,24	140:11,12 152:15	106:24 107:2,4,16
documents 23:4	dunn 4:16 5:5 6:5	153:19 158:19	108:6 122:18
25:25 26:21 29:7	10:4,7 12:23,25	159:1 183:1,17,17	electronically 32:8
31:13 32:2,12	16:24 21:16,23	186:11 187:7,7,15	32:10
35:25 36:5,10	22:3 23:10 25:1,3	191:9,12 192:1	email 9:14 37:15
37:3,4,12 91:17	26:15 30:1 36:2,8	194:3,3,3	74:17 77:4 86:7
102:12 121:7	36:11 37:10,13	<b>e.g.</b> 147:11	104:17 110:13
123:18 124:17	39:5 64:3 114:4	earlier 34:25 35:1	117:1 119:8,14
138:16 139:3,14	114:13 115:9,12	35:6 42:8 49:10	127:19 144:23
140:7 141:7 149:6	117:13 173:23	51:19 105:21,23	146:4
149:18,22 150:8	<b>dyi</b> 38:16,20 40:2	126:24 148:15	<b>emails</b> 114:22
150:20 151:2	40:5,9,10,13 41:7	182:25	117:5
download 41:18	41:18,23 42:5,7,10	early 39:8 87:3	employed 76:17
41:24 58:6,8	43:22 47:11 49:5	edi 128:8,15,20	employee 110:11
62:14 112:3,12	49:11,17,22,25	edification 163:5	110:11 178:3
downloaded 57:23	50:5,7,11,16,19	<b>effect</b> 30:18 34:11	190:18
58:12 160:5	51:2,20 53:3 54:9	80:4 106:20 107:3	employees 29:13
<b>drive</b> 121:1 182:13	54:15 55:7,13,14	130:1,15 131:3	36:15 43:15,17
182:19	61:12,24 62:4,10	132:8 133:3 138:2	95:25 101:8
driver's 145:5	62:13,25 63:4,8,10	138:10,12,13	111:17 115:16
146:5	63:21 64:17 65:4	142:21 143:16	151:23
dropbox 118:8	65:23 66:6,10,12	148:7	employer 30:14
121:1	83:17 84:2 85:17	effected 24:4	employment 14:8
<b>duffey</b> 1:13 2:15	86:16 90:21 154:5	effective 8:19 9:6	enforcement
8:3 12:7 13:15	154:18 156:16,25	9:9,15,21 10:11,17	39:18 40:25 41:1
14:1,7,10,14 17:25	158:2 164:4	11:5,14	41:4,6,16,21,22
23:22 32:22 33:17	dzhauser 5:20	<b>effort</b> 25:1 27:20	42:16 43:1,4,20
35:25 41:10 47:21	e	38:18 150:15	53:25 54:22 58:20
48:23 61:4 66:17	e 3:6 8:1,8 9:1 10:1	189:2	engaged 29:11
70:3 78:6 80:2	11:1 14:11,11,19	<b>efforts</b> 23:4,6	54:5
92:16 93:14 94:10	14:22 15:4 22:5	25:24 26:20 38:14	engineer 68:6
96:11 97:16 98:16	27:17 38:12,13	47:10	engineering 179:3
100:9 106:14	45:25 46:5,5	<b>eight</b> 18:4 19:21	engineers 180:25
113:12 125:12,20	50:16 64:4 69:20	63:8	181:18
125:23 135:5	70:17 73:24 75:17	either 25:12 61:16	ensure 166:23
136:7 143:4	76:8,11,17 80:9	90:7 104:4 127:18	ensuring 152:5
146:14 151:13	82:8 83:3,10	151:19 154:18	entails 31:20
165:5,11 166:2	92:10 97:5 102:11	177:4	

#### [enthusiasm - facebook]

enthusiasm 95:21	exact 19:25 37:7	33:3,19 34:7,17,23	experienced 153:8
entity 148:16	40:22 89:1	52:7,8,9,14,16,23	expertise 136:8
ephemeral 99:11	exactly 129:23	63:6 67:22 80:11	expires 105:10
99:12,14,20,25	187:20	80:25 81:6,10,19	<b>explain</b> 167:19
100:5,16,23	examination 8:2	82:4 83:20 91:12	explained 118:2
100:3,10,23	14:5	92:3,25 96:12	explanation 115:8
103:1,4,6,13 105:5	examined 14:2	101:16 102:25	138:22
105:1,4,0,13 105.5	example 42:5	103:19,23 104:6	explication 138:15
108:9,19,22 126:8	74:15 94:6 97:9	103:19,23 104.0	extent 29:1 47:21
126:13,20 127:1	97:13 119:22	104:10,20,21	76:9 93:17 141:14
errata 191:14,16	125:9 156:14	114:7,8 116:16,20	external 131:23
192:3,5	157:18 159:3	114.7,8 110.10,20	141:13
· ·	164:8 165:6	119:4 124:7 126:4	ev 127:22
escaping 22:4 esi 8:17 15:11 16:2	170:12 182:9	129:9,10,22	•
16:9,14,17 20:20	examples 42:8	130:10,18,22,25	f
21:13,18 22:19	excellent 96:10	130:10,18,22,23	<b>f</b> 14:11,11
24:4,17 25:25	113:15	131:1,7 132:7	facebook 1:4 2:3
26:21 27:1,11	exceptions 90:19	133.2 134.12,13	4:15 5:4 6:4 8:13
31:12 32:1,7,8	90:24 103:12	134.19,23 133.3,8	12:8,24 13:2
36:9 37:11 38:5	106:1,2,5 148:19	136:21,21,23,25	14:16 15:6,14
38:15 44:2,6,12,18	exchange 118:3	130.21,21,23,23	16:1,7 17:19
44:19,23 45:5	125:9	137.1 138.11,12	19:24 20:19 21:5
49:17 91:17 94:6	exchanged 112:4	140:13 141:6	21:5,13 26:11
99:3,19 102:12	112:14	140.13 141.0	28:17 29:8,10
109:2 119:13	exclude 178:18	142:10,11,19	33:24 34:6,12
120:5 121:24	180:13 181:8	147:3 173:10,20	35:7 39:17,22
120.5 121.24	excluding 145:13	exhibits 20:7	40:5,8,12,17,20
178:1 182:7,17	exclusively 24:24	134:19 135:6,9,22	41:5 44:1,5,11
especially 184:17	excuse 87:3 143:4	134.19 133.0,3,22	47:9,15 50:10
established 56:1	executed 193:6	exist 35:1 45:12	55:19,21 58:9,25
estimate 184:11	executive 100:16	74:10	61:21 62:3,4,14,16
et 21:7 31:11,25	executives 111:13	existed 44:24 45:9	62:17,19 63:20
events 36:20	113:21 115:19,23	45:11 130:16	65:6,8 69:22
124:20	<b>exempted</b> 106:10	169:19	72:21 73:22 81:8
everstore 166:16	168:6	existence 56:2	81:16 83:19 84:4
166:19	<b>exhibit</b> 8:11,19 9:4	130:14	84:7,10 85:6,7
everybody 12:15	9:14,20 10:4,7,10	existing 74:12	86:4,13 91:1 92:4
46:17 163:5	10:16 11:4,10,13	103:8	94:16,21,22
evidence 168:5	17:17,21 20:6,12	experience 50:25	100:16 101:14
evolved 68:1	25:19 29:21,21,23	51:22	102:2 109:23
2.02.00.1	30:6 32:15,19,20	32.22	110:1,10,12 111:4
	3 2 2 2 2 2 2 3 2 7 7 7 9		111:12,13,18,21

#### [facebook - financial]

			1011010=110
112:2,4,12,13,19	146:19 147:16	97:16 98:1,11,12	186:19 187:1,12
118:3,3,4,6,9	148:22 149:2	99:9,21 100:3,8,18	187:21 188:16
119:23,25 122:9,9	170:2,12 171:2	100:25 101:22	189:5 191:1
122:12 123:2,6	183:12 186:17	102:19 106:12	<b>fall</b> 59:1,6 60:6,9
124:16,21,23	<b>facial</b> 18:10	108:1,10,15	60:14,16,20 61:3
125:1,7 127:3,7,14	facilities 106:8	109:11 110:2,18	<b>falls</b> 97:9
128:1,8 132:2	<b>fact</b> 20:3 38:20	111:5,15,23 112:6	familiar 20:6
133:3,24 137:14	failures 153:22	112:15,21 113:2,6	78:17 85:11,13
139:11,14 142:1	<b>fair</b> 18:23,24 19:3	113:24 114:22	116:22 117:17
143:24 145:14	19:4,10,11 31:6,9	115:1 116:9 117:4	154:25 155:7,18
147:10 148:3,17	31:23 32:5 44:10	117:20 120:6,19	155:21,23,24
149:7,19 150:20	50:18 53:16 57:7	122:1 125:11,23	156:9
151:2,15 152:6,9	58:3 64:12,15	126:15,22 127:9	<b>fb.com</b> 127:19
152:20,21 153:6	67:3,4 77:17	127:16 128:3,10	<b>feature</b> 65:18,24
153:25 154:4,14	146:25 155:16	128:17 130:11	66:1,4 116:8
155:15,18 156:3	<b>fairly</b> 107:21	131:8 132:10	126:13
156:11 157:7,12	falconer 4:17	133:5,13 135:12	features 65:8
157:17,23 158:8	12:22,23 16:3,18	142:2 143:2 144:3	113:23 115:16
158:10,20 159:5	17:4 21:20,24	145:16,24 146:20	federal 8:14
159:12,19 160:4	22:20 23:8,22	147:18 148:24	190:14 192:1,8,9
160:12 161:13,19	24:10 25:6,11	149:10 150:1,6,10	<b>feel</b> 175:19
161:25 162:1,7,9	27:4,13,25 28:4,7	150:22 151:4	<b>fields</b> 69:16 87:18
162:17,19,23	28:14 30:8 31:15	152:23,25 153:5	<b>fifth</b> 96:17 141:12
163:5,10,15,20	32:4 33:11,14,25	153:13 154:10	<b>file</b> 11:11 33:8
164:7 165:5,22	34:9 38:6 40:1	155:9 157:1,3	43:22 133:25
166:9,15,22	41:8 42:20,24	159:7 160:19,25	134:4,24 137:2
167:21 168:14	43:23 44:25 45:18	161:16,22 162:3	139:3 149:14
169:3,18 170:1,4	47:12,19 48:4,9,13	162:11,21 163:1	150:14
170:11,14,18,25	49:7,18 50:13,22	164:11,15,18	<b>filed</b> 37:19
171:10,22 172:3,5	51:3,7,14 57:24	165:9 166:1 167:2	files 51:21 122:14
172:13,20 176:24	58:13 59:19 60:2	167:23 168:9	122:17,18,19,23
178:10 180:8,23	60:22 61:4,25	169:11,21 170:15	122:24 123:1,3,7
181:16,17 182:7	63:22 66:16 70:3	170:21 171:4,25	123:14,21,23
182:10,17 183:4	72:8 73:3 74:1,3	172:7,16,24 173:6	156:25 166:17
184:7 185:5,19	75:3,9 77:19 78:6	173:15,18,21	170:10 177:20
186:3 191:4 194:1	79:10,21 83:21	176:5,10 177:2,24	<b>filing</b> 16:9,17
facebook's 1:12	84:14 88:9,22,24	178:15 179:6,19	111:10 172:21
19:14,18 26:20	89:6,13,16,21,24	180:11 181:4,22	<b>final</b> 189:7
31:10,24 34:7	90:4 91:3 92:15	183:7,15,22	financial 145:6
84:17 91:7 94:17	93:14 94:9,19,25	184:14 185:3,8,11	182:9
124:15,25 145:22	95:4,19,23 97:14	185:21,25 186:5	
,	, , -		

### [financially - going]

0 11 100 17	50 10 55 04 50 00	0 . 05.15.100.15	10.05.16.04.01.16
financially 190:17	50:13 57:24 60:22	<b>front</b> 35:15 103:17	12:25 16:24 21:16
<b>find</b> 29:7 64:1 97:4	61:25 72:8 73:3	172:10	21:23 22:3 23:10
108:13 140:7	75:3,9 77:19	ftc 11:13 23:13	25:1,3 26:15 30:1
142:25	79:10 83:21 84:14	93:8 132:23	36:2,7,11 37:9,13
<b>fine</b> 48:12,17	88:22 99:9 100:12	141:17 142:17,20	39:5 64:3 114:4
81:14 95:15 134:9	101:5 110:2 112:6	150:14	114:13 115:9,12
140:19 150:6	113:24 117:4	ftc's 143:15 148:6	117:13 173:23
<b>finish</b> 150:4	120:6,19 128:3,10	ftco 147:23 149:23	gibsondunn.com
<b>firm</b> 12:19 23:15	128:17 131:8	<b>fti</b> 127:8,15,18	4:23 5:11,20,21
23:21 24:6,22	132:10 133:5,13	<b>full</b> 14:8 156:13	6:12 191:2
<b>first</b> 19:15 22:4	144:3 145:16	function 20:7	<b>give</b> 13:20 33:11
49:5 50:15 60:6	147:18 148:24	117:3 176:3	67:12 75:4 79:5
66:12 81:11,15	149:10 150:22	functional 187:6	119:12 155:11
86:19,22 87:1	153:13 155:9	functions 21:10	173:15 184:11
91:24 92:6 106:20	159:9 160:25	further 95:22	<b>given</b> 74:4 190:12
107:3,7 128:25	161:22 162:11,21	141:5 149:15	<b>giving</b> 143:6
129:6 130:1 131:3	163:1 164:11	188:22 190:13,17	<b>go</b> 16:5 24:11
131:11 135:21	165:10 166:1	g	35:23 58:15 69:5
144:21 146:13	167:2 169:11		88:11,13,24 89:19
162:16	170:15 172:7,17	<b>g</b> 46:5,5,5,6 149:22	108:3 110:20
<b>fischer</b> 47:3 90:21	177:2,24 178:16	garrie 6:15 13:3,4	119:12 120:20
90:23	179:6,19 180:11	37:16 95:2,5,6,17	122:3 128:4,18
<b>five</b> 179:25	181:4,22 183:7,15	96:5 98:2,6,13	133:14 136:20
<b>floor</b> 6:18	187:12	125:18	144:4 145:18
<b>flown</b> 87:4	<b>formal</b> 35:9 81:8	gay 15:15	146:13 147:19
<b>flows</b> 137:22	130:16	general 7:5 24:2	149:1,11 150:23
<b>focus</b> 15:9	formally 175:23	30:17,24 31:1,19	153:1 154:12
focused 23:3	former 66:4	70:6 79:7 87:12	160:21 162:12
<b>follow</b> 97:25 112:9	<b>forth</b> 92:3 146:17	93:23 94:2 96:1	164:17,19,21,22
143:10	149:9 190:7	106:11 168:12	167:4 168:11
<b>followed</b> 136:13	forward 91:2	177:25	176:15 179:20,25
following 111:10	95:10 96:9 125:19	generally 30:7	188:18 189:9
171:2,8	163:6	generate 129:5	goes 43:21 77:4
<b>follows</b> 14:3 191:8	<b>four</b> 36:3	generated 101:17	83:24 187:4
fonti 3:5 12:16	<b>fourth</b> 137:16	147:11	going 26:25 32:22
foregoing 190:5,7	framework 93:19	geolocation	43:6 48:10 67:16
190:11,13 193:2	francisco 6:10	144:21	68:21 71:19 73:6
forensic 152:2	frcp 192:1	gerardo 46:5	74:2,25 91:2
form 24:10 30:8	frequently 79:9,13	68:10 76:13,16	92:15 94:9,14
31:15 32:4 33:25	friends 54:3,4 56:5	getting 81:12	95:7 106:12
34:9 40:1 44:25	56:8 157:22	<b>gibson</b> 4:16 5:5	109:11 125:11
31.7 10.1 77.23	30.0 137.22	6:5 10:4,7 12:23	107.11 123.11

#### [going - hold]

130:15 135:7 139:20 147:2	guidelines 31:10 31:24 h	116:18 129:12 130:20 134:14,17	69:17 70:10,13,21 71:4,8,15,20 72:6
139:20 147:2		·	
	- 11	142:13	72:11,19,19 73:9
149:4 150:1 159:7		<b>high</b> 188:3	73:19,21 74:21
160:19 165:9	<b>h</b> 4:17 8:8 9:1 10:1	highly 106:5	75:2,8,12,18,22
172:16 178:15	11:1 140:11 191:1	hipchat 113:22	76:22 77:6,10,14
<b>good</b> 12:15,22	194:3	115:15	78:4,13,16,24 79:4
14:7 73:7 74:7	hailemariam	historical 154:17	79:6,8,17 80:4,7,8
google 121:1	140:11,13	hive 67:9,15,17,25	80:12,23,24,25
182:13 10	hand 13:16 137:10	68:1,7,13,18,24	81:3,7,8,15,20,21
govern 1/6:6	<b>handful</b> 36:10	69:1,9,11,13,17,23	81:22 82:5,12,15
governonce 140:1	handled 191:8	70:1,10,11,20 71:3	82:16,20,23,24
140:5	hannah 5:14 12:25	71:3,16,18,19,25	83:2,4,10,15,23,24
government	22:14 harrar 25:20	72:7,19,19 73:13	84:6,6 92:5,7,9,13
131:16 145:6	<b>happen</b> 35:20	73:18 74:23 75:1	93:1,5,10,13,16,23
146:6	168:1	75:8,11,11,14,17	94:3,5,12,15 96:1
grand 5:8	<b>happened</b> 59:6 81:22	75:21 76:21 77:5	96:17 97:6,10,22
graph 167:22	V	77:8,10,11,18	101:10,15,18
168./16	happens 65:10	78:17,20,24 79:3,8	102:4 103:5
TORON 15:15	<b>happy</b> 94:25 95:24 <b>hard</b> 91:17 122:13	79:12 80:4,10	108:23 109:8,14
great 15:24 22:16		81:2,2,5,20 82:5	110:22,23 113:21
33:10 104:8	122:19,23,24	82:10,25 83:5,9,23	115:17 119:1
155:17	123:1,3,7,13,18,20 123:22 177:16	83:23 84:5,12	121:2 124:17
grounds 94:11	hashed 156:23	154:9,21 156:7,18	125:14,17 126:6
125.25	hauser 5:13 12:25	158:12 159:2,16	126:19 128:2,12
<b>group</b> 40:12 55:24	22:14	160:2,10 161:2	128:15,21,25
56:1 120:8,10,14	head 19:2	163:24 165:16	129:5,6 133:8
120.23 24 128.7	heading 65:6	168:23,24 169:1	151:14,21,23
graine /10.6 x 53./1	hear 97:18 104:3,4	169:25 170:9	152:5 154:22
55:4,13,15,17,19	173:7	171:19 177:5,6,18	156:7,19 159:18
55:21 59:1,9,10	heard 155:10	177:20 178:22	159:25 160:7
60:17 118:8 119:9	167:9,16 180:20	183:9,13,18 184:4	161:9 162:7,16,20
119:17,20,21,22	180:20 181:9	184:6,12,17 187:4	163:25 165:18
119:25 120:2,4,8	186:9	187:10,24 188:3,8	168:19 169:2,19
120:12 179:15	<b>held</b> 163:5	188:11	171:13,15,19
grow 18/1·18	help 36:16 70:9	<b>hold</b> 8:19 9:5,9	173:2,2,4,24 174:7
<b>growth</b> 179:3	<b>helpful</b> 31:22 68:6	15:12 16:12 27:18	174:12,18,22,25
guess 123:17	77:16 129:18	33:22 34:8,17,17	175:2,5,12,16
138:22	hereto 17:23 32:17	34:22 35:7,10	177:7,11,13
guidance 108:5	52:11 103:21	36:8 37:10 67:10	178:21,22 179:4
	104:23 114:10	68:24 69:2,9,12,14	179:12,15,17

#### [hold - information]

100 10 104 10	161.01		1510
183:19 184:18	161:21	immediately	174:9
185:7 187:24	identified 16:13	136:13	informal 130:7
188:11	24:25 28:17 29:23	impediment 48:2	information 23:24
<b>holds</b> 83:4,13	42:8 47:6 63:20	59:25 67:2	25:25 26:1,21,22
91:23 96:14 98:20	75:14 83:20 84:5	implemented 49:6	31:13,14 32:2,3,9
117:7 124:11	91:18 99:19	130:10 181:16	32:11 36:18 38:18
125:8 127:3,20	114:21 115:1	implementing	39:5,8,17,22 40:3
183:14	118:10 124:10	180:23	40:5,11,13,19,23
hopefully 31:22	128:8 138:16	improperly	41:19 42:4,18
<b>hour</b> 48:11 79:20	140:13,24 152:10	171:11	43:21 44:14 45:9
150:2	152:15 162:18	inaccurate 175:8	53:3,4,20 54:1,8
<b>hours</b> 36:3	173:13,23 177:5	inaudible 180:9	54:12 55:3,6,12,15
<b>house</b> 15:7 16:10	identifier 144:24	<b>incident</b> 131:17,18	56:10,13,18,23
16:22 17:7,8,10	145:2 155:7,14	<b>include</b> 42:5 54:3	57:2,13,15,22 61:1
25:2 27:16,21	identifiers 155:25	79:8 109:20	62:14,16 64:1,4,24
28:18 70:8 75:15	156:4	110:15 115:15	65:3,25 66:3,18
133:19 182:3	identifies 59:2	125:9 152:17	73:25 74:2,16,17
howrey 15:19,22	120:8 122:24	included 94:6	78:7 80:19 85:2,7
hregan 5:21	123:13 153:18	125:13 191:14	85:16 86:3,3,5,10
<b>huh</b> 53:22 78:2	identify 12:13	192:3	86:13,15 87:18
174:5	16:1,11 21:17	includes 117:7	88:16 89:1 90:6,9
<b>human</b> 179:2	24:17,22 25:17,24	122:23 144:19	91:14,16,23 92:3,4
i	26:20 28:19,21	158:14	92:12 94:7 96:25
<b>i.e.</b> 147:9	30:14 39:6 43:3	including 26:1	97:6 100:11 101:3
ian 7:5 13:2 17:6	58:12 69:1,22,25	29:14 45:11 110:7	102:8,11 103:7,8
idata 70:20,24	70:9 101:19,24	118:8,11 121:15	106:6,15 109:4,20
77:9	109:1 144:22	124:20 139:4	110:6 112:3,13
idea 184:20	146:3 149:6,18	141:17 144:20	119:5 120:3,24
identifiable 74:16	158:8 161:13	156:13 187:7	121:14 122:22
88:16	163:11 170:3,13	incomplete 141:22	137:20 139:4
identification	172:5 176:24	indicated 117:20	140:1,5 141:16,20
15:10 16:8,16	177:21 178:12	122:5	143:19,23 144:2,7
17:22 22:18 24:21	identifying 16:11	indicates 35:3	144:11,19,19,21
25:14 26:25 27:9	21:12 22:12 29:16	70:21 81:11	144:24 145:7,8,8
28:9,11 29:10	70:7 168:4	individual 41:5	145:10,13,14,15
32:16 52:10	<b>image</b> 152:2	51:21 86:4 106:8	145:20,21,23
103:20 104:22	imagine 75:11	118:11 139:19	146:2,2,5,5,8,12
114:9 116:17	140:3	144:20 148:15	146:17,19 147:1,6
129:11 130:19	immediate 35:19	individuals 22:13	147:9,9,17 148:16
134:13,16 142:12	48:7	27:22 54:4 59:14	148:18 149:7,15
134:13,16 142:12		101:20 127:18	149:19 153:15,16
143.0 140.7			

#### [information - know]

152 22 154 5	160 0 171 16	24.16.27.2.12	. 1 47.0
153:23 154:5	160:8 171:16	24:16 27:2,12	jordan 47:3
156:6,15,17,19	177:11	28:3,8,11 29:9	josh 12:19 28:2
158:21 159:13,16	instruction 66:16	30:15 38:4,9,10	104:19 134:8,10
159:23 160:1,8,9	70:4 80:17 101:2	76:12 139:24	joshua 3:8
160:11,12 161:7	125:20,24 143:11	186:3,24	jsamra 3:16
161:10,20 163:11	166:2 181:23	involvement 29:14	<b>jsc</b> 1:6 2:4
163:12,17,21	instructions 126:2	involves 187:5	<b>june</b> 1:16 2:18
164:2,3,9 165:7,13	instructs 92:10	involving 15:9	8:20 9:6,9 12:1,6
165:15,18,19,23	integration 124:25	18:9 23:13	14:19 15:2 35:10
165:24 166:4	intended 175:20	<b>ip</b> 145:1	81:12,16,23 96:18
168:19,21,22,25	intending 91:1	issue 36:17 95:13	96:24 98:18 99:1
170:3,13 171:10	intentions 91:7	95:17 142:25	99:5 190:21 191:3
171:23 176:24,25	interact 56:3,7	<b>issued</b> 91:23,25	191:5
177:21 178:4,5,11	interacting 54:2	96:15,18 98:20	k
178:18 182:9	157:18	109:8 115:17,24	<b>k</b> 3:7 140:12
informed 33:7	interaction 157:22	119:1 126:6 145:6	<b>katie</b> 13:1 22:13
76:21 77:2 166:15	<b>interest</b> 55:25 56:6	146:6	
<b>initial</b> 37:18	interested 190:18	issues 23:16,20	<b>keep</b> 176:15 181:1 181:19
initially 110:25	interests 120:1	24:3,8,12 130:8	<b>keller</b> 4:4
initiated 148:18	interfaces 169:15	italics 115:11	
inquiries 94:23	internal 62:15	<b>items</b> 119:8	kellerrohrback.c
<b>inquiry</b> 131:14	84:17,20,21,22	121:17,18	4:12,13
132:9 133:18	85:11 118:8 125:2	j	<b>kept</b> 177:19,20 <b>kind</b> 142:1 161:12
instagram 18:9	interposed 115:10	-	
86:12	interrupting	<b>j</b> 43:11 46:5	kinds 42:6 119:13
instance 42:12	128:23	<b>jams</b> 6:14	138:16 149:21
50:15 55:25 57:11	interview 29:6	jamsadr.com 6:21	king 37:20,25
73:13 77:9 86:1,7	109:2 123:13	<b>january</b> 66:6,15	44:18 45:14
86:11 87:22 88:1	interviews 70:9	66:24 90:13 163:6	king's 38:5,15,17
90:19 99:16 106:5	102:7 152:14	jarvis 43:10	38:21,23 44:2,12
122:5 157:21	177:4 182:2	jason 47:2	44:15,23 45:17
187:24	investigation 93:9	<b>javier</b> 174:20	know 16:21 19:6,7
<b>instant</b> 144:24	94:8 128:13	<b>jen</b> 53:9	19:25 22:1 24:24
instinct 51:9	131:17,18 170:18	jennifer 38:13	28:5,24,25 30:10
instruct 94:9,14	171:16,21	53:10 54:20 60:25	31:4 32:12,24
97:16 102:7,9	investigations	<b>ji</b> 46:4 68:9 77:4	33:1,5 37:2,6,7
109:12 125:12	106:6 125:3	<b>job</b> 1:24 176:2	39:4,4 41:14,15,16
143:9 165:11	investigative	191:5 194:2	42:2,22,23 43:1,25
instructed 95:9,25	39:16 85:5,23	<b>jog</b> 74:25	44:19 45:20,21
97:1 98:7,14	<b>involved</b> 17:9	<b>john</b> 7:7 12:10	46:3,8,10 47:17,25
122:21 151:19	21:13,18 23:14	<b>join</b> 56:3 119:25	48:14 49:9 50:3
122.21 131.17	21.13,10 23.14		50:15,19,24 51:8

#### [know - letter]

		1.2.2.1.2	
53:8 54:6,7 55:11	139:21 140:6	125:13	80:23,24,25 81:3,7
56:3,9,15,19,20,22	141:25 142:4,5	<b>laptop</b> 153:7	81:8,15,20,21,22
56:25 57:14,18,25	143:7 144:7 146:6	<b>laptops</b> 118:11	82:5,9,11,15,20,23
58:16,17,18 60:23	150:17,25 151:5	<b>large</b> 166:17	82:24 83:2,4,4,10
60:24 62:5 63:24	151:18 154:23,24	late 39:8	83:12,15,23,24
63:25 64:2,4,5,13	155:3,6 156:3,18	laufenberg 4:5	84:6,6 91:19,23
64:13,25 66:14,22	157:2,4 158:7,14	12:21	92:5,7,9,13 93:1,5
69:18 70:1,15,25	158:17,24 160:15	<b>laura</b> 21:24	93:9,13,16,23 94:3
70:25 71:18,18,24	160:22,24 161:3	<b>law</b> 3:9 4:7,18 5:7	94:5,15 96:14
72:16 73:18,20	161:18,23 162:5	5:15 6:7 39:18	97:6 101:9,15,18
74:24,24 75:1,5,7	162:22 163:2,3,14	40:24 41:1,4,6,15	102:4,9,10 103:5
75:13,13,21 76:1,7	163:19 164:12	41:20,22 42:16	106:4 110:22,23
77:20 78:10 79:2	167:7 169:24	43:1,4,20 53:24	117:7 119:1
79:2,7,12,13,15,16	170:16,25 172:2,8	54:22 58:19	125:14 128:12,15
83:6 84:17 85:22	172:19 174:6,13	<b>lawsuit</b> 16:9,17	129:5,6 132:21
85:25 86:14,23,25	174:20 175:23	111:11 172:21	133:7,8 151:21,23
87:10,17,23 88:12	176:18,21 178:22	180:24 181:17	154:22 156:7,19
88:15 89:2,3,8,9	180:18,21 181:25	lawyers 13:9	159:25 160:7
89:25 90:1,8,20	182:1 183:8 184:2	<b>lead</b> 16:24 17:6	161:8 163:25
91:5,7 92:18,20	184:2,5,8,8,9,20	23:11	165:18 168:19
93:8,9,25 94:4	185:4,13,16 186:1	leadership 174:3,9	169:1 171:13,15
97:13 98:18 99:18	187:23 188:19	174:12,15	171:19 173:1,2,4
100:15 101:3,9	knowledge 15:25	leading 31:21	173:24 174:7,12
104:24 106:17	30:23,24 31:1	<b>learn</b> 36:16	174:17,22,24,24
107:6,20,23 108:5	46:2 57:4 101:4	learned 92:18	174:25 175:1,2,4
108:11,24,25	knows 46:17	143:8 180:14	175:12,16 177:7
109:8,15 111:1	kogan 159:3,11,13	<b>left</b> 137:10	177:11,13 178:21
112:16,17,22,24	160:13	<b>legal</b> 8:19 9:5,8	179:11,15,17
112:25 113:20	kogan's 124:21	14:12 15:8,12	183:14,19 184:17
114:15,21,25	kutscher 22:8	16:12 27:18 33:22	185:16 187:7,24
115:4 116:2,11	25:10	34:7,16,17,22 35:7	188:11 191:7
121:13 123:2,6,19	l	35:9 36:8 37:10	<b>lesley</b> 3:6 12:16
124:4 125:7	1 1:20 2:20 38:13	56:21 67:10 68:24	48:10 173:6
126:12,17,18		69:2,9,11,14 70:10	<b>letter</b> 10:4,7 26:15
127:6,7,24,25	38:13 140:11,12 190:1,24	70:13 71:3,15,20	30:1 114:12,19
128:11,11,14,24	, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,	72:6,11,19,19 73:9	115:5,8,9,13 116:3
129:2,3,3 132:12	l.l.p. 4:4	73:19,21 74:21	117:12 125:16
132:13 133:11,15	lady 182:23	75:12,17,22 77:10	128:25 151:14
133:16 134:2	laid 26:14 132:6	77:14 78:4,13,16	173:13 174:22
136:7 138:11,18	lana 43:8	78:24 79:4,6,8,17	179:7
139:1,5,13,17,18	language 93:16	80:4,7,8,12,17,19	
	97:22 109:14		

#### [letters - marked]

<b>letters</b> 117:20	115:17,24 120:5	184:2,12,20	maintains 141:15
127:4,8,14	121:2 122:20	longer 65:15 77:24	making 30:12,16
level 54:19 56:5	123:4,8 124:11,16	112:5 157:8,14,19	141:21
96:1 154:1,15,20	124:18 125:8,17	look 29:6 31:8	manage 15:3
155:3	126:6,19 127:3,20	52:6 86:3 114:6	management
license 145:5	127:23 128:2,21	133:25 135:6	10:11 11:13 14:12
146:5	128:25 139:16	142:9	129:25 130:6,9
life 159:6 160:5	150:9 151:14	looking 20:12,16	134:2,6 139:2
<b>limit</b> 95:21 165:12	152:5,22 153:12	25:19,22 29:21	142:17,20 144:8
limited 26:2	153:23 157:25	35:4 52:14,22	150:14 174:2,6,18
141:18 144:20	162:7,16,20	58:23 63:13,19	manager 14:11,18
182:11	166:12,14 169:19	66:5 67:21 70:18	14:23 38:12
line 81:1 191:15	179:4 185:7,15	80:11 81:10 82:13	<b>managers</b> 15:3,5,7
192:4 194:4,7,10	188:6 191:4 194:1	92:24 96:11,13	83:3
194:13,16,19	<b>little</b> 48:10 58:23	102:25 109:3	manifold 166:21
<b>linked</b> 182:6	62:8 78:19 136:1	119:4 126:5 135:8	manner 18:17
links 86:9 88:17	141:5 150:1	135:10 141:5	mapping 135:2
lipshutz 28:2	live 120:22 157:16	146:9	march 35:8 38:23
<b>list</b> 101:12,13,14	lives 182:21	looks 90:20 117:17	38:23 39:3,10
101:17,19,25	<b>llp</b> 3:5 4:16 5:5 6:5	141:22 144:7	44:16,16 46:14
119:7 128:1 129:6	15:19	<b>los</b> 5:9 6:19	52:1 60:10,13,15
160:4,9 168:15	<b>load</b> 135:8	lots 21:22 51:21	61:11,19 62:24
171:1 179:22	loaded 33:8	lower 58:23 137:9	76:5 81:8,13
<b>listed</b> 29:25 30:6	loading 17:25	<b>lunch</b> 113:5,13	90:16,16 91:25
36:22 37:3 59:14	135:19 138:12	lweaver 3:14	92:6 109:9,18
140:25 147:10	located 2:16	m	110:14 179:5
149:22 150:13	location 1:15	m 22:5 46:5	<b>mark</b> 17:17 100:4
177:12	<b>locked</b> 191:12	140:11,11	103:22 104:20
<b>listing</b> 36:24 93:25	192:1	macdonell 7:7	106:10 108:22
<b>lists</b> 148:19 173:23	loeser 4:6 12:20	12:10	110:22 112:5
174:2	114:13 117:14	machine 190:10	116:7,19 129:9
literally 146:22	logs 160:16 163:16	maggie 46:4 68:9	134:10 136:11
litigation 1:6 2:4	163:21 164:8	77:4	174:16 189:6
12:9 14:22 15:8	165:6,16,22,23	main 85:9,12	marked 17:21
15:16,17 16:23	169:8,17 170:12	maintain 55:15	32:15 52:8,9
19:18,23 21:19	172:4,9,10,11	69:15 139:12	103:19 104:21
22:17 23:5,11,18	178:11,12 181:1	157:23 171:22	114:7,8 116:16
59:23 93:7 98:20	181:19 183:5	172:13	129:10 130:18
99:20 100:17,24	187:10	maintained 124:2	134:12,15 135:11
101:11 108:23	long 88:20 119:7	142:1 148:5 154:9	142:11 146:14
109:8,17 113:21	154:23 183:20	171:1	

### Case 3:18-md-02843-VC Document 1086-54 Filed 12/12/22 Page 215 of 233 CONFIDENTIAL

### [marketing - misuse]

marketing 179:1	maximum 77:24	163:18 165:24	meta 7:6 8:21,22
marking 32:18	<b>md</b> 1:6 2:4	166:7 170:14	9:7,8,11,12,17,18
130:21 135:6	<b>mdl</b> 1:4 2:3 16:25	171:12 172:6,15	9:23,24 10:13,14
142:10	17:7 22:24 23:2	174:2,12,19 175:1	10:19,20 11:7,8,10
martie 22:5,8	mean 24:9 25:5	175:3,14 177:1,4	11:15,16 14:12
master 6:16 13:3,4	29:4,8 33:24 34:2	177:10,22 178:13	15:9 33:4,24 34:2
37:16 95:2,5,6,17	34:2 40:16 42:1	178:25 179:14	34:12 105:15,17
96:5 98:2,6,13	44:8 45:2,6,8 50:2	181:21	119:23 129:15
125:18	51:18 53:23 55:18	memory 74:25	130:23 134:21,24
master's 188:3	57:9,10 58:1	76:9	138:3 141:14,14
materials 91:18	59:14 61:12,13,17	mention 181:9	141:19 142:15
123:16 141:21	61:20 62:9 65:13	mentioned 29:24	148:3 149:5,24
177:16	65:21 67:1 71:11	36:13 37:2 51:19	150:8
matter 12:8 15:11	76:24 79:13 80:7	64:22 83:22 87:13	meta's 137:17
16:2 17:9,11 18:8	80:25 81:21 82:6	123:12 163:24	<b>method</b> 180:19,21
18:9 20:3 21:24	82:11 85:24 86:6	182:18	michael 1:13 2:15
22:2 23:6,13 24:4	87:21 98:1 121:21	message 111:14	8:3 14:1,10 191:5
25:2 26:23 27:2	122:16 132:18	messages 86:10	193:1,12 194:2,24
27:11 28:20 29:11	133:23 152:1,1	99:17 108:22	migrated 166:24
29:14,18 37:24	155:14 163:3	109:5,10,16,21,23	migrating 166:20
69:15 70:7 75:15	167:5,14 177:15	110:1,7,10,12	mike 12:7 58:15
79:17 80:10,20	181:14 182:8	111:4,14,18,21	108:3 122:3 128:4
91:19 92:10,12,14	184:17 188:8	112:4,13,19	128:18 133:14
93:12,24 94:1,5	meaning 55:3	118:15,17,19,23	143:4 144:4
98:20 99:4 102:9	188:14	118:25 122:9,12	145:18 147:19
110:22 120:9	means 21:5 93:5,6	126:13 152:11,14	149:1,11 154:12
123:15 124:10	93:7 105:9 138:20	152:15,16	162:12 164:21
125:8 151:20	155:15 161:24	messaging 99:11	167:4 168:11
153:17,17 156:19	167:18 172:9	99:13,14,20,25	176:6 179:20
160:3,7 162:17	181:11	100:5,16,23	<b>million</b> 79:12
164:1 165:17,20	meant 50:4,4	101:21 102:1,5,17	<b>mind</b> 22:6 34:19
167:19 168:19,25	76:25	103:1,4,6,13 105:5	76:16 85:10
171:14,16,20,21	measures 178:23	105:9,9 106:22	119:13 128:5
183:3,10 186:3	mechanism 50:17	108:9,19 126:8,20	140:10 170:6
matters 15:9	129:4 183:18	127:1 144:24	186:22
19:23 22:23 23:12	188:10	messenger 110:10	<b>minimum</b> 168:12
23:12,18 46:4	<b>member</b> 163:6	110:12 111:4,18	mission 6:8
56:21 76:5 93:8	183:6	112:20 118:4	misspoke 150:24
171:18 185:15	members 38:9	122:10,12	misuse 124:23
186:13,16,21	127:25 161:21,24	met 36:2	125:3
	162:25 163:3,12		

### Case 3:18-md-02843-VC Document 1086-54 Filed 12/12/22 Page 216 of 233 CONFIDENTIAL

#### [mobile - number]

<b>mobile</b> 118:12	named 26:3 39:6	nice 140:20	111:6,16,24 112:7
144:25	44:6 46:11,13	nine 18:4 19:21	113:3,25 115:24
<b>modified</b> 71:7,12	51:25 59:2,8,11,13	nodding 53:17	119:1 122:2
71:21,24 72:20	60:11,17,19 61:21	nonprivileged	124:17 126:16
77:14 188:12	62:20 63:9 83:18	165:13	127:10 128:12,15
modify 77:12	84:11,16,19,24	nonpublic 145:9	128:21 129:7
80:19	88:2,4,7,13 89:4	145:13 147:6,17	142:3 143:3
moment 29:20	89:12 90:13,15,24	normal 107:23	145:17,25 146:10
31:8 32:22 33:17	110:24 154:2,15	northern 1:2 2:2	146:12,21,23,25
33:18 67:6 80:3	155:5 156:4,12	notating 191:15	148:25 150:11
104:15 136:22	157:6,11 158:2,6,9	192:4	154:11 159:8,21
monday 52:20	158:22 160:14,17	note 58:24 96:7	160:20 161:17
monitor 172:22	163:22 164:10	173:14	162:4 167:3,24
month 60:21	165:8 166:8,11	notebooks 123:3,7	170:22 172:1,18
monthly 91:2	169:5 172:23	124:2	170:22 172:1,18
monthy 31:2 months 185:2	188:4	<b>noted</b> 95:6,9 96:5	174:7,25 175:2,5
morning 12:15,22	names 16:21 17:2	125:18 189:13	175:13,16 176:14
14:7 154:3	17:12 21:25 22:6	notes 9:4 35:14	177:11,13 179:18
<b>motion</b> 180:8	23:17 27:18 46:16	36:19,21 37:3	180:12 183:23
<b>move</b> 95:10 97:19	123:21 174:8	52:3,7,17,19,21	187:13
125:19 183:19	naming 101:8	63:2 64:8 67:16	<b>notices</b> 34:17 92:9
<b>multi</b> 16:23 23:11	natalie 17:10	68:7 70:18 97:24	93:23 94:3,5
93:6 101:10	naugle 17:10	122:17 123:3,7	115:17 127:20,22
multiple 144:8	navigating 88:18	140:25 193:4	179:4
mumm 21:24 25:9	necessarily 56:4	<b>notice</b> 8:12 16:4	noticing 12:14
munn 21:24	necessary 24:16	16:19 17:5,18,18	notification 77:4,9
<b>mute</b> 173:6	39:6 95:11 191:14	20:18,23 21:21	77:13 83:24 173:2
n	192:3	36:12 37:14 38:7	notifications
n 8:1 38:13 140:12	<b>need</b> 19:6,8 101:9	41:9 42:21 43:24	101:15 171:13
name 14:8,10	137:4 181:24	45:19 47:13,20	<b>notify</b> 102:10
16:15 17:2 21:17	needed 69:18	48:5 49:8 50:23	november 9:21
22:4,4,4 25:4,17	150:15 183:25	51:4 59:20 63:23	108:20 126:14
27:3,12,22,23	negative 24:13	80:12,25 81:3	<b>number</b> 8:9 9:2
28:12 30:10,14	neither 190:17	82:21,23 83:2	10:2 11:2 19:25
31:3 34:12 38:13	network 56:8	84:6 89:18 91:4,9	32:25 33:1 36:21
43:4,7,10,14 46:1	182:14,19	92:7,14 93:1,13,17	52:23 80:14 82:14
87:9 139:19,23,23	nevada 1:22	93:22 94:12,12,16	86:8 96:13 105:6
140:6 144:21,22	never 183:1 186:8	96:1,2 97:22	105:24 134:25
144:22,25 156:13	new 135:6 166:20	98:10 99:25	135:3 136:6 137:9
174:13 190:21	166:24 184:18	106:13 108:2,16	138:1 141:10
		109:14 110:19,23	142:15 144:25

#### [number - organization]

145:5,6,7 146:4,7	100:3,8,18,25	obligations 132:21	147:4 151:6,8,11
150:13 185:14,23	101:22 102:19	133:7	153:25 157:5
191:15 192:4	108:1,10,15 110:2	<b>obtain</b> 39:5 85:7	163:4,9 164:15
numbers 32:23	111:5,15,23 112:6	137:18 138:3,4	165:1 173:9,21
33:4 129:15	113:2,24 116:9	<b>obtained</b> 148:17	174:1 178:7
134:21 135:3	117:4 120:6,19	181:2,20	179:23 180:2,5
0	122:1 126:15,22	obtaining 183:5	183:12 188:22
o 46:5,6 140:11,12	127:16 128:3,10	occasions 18:3	189:9
140:12	128:17 130:11	185:10	olivan 174:20,22
o'hara 47:3	131:8 132:10	occupying 21:9	once 18:7 23:10
<b>o0o</b> 12:3 189:17	133:5,13 142:2	occur 66:15,24	95:10 103:5 157:8
<b>o365</b> 118:9	143:2 144:3	<b>occurred</b> 66:11,13	157:13
oakland 3:12	145:16,24 146:20	75:19 183:2	onedrive 120:25
oath 14:2 48:24	147:18 148:24	october 9:16	ones 76:1 85:9,12
113:18 190:9	149:10 150:10,22	<b>office</b> 191:11	184:17
object 106:12	151:4 153:13	<b>oh</b> 37:1 104:5	ongoing 22:22
127:9 152:23	154:10 155:9	135:5,19 150:24	91:7
	157:1 160:25	167:13	online 118:7
157:19 159:7,9	161:16,22 162:3	okay 12:5 15:24	144:23 145:4
160:19 165:9	162:11,21 163:1	19:5,12 20:5,11,21	onset 23:18 157:24
172:16,17 178:15	164:11 166:1	20:25 21:16 25:16	166:12,14
objected 98:6	167:2,23 168:9	29:3,19 31:6,18	open 20:9
<b>objection</b> 16:3,18	169:11,21 170:15	33:10 34:4 35:11	operating 78:25
17:4,16 21:20	170:21 171:4,25	35:15 46:22,23	operations 87:23
22:20 23:8 24:10	172:7,24 176:11	47:1 48:18,21	88:1,5,8 131:19
25:6,11,18 27:4,13	176:14 177:2,24	53:19 56:16 57:5	175:10,15,17,21
27:25 28:4,7,14	179:6,19 180:11	57:19 58:7,22	175:22,24,25
30:8 31:15 32:4	181:4,22 183:7,15	62:8 63:18 64:7	176:1,19,22
33:25 34:9 38:6	183:22 184:14	67:5 78:20 79:18	operative 74:12
40:1 41:8 42:20	185:3,8,11,21,25	79:22,25 80:11	opposed 41:7
42:24 43:23 44:25	186:5,19 187:1,12	81:6,14,25 87:20	44:23 49:17 57:16
45:18 47:12,19	187:21 188:16	89:21 91:11 92:24	optional 126:13
48:4 49:7,18	objections 51:7	94:15 96:5,16,17	order 11:13 13:10
50:13,22 51:3,14	95:8 112:15,21	103:18 104:15	44:13 132:23
57:24 58:13 59:19	153:5	113:4,6,7,10	137:19 141:17
60:2,22 61:25	<b>objects</b> 64:9 65:6,9	114:17,18 116:12	142:17,20 143:15
63:22 72:8 73:3	67:7 157:7,12,24	117:8,23,25 118:1	143:22 148:7
75:3,9 77:19	<b>obligated</b> 152:13	119:2,6 120:25	181:1,19
79:10 83:21 84:14	153:15	124:8 127:2 129:8	oregon 1:22
88:9,22 89:6,13,17	obligation 159:25	136:17,20,22	organization
89:24 90:4 91:3	5.5.1.5.1.1.1.1.1.1.2.5.2.5	142:8 146:15	179:11
95:6 99:9,21		112.0 1 10.13	

### [original - pillar]

original 110:23	194:19	181:2,20	perjury 13:19
190:14 191:10,21	pages 1:25 35:14	<b>partition</b> 71:11,13	191:17 192:6
outset 22:17	53:4 55:4,7,8 59:1	71:17,21 73:14	193:2
outside 15:8 16:10	59:9,10 60:17	74:19,22	permanent 131:17
21:17 27:20 28:18	118:9 191:14,17	partitions 71:6	permission 46:19
56:8 70:8 75:16	191:17 192:3,6,6	partly 168:4	155:4 180:9
76:7 93:18 116:15	<b>palo</b> 1:15 2:17	partner 12:18	permissions 155:1
133:19 148:17	12:1	partners 187:6	perpetuity 120:22
160:20 180:12	<b>paper</b> 122:17	partnerships	persistent 145:2
182:3	paragraph 21:2	124:25	<b>person</b> 28:10 43:9
overall 57:16	105:8,25 118:1	party 121:4	88:21 120:23
overarching 93:9	124:14 131:11	124:24 131:15	140:24,25 141:2
overlap 23:5	132:1	144:15 148:10,14	146:3 162:8,19
overlapped 22:23	paralegal 15:16,17	148:23 149:3,8,20	personal 15:25
overwritten 72:24	15:22	190:19	25:25 26:21 31:13
74:11	parents 21:7	pdf 42:2 51:23	32:2 145:15,21,23
owner 71:25,25	part 28:23 51:9	191:12 192:1	146:2,11,16,19
73:17 77:1,11	100:12 101:5,6	pdfs 48:2,8	147:1
owners 77:5,7	102:7 107:22	penalty 13:19	personally 38:8
187:8	134:5 137:18,24	191:16 192:5	186:2
р	138:5,24 139:1,1	193:2	personnel 85:6
	148:6 156:6,18	pendency 100:17	105:15 121:4
<b>p</b> 140:12	157:15 158:11	100:23 107:5,17	persons 21:9
<b>p.m.</b> 113:8,11	159:17 161:1	126:20 188:5	30:11,15 31:2
151:9,12 164:24	168:3,23 170:18	pending 19:9	pertaining 40:5
165:2 180:3,6	174:15 181:6	189:7	86:4
189:12,13 <b>pacific</b> 12:6	183:9	<b>people</b> 23:17 29:6	pertains 30:12
page 8:3,9 9:2	partial 97:24	36:21 56:5 68:17	179:10 190:13
10:2 11:2 21:1	particular 25:4	77:8 94:16 140:10	<b>phone</b> 58:6 86:8
26:5 35:3 52:22	40:12 42:11 89:1	182:4	118:24 146:4
58:23 63:2,5,13,19	94:1 95:13 121:20	people's 21:25	153:7
65:5 67:21 70:18	parties 3:2 4:2 5:2	percent 117:18	<b>phones</b> 152:17
77:23 80:13 82:13	6:2 7:2 125:1,4	performing 21:10	<b>photos</b> 145:1
96:12 115:7	127:4 158:10,23	period 23:16	147:12 166:18
117:23 124:9	163:17,22 164:9	25:15 49:23 50:2	<b>phrase</b> 154:25
132:25 137:9	165:7,25 168:6,15	71:25 103:10	181:10
143:17 147:22	169:4,9,18 170:4	105:11 117:7	physical 152:1,4
148:15 149:5	170:14,19 171:1	120:13,22 121:6,6	piece 74:7
173:10,20,21	171:11,23 172:6	148:6 182:21	<b>pieces</b> 114:25
191:15 192:4	172:14,22 176:25	191:18 192:7	pillar 87:15,23,24
194:4,7,10,13,16	177:22 178:13		87:25
174.4,7,10,13,10			

#### [pillars - preserve]

<b>pillars</b> 85:21 87:14	181:3	106:10,19,21,22	<b>pre</b> 87:2
87:21	plan 11:11 133:25	106:24 107:3,5,8	preauthorize
place 35:8,10	134:4,24 135:14	107:13,16,25	106:4
46:14 75:17 82:5	137:2 139:3	108:8,13,19	preceded 132:12
143:15 188:8	149:14,14 150:14	129:25 130:3,6,7,9	predecessors 21:6
190:6	<b>platform</b> 34:13	130:15,16 131:16	preference 132:22
<b>placed</b> 16:12	58:9 102:17	134:2,6 139:2	preferences
27:18 67:10 68:24	124:21 172:12	142:17,21 143:14	132:20
69:2,9,11,14,17	175:10,14,17,25	144:1,6,9 149:14	preparation 34:15
70:10,13 77:5	176:1,19,21	151:21,21 175:3	34:21 52:18 54:25
83:13 156:7	platforms 7:6	181:17	68:4,13,18 92:8
159:18 168:18	14:13 15:9 34:2	portal 35:4	93:22 107:10,21
171:19 173:3	please 12:13,14	portion 37:20,25	115:2 140:21
177:7 179:11,15	13:16 14:8 17:3	position 30:11,14	prepare 35:12,22
188:4	27:7 33:18 35:23	31:3 94:17 95:16	52:19 68:7 141:3
places 84:16 144:8	36:25 61:7 92:1	98:5	143:1 189:3
placing 79:4	104:19 125:21	positions 21:10	prepared 30:7
183:18 188:10,13	128:6 134:10	possession 161:8	117:21
plaintiff 44:6	157:9 162:14	possible 69:22	preparing 93:18
84:16,20,24 88:2,4	169:13 170:7	108:12 150:7	114:22 142:22
88:8,13 89:12	173:10,12	161:9	present 7:4 12:21
90:13 188:4	point 48:13 50:10	possibly 35:5	22:3,13 78:15
plaintiff's 20:18	65:7 67:8,13	185:4	86:14 96:22 162:2
26:15 30:1 46:11	68:21 70:19 71:6	post 42:12,13	presented 17:20
plaintiffs 2:16 3:4	76:20 77:23 81:16	posted 81:11	51:11,18 60:1
8:11 12:17 26:3	96:7 97:8 99:8	posts 42:6 57:11	preservation 8:16
36:6,8,11 37:6,10	107:2 111:2,10,20	57:16 86:9 120:13	15:10 20:20 22:19
37:12,19 39:6	112:2,11 116:6	120:23 155:4	23:15,20 24:3,8
46:13 51:25 59:2	120:15 126:7	potential 124:23	31:12 32:1 36:9
59:8,11,14 60:11	150:3 167:21	potentially 65:3	37:11 38:18 45:7
60:18,19 61:22	173:11	74:15 79:4 84:19	50:6,8,12,16,20
62:20 63:9 83:18	<b>policies</b> 31:10,24	124:18 151:20	51:2 80:8 82:7
84:11 89:5 90:16	34:18,22 37:5	152:12 153:16	83:9,15 91:8
90:24 114:3	108:6 131:19	157:15 164:13	124:17 127:4,7,14
115:10 154:2,16	<b>policy</b> 8:19 9:5,9	<b>power</b> 111:21	127:20,22 129:7
155:5 156:5,12	9:15,21 10:11	practical 67:2	161:11 173:4
157:6,11 158:3,6,9	11:14 33:22 34:8	practice 166:21	177:7 180:24
158:22 160:14,17	34:11,25 35:6,7,10	167:6 183:13	181:10
163:23 164:10	81:7,8,11,15,21	<b>practices</b> 31:10,24	preserve 23:4
165:8 166:8,11	103:3,12 104:14	167:1	24:17 25:25 26:21
169:5 172:23	104:18 105:4		38:5,15,18 44:14

#### [preserve - protects]

62 16 00 0 10	102 10 102 10 11	100 12 124 16	62.20.107.4
62:16 80:9,18	182:10 183:10,11	109:13 124:16	63:20 187:4
82:9 84:11 90:9	187:25	125:14,25 181:24	producing 48:2
92:11 94:6 97:1	preserving 27:10	privileged 23:23	186:12,25
99:19 103:7,8	99:3 118:3,6,10	23:24 41:11 47:23	<b>product</b> 58:5
109:19 110:6,9	156:17 158:13	61:6 66:17,18	65:17,24 66:1,4
118:25 120:11	168:5	70:5 78:7,8 92:21	94:13,19 96:4
121:14 122:22	prevent 72:20	94:12,17 100:10	109:13 119:24
123:1 126:9 133:3	78:4,13	100:11 101:3	125:14,25 157:18
139:14 150:20	<b>prevents</b> 71:21,22	106:15,15 164:13	production 15:11
151:2,15,19 152:9	78:24 94:23	166:3,4 178:18,19	16:2 35:19 37:7
152:13 153:15,23	157:17	180:15 181:6	48:8 60:1 122:20
154:4,14 156:4,11	previously 118:2	<b>pro</b> 83:4 97:6	136:10 157:16
158:9,20 159:12	<b>prior</b> 14:21 15:2	129:5	products 65:8
159:19 160:1,4,8	15:14,19 35:10	proactively 90:8	67:18
160:12 161:20	60:9 65:17 81:22	178:3	professional 2:21
162:8,18,24	95:12 96:24 97:3	problem 22:11	190:2
163:11,15,20	98:18 99:1 107:5	33:13 34:20 55:23	proficient 18:16
164:7 165:6	107:16 108:20	69:7 127:13 170:8	<b>profile</b> 1:5 2:4
166:10 168:14	130:3,5,9,14,16	173:17	12:9 147:9,10
169:4 170:2,11	131:5 132:7 133:2	procedure 8:15	191:4 194:1
171:10,17 172:4	133:9 138:8	83:12 191:19,20	<b>program</b> 10:10,16
176:23 177:11	139:11 140:8	procedures 31:11	11:4,10 129:24
178:11,23 180:9	141:25 150:19	31:25 131:19	130:6,9,14 131:1
181:15 182:7,17	151:1 154:16	proceed 96:9	131:12,19 134:1,6
183:4	155:5 162:9,19	proceeding 93:8	134:20,24 136:12
preserved 58:25	190:8	proceedings	136:24 137:1
65:16 67:9 68:23	<b>privacy</b> 10:10,16	124:19 190:5,8,9	139:2,22,24
90:3,7 109:17	11:4,10 12:8	190:15	180:24
120:4 122:19	56:10,14,18,23	proceeds 20:8	programs 113:22
123:2,6,19 133:8	57:2,8,15,20 87:23	<b>process</b> 27:3,12	115:15 116:7
133:12 140:8	129:24 130:6,8,14	28:16 29:4,10,18	181:10
151:22,25 152:2,3	131:1,12,19,20,23	71:20 76:12 78:4	<b>proko</b> 140:12
152:4 153:11	134:1,6,20,24	78:18,20,21,25	pronouncing 43:7
154:1,21 155:4	136:12,23 137:1	123:13 166:15,20	proofpoint 116:23
156:21 159:2	137:22 138:2	186:15 187:5	117:1,6 118:5,16
160:3,10,11,24	139:1,21,22 141:7	produce 41:21	118:18,20 119:15
161:2,6,10 163:25	141:15,20 147:12	47:9 108:13 150:8	119:18,20
164:2,5 165:17,19	154:1,6,8,15,17,20	186:17	<b>protect</b> 106:5,7
165:22 168:21,24	179:2	produced 20:22	protective 13:10
169:1 177:21	<b>privilege</b> 94:10,22	35:21 36:6 37:5	protects 141:15
178:4 181:1,19	96:3 98:9 101:4	47:15 59:18,22	

#### [protocol - record]

		I	
protocol 13:9	34:19 35:24 39:9	97:25 102:6 115:9	25:13 27:19,21,23
provide 13:11	40:24 41:13 43:2	164:13 188:23,24	38:14 39:13 49:3
42:18 60:25 72:16	44:10 45:24 47:14	<b>quick</b> 48:14	49:13,14,15,22
73:25 93:24,24	47:22,24 50:9	179:24	50:5,15 76:7 80:5
152:20,21 153:7	54:10,17,22 55:8	<b>quip</b> 118:8	97:2 108:4 114:20
173:12 176:9,18	58:1,21 61:5,7,9	<b>quips</b> 121:10	115:6 123:10,23
provided 13:10	61:15 64:6 66:19	quite 45:2	174:8,14
36:11 37:13 51:22	66:21 68:15 69:6	<b>quote</b> 115:11	receive 77:8
191:19 192:8	69:20 70:16 72:10	r	127:22 175:12,15
provides 43:21	73:5 78:9,11	r 22:5 43:11 46:5,5	received 39:7
63:3 139:4 149:7	79:15 82:3 85:19	46:6 140:11,12	101:14 105:15
149:15,19	85:22 89:10 90:14	194:3,3	125:20 127:19
providing 27:17	92:1,19,23 94:10	r&s 192:1,9	128:1,20,24 129:7
pseudonymized	94:14 97:17 98:3	raise 13:16 94:24	151:14 158:10,15
45:13	98:25 100:14,21	range 96:21,25	159:4,14,20
<b>pull</b> 64:17,20	101:7 106:13,16	97:2	160:17 163:17,22
<b>pulling</b> 114:11	106:18 107:12	read 21:3,8 25:22	164:9 165:8 169:4
<b>purpose</b> 27:1,10	109:12 110:4	30:3 32:22 67:8	170:4,14 172:11
144:1	111:8 112:9	132:3 135:2	173:24 174:6,25
purposes 45:7	114:24 116:14	137:15 139:10	175:2,4 177:10,22
50:12 67:20	122:7 123:5	189:6 193:2	178:13 179:4,17
105:16 139:15	125:12,24 127:12	reading 132:24	receives 41:3
pursuant 8:14	128:6 132:14	137:15 191:23	148:16
13:8 71:24 95:11	135:23 137:5,13	192:9	receiving 103:5
<b>put</b> 34:11 72:18,22	138:23 143:7,9,25	reads 137:17	172:22
72:23,25 73:11,14	150:18 155:17	173:11	recess 48:20 79:24
73:19,21 74:9,22	157:9 161:4	really 35:19 73:8	113:9 151:10
75:1,8,12,22 78:4	162:14 163:10	79:2 155:15 178:8	164:25 180:4
83:23 84:5 143:14	165:4,10,12	reason 51:12	recipient's 105:10
176:14 183:14	167:20 169:13	66:23 78:3 79:3	recognition 18:10
184:19 185:7	170:6 171:7	101:7 109:13	recognize 20:13
187:14	172:17 176:13	116:4 175:6 179:8	33:19,20 104:9
<b>puts</b> 71:22	177:6 178:16	194:6,9,12,15,18	recognized 145:3
<b>putting</b> 73:9 78:12	181:7,13,15 182:5	194.0,9,12,13,18	record 12:6 13:6,6
84:12 187:10	182:14 184:9	reasons 41:15	14:9 18:15,22
<b>pwc</b> 127:21	185:17 186:8	reassociate 45:17	19:1 21:4 22:7
q	188:3,21	rebecca 1:20 2:20	25:23 30:13 32:20
question 19:9	questioning 81:2	190:1,24	32:23 40:18 42:2
22:25 23:1,3,9,25	questions 18:20	recall 17:13 18:12	48:19,22 52:15
26:18 27:7 30:5	37:16 69:5 73:7	20:4 21:25 23:16	55:20 58:4 62:22
31:4,17,21 34:14	74:7 81:5 95:1	24:1,7,14 25:8,12	65:14 79:23 80:1
31.7,17,21 34.14		24.1,7,14 23.0,12	

#### [record - repeat]

00 17 00 12 05 7	120 2 122 0 11 12	105 0 160 12	
89:17 90:12 95:7	120:2 122:8,11,13	125:2 160:13	released 191:21
96:6,8 113:8,11,16	126:8 132:15	165:15 188:2	relevant 8:17
114:12 117:12	148:9	registered 2:21	15:11 20:20 24:17
125:19 130:22	referenced 39:12	190:1	24:21,23,25 28:9
132:4,24 134:18	109:9 139:7 144:7	registration 86:7	28:12,19 29:17
136:11 137:16,23	191:6	regulatory 15:8	70:7,10 75:14
139:5,10 142:16	referred 60:5	22:23 23:12	80:10,19 82:9
151:9,12 158:5	68:22 96:17	124:19 132:21	91:13,16,18,22
162:1,8,18 164:20	137:18 175:24,25	133:7 185:15	92:2,4,12 93:25
164:22,23 165:2	<b>referring</b> 21:14,15	reidentification	94:7 96:25 102:9
171:22 172:13	22:9 30:20,22	45:23	103:7,8 109:2,4,20
173:8,11,14,22	60:21 62:19 68:9	reidentify 45:16	110:6 118:25
176:16 180:1,3,6	80:23,24 81:4,20	reiterate 97:20	119:5 120:1,3,9
181:2,19 189:10	82:5,20 84:23	<b>relate</b> 137:14	121:14 122:6,22
189:12 190:9,12	104:11,13 105:21	related 29:17	122:24 123:1,14
records 10:10,16	105:22 106:21	39:17 40:11,13	124:10,18 125:8
11:4,11,13 41:21	184:25	53:4 55:4 56:2	137:21,23,25
129:24 130:6,9	<b>refers</b> 175:9	57:13 62:16 80:10	143:1 151:20
131:2,6,12,13,14	<b>reflect</b> 160:16	85:2,7 93:10,11	152:12 153:15,16
131:15,16,17,18	164:9 165:7,23	96:15 99:3 105:14	153:18,23 171:17
131:20,20,21,22	169:8,16,17 183:5	106:6 108:5 120:5	177:5
131:22 132:3,9,16	reflected 131:7	132:19 141:18	<b>relied</b> 141:21
132:19,19,23	reflects 57:15	152:22 153:16,22	<b>rely</b> 35:24
133:4,10,12,21,22	63:10,14 66:10	171:17 177:12	remain 120:14
134:1,6,20,24	132:1	183:6	121:7
135:23 136:12,24	<b>refuse</b> 92:19	<b>relates</b> 1:7 2:6	remediation
137:2,5,11,14,17	<b>regan</b> 5:14 13:1	94:11 141:19	131:21
139:2,5,9,12	22:14	relating 23:5	remember 16:20
141:13 142:1,17	regard 17:14	26:22 30:16 31:14	16:21 27:15 93:17
142:20 143:22	26:11 27:9 30:24	32:3 38:5,15 40:8	<b>remind</b> 106:14
144:8 147:24	44:12,18,23 46:9	40:23 80:19 93:2	178:17
148:2,4 149:16,23	59:6 83:18 85:15	94:7 98:20 127:4	remote 18:13
150:14,16 164:8	87:5,8 98:19 99:3	135:23 137:5,17	remotely 1:14
165:6 169:4,17	133:22 139:9	140:7 151:15	2:18 190:6
<b>redgrave</b> 23:15,21	144:2 165:22	158:9,21 161:20	remove 65:6
24:6,15,22,24	regarding 8:16	162:17,24 171:10	<b>repeat</b> 27:6 68:15
refer 35:15 45:22	20:19 26:20 31:11	relations 131:16	72:9 92:1 114:24
58:19 64:9 67:7	31:25 36:8 37:10	relationships	123:5 127:11
67:16 99:7 144:6	37:16 40:19 41:5	64:24	157:9 162:13
reference 52:24	44:15 68:18	relative 190:18	169:12 181:24
99:11 109:22	105:25 106:22		182:14

#### [repeating - routines]

repeating 128:5	158:18	retained 24:6	reviewing 36:19
170:6	requirements	74:18 90:7 143:24	reyzis 5:6 13:1
replaced 78:14	149:9,24	148:2,5 150:8	22:13
151:22	requires 124:17	retention 9:15	rfalconer 4:23
replacement	research 87:22	10:17 11:5 31:12	191:2
155:21	158:23 179:3,4	32:1 71:24 98:23	rhetorical 98:3
replaces 77:25	researcher 159:4	104:18 117:7	rid 77:25 78:5,21
78:5,21	reserve 189:5	120:13,17,21	<b>rids</b> 78:14
replica 73:10	reside 88:3	121:6 131:2,6	<b>right</b> 13:16 14:20
<b>report</b> 137:25	resources 179:2	132:5,8,12 133:9	15:16,20 21:14
<b>reported</b> 1:14,19	respect 25:4 166:7	134:20 136:12,24	22:10 26:17 28:13
2:19	166:7	139:8 143:22	53:15 54:20 58:9
<b>reporter</b> 2:20,21	respond 95:20	149:24 178:1	60:1 68:10 72:24
2:22 12:12 13:15	116:13 125:21	181:16 182:21	73:2,19,23 78:18
13:18 17:22 32:16	responded 88:3	retrieve 42:4 44:2	78:25 81:17 82:21
52:10 103:20	115:22	44:5,9,22 45:3	83:8 87:7 93:5
104:22 114:9	responding 115:9	47:11	94:18 119:15
116:17 129:11	responds 124:16	<b>return</b> 29:20	122:14 135:19
130:19 134:13,16	<b>response</b> 16:9,17	135:22 191:17	136:16 138:22
142:12 190:2,3,3	20:22 39:18 40:25	192:6	159:6 168:8
reporter's 46:19	41:1,6,16,21,22	returning 46:7	174:25 188:6
reporting 129:4	42:16,18 43:1,4,19	91:11	<b>rights</b> 189:5
reports 15:3	43:20 53:25 54:23	reveal 23:23 41:11	<b>ring</b> 6:6 22:1
131:13	58:20 123:3	66:17 92:16 93:15	<b>risk</b> 131:20
repositories	131:14,21 132:9	96:2 106:15 143:5	<b>road</b> 18:19
150:13 182:7,13	180:24 181:17	166:3	rohrback 4:4
182:17,19,24	responsibilities	revealing 47:22	<b>roles</b> 15:1,6
repository 89:12	15:6	61:6 70:4 78:7	romano 1:20 2:20
139:6 182:8,10,22	responsible 16:8	<b>review</b> 20:7 33:17	18:22 46:22 190:1
183:3	16:11,16 22:18	34:16,22,25 37:4	190:24
represent 34:7	27:17 30:11,15	85:2,15,20 114:16	<b>room</b> 164:17,21
representative	39:18 168:4	115:5 131:20	<b>ropes</b> 15:15,15
1:13 14:15 19:14	responsive 132:23	142:22,24 149:13	rose 22:1
request 35:18,20	153:11 181:7	187:5 190:15	rosemarie 6:6
48:7 94:6	restate 165:3	191:8,10,13 192:2	ross 4:19
requested 190:16	181:15	reviewed 34:24	<b>rough</b> 184:11
192:1,9,10	restating 34:19	36:5,7,10,12 37:2	roughly 14:21
requests 41:4	restricted 147:12	37:12,14,15 38:1	49:15 75:8
131:16	results 44:3	92:7,13 93:22	<b>routine</b> 98:16 99:7
required 87:18	<b>retain</b> 131:13	107:13,19,20,22	routines 98:19
132:2 138:3 149:5	132:3 149:6	114:3 115:2	99:2

#### 

#### [row - seek]

105.15	100.07	112 2 2 7 11 5 12	1100111015
row 137:16	scan 122:25	113:3,25 116:10	140:24 143:17
<b>rpr</b> 1:20 190:24	123:16	122:2 126:16,23	164:20 173:16
rring 6:12	scandal 171:9	127:10 130:12	seconds 89:2
rule 8:14 95:7	scenario 137:24	142:3 143:3	section 105:23,24
rules 18:18 31:11	138:5	145:17,25 146:21	148:11 149:17
31:25 192:8	schednenko 43:8	147:23 148:4,25	<b>secured</b> 71:7 72:2
run 87:16 88:14	schedule 10:17	149:23 150:11	72:12
88:21 89:4	11:5 98:23 99:17	152:25 154:11	<b>security</b> 106:7,7
russ 12:23 21:24	131:2,6 132:5,8,12	157:3 159:8	141:15 145:5
35:19 89:20 91:6	133:10 134:21	160:20 161:17	146:4 179:1
146:23 164:12	135:13,14 136:13	162:4 167:3,24	see 21:8,11 26:4,8
russell 4:17 191:1	136:24 139:8	168:10 169:22	33:8 52:12,24
S	143:22 149:13	170:22 171:5	53:2,6 55:2 57:11
s 8:8 9:1 10:1 11:1	178:1,2 191:10	172:1,18,25	58:24 59:3 64:8
43:11 194:3	scheduled 73:13	176:13 180:12	65:5,11,19 66:8
safety 106:7	73:16 74:20	183:23 184:15	67:11,14 68:23
sales 179:1	science 45:25 68:4	185:12,22 186:6	70:22 71:5,9 72:4
samples 102:14	68:6 69:21,24	186:20 187:2,13	74:25 76:20 77:10
samples 102.14 samra 3:8 12:19	70:17 73:24 75:6	188:17	77:22 78:1 80:15
32:19 129:14	75:16 83:7,11	screen 105:10	80:21 82:17 91:13
san 6:10	158:19 159:1	137:21 144:25	91:20 96:19,22
	183:17 184:23,24	screenshot 137:21	97:11 98:15
<b>sandberg</b> 100:22	186:12,17 188:20	<b>sdk</b> 183:8	105:18 109:4,22
	scientist 68:5	sdks 183:5	112:12 115:20,25
<b>sandeep</b> 17:8 27:15	187:22	search 87:12,15,18	118:1,13 119:10
saw 37:15	scientists 46:3	88:7,13,15,21 89:2	122:13 124:9,12
	68:9 76:8,11	89:23 90:2 124:2	124:14 125:5
saying 30:23 56:16	<b>scope</b> 16:4,19 17:5	188:15	126:5,10 131:10
167:14	17:16 21:21 22:21	searchable 87:8	131:24 132:15
<b>says</b> 21:4,9 30:14 58:24 63:8 65:8	25:7 27:5,14 38:7	87:11	135:15 136:4,4,5
65:16 66:6 67:9	41:9 42:21 43:22	searched 77:18	136:15,19 137:10
68:23 70:20 71:6	43:24 45:19 47:13	120:4 122:20	138:6,7 141:9,11
72:2 77:24 80:17	47:20 48:5 49:8	153:11	141:12,23 143:18
	49:19 50:23 51:4	searches 87:16	144:12,16 145:11
96:21 97:8 98:16	58:14 59:20 63:23	89:4	146:11,15 147:5,7
103:5 105:8	88:10 89:7,18	searching 70:20	147:8,14,23
115:13 118:2	91:4,8 99:22	seattle 4:10	148:13,20 173:25
124:10,15 126:7	100:19 101:1,23	<b>second</b> 33:12 47:6	174:4 175:9
131:11 133:23	102:20 106:13	47:8 52:1 67:12	seek 95:20 137:4
134:24 137:10	108:2,16 110:18	77:23 80:13 82:18	188:23
138:4 147:23	111:6,16,24 112:7	96:12 131:11	
	. ,		

## Case 3:18-md-02843-VC Document 1086-54 Filed 12/12/22 Page 225 of 233 CONFIDENTIAL

#### [seeking - speak]

1: 20.4.07.14	4 70 1	• 1 01 10 10	02.16.20.04.2.5.12
seeking 38:4 95:14	sets 72:1	similar 21:10,10	83:16,20 84:2,5,12
seen 107:10	setting 42:7 57:17	40:3 42:10 60:8	90:12,15 91:1
114:19 117:15	132:22 138:2	62:6 70:6 83:12	154:3 156:20
145:19	158:5	115:15 119:25	158:1 170:1,9
selected 70:2	<b>settings</b> 56:11,14	131:6 132:12	social 145:4 146:4
self 113:23 115:16	56:18,24 57:3,8,12	similarly 119:23	software 97:7
116:8	57:15 132:20	<b>simon</b> 15:23	<b>solanki</b> 17:8 27:15
sell 40:20	137:22 147:13	<b>single</b> 71:16,18	28:12
selling 40:17	154:1,6,8,15,18,20	85:1,1,15,20	solemnly 13:18
send 127:3,14	155:4	184:18	solutions 191:7
sending 176:25	shake 19:1	sit 56:23 64:6	somebody 42:25
senko 47:4	<b>share</b> 20:6 52:7	sitting 64:2 186:22	42:25 139:21,22
sense 24:3	57:6 92:21 182:14	six 92:25	139:25 158:18
sensitive 106:6	182:20	<b>sixth</b> 126:6	<b>sorry</b> 31:17 33:12
<b>sent</b> 83:2 92:6,9,14	<b>shared</b> 162:24	<b>size</b> 183:25 184:3	33:14 36:25 39:20
93:1 94:16 115:11	163:12 165:24	184:10,18,21	46:8 53:14 55:22
126:6 127:7	sharepoint 121:1	<b>skip</b> 46:20,24	57:20 67:13 88:23
128:15 158:22	182:13,20	smaller 76:15	89:20 90:14 104:3
160:13 162:7,17	<b>sharing</b> 137:19	<b>smith</b> 5:14,21 13:1	135:7,10 138:21
162:20 171:13	<b>sheryl</b> 100:22	22:14	140:4,16 167:13
172:12 173:1	174:17	<b>snapshot</b> 38:17,20	173:16 176:5,17
sentence 131:11	shield 94:24	39:1,24 40:4	<b>sort</b> 22:25 24:13
141:22	<b>short</b> 37:20 103:10	42:11,13 44:13,24	45:23 51:20 73:1
sentences 53:15	154:23	45:10 46:7,8,10	85:4,10 94:2
separate 83:1	shorter 46:21	47:7 49:23 51:10	119:22 184:24
139:3 159:5	shorthand 2:20	51:17,22 59:12	186:9
separately 83:6	190:2,10	62:2,23 65:4,17,22	<b>sorted</b> 160:18
september 10:5	<b>show</b> 129:5 137:23	65:25 66:2,13	<b>sounds</b> 14:20
47:8 52:2 114:12	158:21 159:20	67:3 73:10 90:21	<b>source</b> 64:15 97:9
116:4 126:6	163:16,21	120:10 154:19	121:15,21 123:24
174:10 179:13	<b>showed</b> 37:18	156:16 157:20	sources 89:22 90:2
series 132:25	<b>showing</b> 159:13	158:4 164:4,6	98:22 118:7 121:3
service 141:19	sic 125:20	snapshots 38:22	121:5,7,9,16,20
services 67:19	<b>sign</b> 86:8 189:6	39:2,10,21 47:10	178:5 182:6,16
145:4	191:16 192:5	49:17 50:6,11,21	south 5:8
sessions 36:4	signature 190:23	51:2,24 53:10	<b>space</b> 72:18 77:9
<b>set</b> 57:11 71:14,14	191:21,23,23	58:25 59:7,9,17,22	187:23
73:17 92:3 99:16	192:9	60:5,8,11,12,14,15	<b>speak</b> 29:7 54:24
146:17 149:9	<b>signed</b> 13:10 162:1	60:17 61:2,11,18	98:7 140:23 141:2
154:25 169:20	162:9,19	63:4,11,15,20	150:15
190:6		64:23 66:10,14,23	

#### [speaking - sure]

speaking 26:14	standing 35:20	steve 46:15	113:21 120:13,17
68:13	stands 85:1	stipulation 191:20	121:2,5 124:10
<b>special</b> 6:16 13:3,4	start 13:14 106:25	<b>stop</b> 71:11	125:8 126:19
37:16 95:2,5,5,17	142:6	stopped 87:6	131:15 133:6,7
96:5 98:2,6,13	started 49:20 50:4	<b>stops</b> 71:6	149:8 183:13
125:18 188:3	52:20 68:2 176:12	<b>storage</b> 71:8,23	submitted 13:10
specialist 15:17	starting 75:12	72:3,7,13,15,17,18	19:22 20:2
<b>specific</b> 23:1 24:15	stat 187:4	72:22,23,25 73:11	subpoena 41:22
24:18 54:14 55:25	<b>state</b> 13:19 14:8	73:15 74:9,13,14	43:20
56:13 57:3,16	23:12 55:20 93:7	74:22 84:13 87:7	subpoenas 41:4
71:3 75:23 79:5	117:11 173:18	183:14,19,21	42:19
81:2 86:1 88:13	191:9,12	184:1,13,19 185:6	subscribed 190:21
118:10 123:18	<b>stated</b> 24:14 93:21	185:20 186:4,10	<b>subset</b> 185:14
132:21 139:19	182:25	186:14,18,25	subsidiaries 21:7
146:3 150:18	statement 115:18	187:11,15,19,23	substance 98:9,10
161:4 178:9	115:23 141:18	188:5,9,13	107:24 108:5
186:21 188:21	175:7	<b>stored</b> 32:9,10	substantive
specifically 16:15	statements 131:23	84:17 117:6 118:7	105:14
21:2 25:4 40:7	137:22 141:8,13	118:10,23 121:14	subtopics 149:22
46:1 54:7,13 55:9	175:7 179:10	151:17,19 153:17	successors 21:6
56:22,25 65:1	states 1:1 2:1	165:16,18 177:17	sufficient 137:23
105:23 108:9,19	115:13	<b>stores</b> 67:18	137:25 144:22
109:5 119:7	<b>status</b> 147:11	166:17	149:6,18 158:21
123:17 165:21	stemming 124:19	<b>street</b> 3:10 5:16	suggest 139:20
specifics 79:16	stenographic	6:8,17 144:22	<b>suite</b> 3:11 4:9,20
<b>spell</b> 46:16	113:16 173:8	strike 17:15 25:17	5:17 6:9
spelling 43:7	stenographically	46:8 50:8 97:19	summary 93:24
46:20,25	1:19	101:13 102:24	176:8
<b>spoke</b> 36:15,22	<b>step</b> 80:8 82:7	107:14 111:11	sure 14:10 40:22
140:21	stepping 150:2	138:8 169:16	44:21 55:22 68:16
spreadsheet 134:5	<b>steps</b> 16:1 24:16	stroz 127:8,15,18	73:4 79:21 81:12
134:23 136:5,10	24:18,20 90:8	structured 177:17	86:18 98:24
136:14	102:2,14 126:9	186:12,17,25	100:20 106:25
<b>square</b> 70:19 71:5	156:3 158:8,20	struggle 31:5	108:21 112:10
<b>srt</b> 84:25 85:15,16	159:19 161:19	struggling 101:7	117:18,22 122:7
86:19 87:5,8,10,12	162:23 163:10	186:8	135:1 143:25
87:14,16,19,23,24	164:7 165:5 166:9	subcategory	154:13,17,19
88:1,4,13,17 89:23	169:3 170:2,11	150:21 151:3	156:15 159:15
90:2,7	171:9 172:20	subject 37:24	164:2,18 167:5,10
<b>stand</b> 81:14	173:5 176:23	91:23 93:12 94:5	168:22 169:14
	178:10 183:4	96:3 102:3 108:23	170:5 174:19

#### [sure - tell]

176:2 181:10,12	t	tablets 118:12	106:23 185:2
surfing 56:1,3		152:18	tangible 91:17
surrounding	t 6:6 8:8 9:1 10:1	tabs 134:10	tao 64:9,18,20
108:6	11:1 22:5 194:3,3	take 19:6,8 33:16	65:3 83:13,16
<b>suspend</b> 98:16	tab 32:19 103:22	38:16,22 39:2,10	154:9 157:8,13,15
suspended 98:19	104:20 116:19	39:21,24 42:13	team 15:4 27:17
99:3,4	129:13 142:14	44:13,24 45:10	38:9,13 39:18
swears 12:12	table 63:3,9,10,14	46:10 48:14,16	40:25 41:2,3,7,16
switchboard	63:14 70:21 71:3	49:17 50:11 73:12	41:17,21 42:16
38:19 39:12,15,16	71:18,19,25,25	74:21 79:19 83:16	43:1,5,10,20 45:25
39:23 40:2,4,8,18	73:1,10,13,17	83:19 88:21 90:8	46:2 50:16 53:25
40:24 41:7,16,17	74:12,16,23 75:22	91:1 95:25 102:2	54:23 58:20 64:4
42:3,10,13,14,17	76:21 77:1,5,5,7,8	106:20 107:3	68:4 69:21,24
44:2,5,11 46:9	77:10,12,13 78:12	114:6 120:10	70:17 73:25 75:6
47:7,9,15 48:3,15	79:3 80:10 180:19	126:1,9 130:1	75:16 76:15,17
49:2,11,16,21,24	180:21 184:4	131:3 138:9 151:6	80:9 82:8 83:8,11
50:20 51:1,21,24	tables 69:14,17,19	159:19 169:3	87:22 92:10 97:5
52:24 53:24 54:1	69:23,25 70:1,10	170:1,11 171:10	102:10,16 120:9
54:8 55:3,6,12	70:12,20 72:21,22	178:10 179:24	121:16 122:25
56:9,14,24 57:1,14	73:19,21 74:10,14	183:4,20 184:2,12	123:15 133:20
57:21 58:11,25	75:1,8,11,11,14,17	184:20	139:22,24 140:1,6
59:7,12,17,22 60:4	77:18 78:3,16 79:6,7,8,12,16	taken 2:15 23:4	152:15 153:19
60:8,13 61:2 62:3	80:4 81:2,20 82:6	24:16 38:21,25	158:19 159:1
62:15 63:15 64:17	82:10,25 83:9,23	39:2 47:7 48:20	174:3,9,12,15
64:23 65:2,23	84:6,12 154:21	59:10 60:6,8,12,14	175:14,15,23
66:14,23 83:17	156:7,18,21	61:3,18 63:4,11,15	176:19 179:2
84:2 85:18 86:16	158:12,14 159:2	63:21 65:23 66:3	183:1 184:24
154:5,6,19 156:16	159:17 160:2,10	79:24 82:8 84:4	186:12,17 187:15
158:1,5 164:4	161:2,6 163:25	90:12,15,21 113:9	188:20
synonymous	164:1 165:17	151:10 158:1,8,20	team's 183:17
62:12	168:23,24 169:1	161:20 162:24	teams 76:21,24,25
<b>system</b> 116:22	169:25 170:9	163:11 164:7,25	86:1 176:22 177:5
157:16,16 166:16	171:19 173:3	165:5 166:10	177:10 179:10,15
166:19,21,22,24	177:5,6,18,20	172:21 180:4	182:12
systemic 178:10	178:21,22 183:10	184:1 186:13	technical 48:1
systems 84:18,21	183:13,18 184:6	190:5	59:25 66:23 150:9
84:23 166:11,13	184:12,17,21,25	talk 18:21 74:3	telephone 144:25
170:2,12	185:6 187:4 188:4	91:10	tell 33:18 73:23
systemwide	188:8	talked 29:12	75:20 123:21
176:23	<b>tablet</b> 153:9	talking 46:18 67:6	129:17 186:22
		74:19 75:10 80:3	

#### [temporary - transcribed]

temporary 131:18	46:2 51:13 52:20	25:15 42:11 43:7	today's 13:8
temporary 131.16 ten 36:4 185:24	54:21 56:17 64:22	44:15,16 45:10	told 121:13 166:17
term 155:10	79:12,14,19 84:1	49:23 50:2,10	tool 38:19,19
161:24 167:9,16	85:1 87:2 88:18	68:2 76:6,8,15,18	39:12,16,20,21,24
167:18 172:8	90:10,18 91:6,8	81:16 83:17 87:4	41:7,17 42:3,7
180:21 186:9	99:23 100:13	99:25 103:10	46:7,9 47:11,15
terms 15:5 62:11	101:6 102:22	105:11 106:20	48:3 49:2,5,11,12
163:7 169:9	101.0 102.22	107:2 111:3,10,20	49:16,17 50:6,7,7
188:14	133:17 134:9	112:2,12 116:6	50:11,19,20 51:1,2
terry 47:3 90:20	135:8,10 136:2	129:1 130:4,9	55:7,12,14 56:9,14
90:23	138:4 159:16	132:7 133:2 138:2	56:24 57:1,14
testified 14:3	170:24 175:20	138:8 145:3 148:6	58:11 61:12,24
19:13,17 49:10	176:8 177:9 182:3	158:3 162:6,10,16	62:13,15,15,25
61:11 81:6 107:15	182:4,15,18	162:20 164:6	63:15,21 70:24
114:2	183:24	167:21 169:19	71:1 83:2,14
testify 26:19 29:22	thinking 24:19,20	170:6 174:15,18	84:25 85:2,5,16,17
30:7 97:23 188:2	76:6 87:25 88:3	170.0 174.13,18	85:18,20,24,25
testifying 14:15	105:23 176:10,15	188:23 189:2,3,13	88:14 89:11,15
26:11 34:5 137:4	third 4:8 8:11	190:6 191:10,18	101:18 112:3,13
190:8	17:18 20:18 67:13	191:24 192:7	117:2 121:20,22
testimony 13:19	121:4 124:24	timeline 49:16	129:5 157:17
18:16 44:17 49:14	125:1,4 127:4	times 18:4,5 19:13	158:2,2
80:3 97:21 126:25	131:15 144:14	19:17,21,22 20:1	tools 42:17 84:21
190:12 193:4	148:10,14,23	185:18	84:22 85:11 86:17
texas 4:21	149:3,8,20 158:10	timetable 73:17	88:19
text 152:7,11,13	158:22 163:17,22	184:24	top 77:23
152:15,16	164:9 165:7,25	timing 30:18	topic 25:21 26:12
texts 152:9,17	168:6,15 169:4,8	36:20	30:6,9,13,20,22,25
thank 19:11 22:10	169:18 170:3,13	title 30:11,14 31:3	31:2,8,9,20,23
33:15 36:1 53:11	170:19 171:1,11	titled 137:19	55:25
76:19 77:16 85:14	171:23 172:6,14	titles 15:1	topics 26:14 29:17
113:14 128:22	172:22 176:25	today 12:18 13:4	29:23,25 30:12,16
129:8 142:8 189:1	177:22 178:12	14:15 17:20 18:16	36:16 93:25
189:4,11	181:2,20	20:22 22:3,13	177:12
thereto 124:11	thought 68:6 88:4	34:16,21 35:13	total 82:15 185:14
thick 62:21	three 15:3 68:22	107:11 109:18	tough 85:19
thing 121:12 143:7	86:24	114:23 115:3	town 144:23
things 24:15 35:20	thursday 12:1	117:21 141:3	track 172:21
think 18:4 26:16	tied 86:13	142:23 143:1	training 131:22
28:11 31:20 41:20	time 12:6 14:21	146:14 188:2	transcribed
43:12 45:24,24	19:15,16 23:16		190:11
,	,		

### [transcript - veritext]

transcript 37:21	u	167:11,17 168:13	125:2,4 131:22,22
37:25 189:6	<b>u</b> 14:11	178:25	132:16,19,20,22
190:12,14,16	uh 53:22 78:2	understands 94:21	133:23,24 135:23
191:6,8,10,13,13	174:5	understood 29:25	137:5,10,13,14,21
191:21 192:2,2	uid 77:18,25 78:5	48:9 74:5 81:1	139:11 140:7
193:3	78:15,22 86:2	143:25 165:14	141:7 145:1,3,9,13
transfer 148:18	87:9	undertake 102:15	147:6,8,9,11,17
transition 167:22	uids 78:13	undertakes 80:9	148:18 155:18
168:16	uii 77:24,24	undertook 154:4	157:17,21 160:18
<b>tried</b> 44:1 45:10	ultimately 16:13	<b>united</b> 1:1 2:1	169:9 170:19
triggered 82:24	unaware 115:14	update 52:21	179:3 191:4 194:1
true 53:12,13	unclear 135:7	updated 71:16	user's 40:14,15
116:2,5 121:10	underneath 63:10	125:7	57:22 118:24
151:23 156:25	understand 14:14	updates 124:11	137:24 147:10
160:2 190:12	14:17 18:18 20:21	147:11	157:22
193:5	20:24 23:7 26:19	uploading 135:19	users 39:17 40:19
<b>truth</b> 13:21,21,22	29:4,13,22 30:3	upwards 79:11	41:5,19 42:18
<b>try</b> 17:1 69:8 73:7	31:7 44:8 45:2	<b>usable</b> 41:23 42:1	43:21 53:3,21,23
<b>trying</b> 16:20 29:3	48:24,25 54:10,11	use 41:7 42:17	54:3,8,12 58:8,12
31:19 54:11 62:22	57:1,9 58:1 61:14	44:2,5 50:11	62:14 85:3,3,8
136:11 176:8	62:1 67:1 69:6,13	65:15 79:9,14	111:22 112:2,12
178:8	69:19 73:4,8 74:8	86:19,22 87:14	112:20 137:18
<b>turn</b> 21:1 119:3	77:11 98:24,25	97:7 99:11 100:22	138:1 156:1
<b>turning</b> 13:13	100:21 106:2	103:6,13 115:14	159:13,20 160:4
124:7,9 141:6	107:12 110:3	119:22 124:21	161:13 170:4
143:17 147:21	111:7 113:17	126:8 146:3	uses 41:16 121:4
<b>two</b> 35:5 42:7 46:3	117:19 138:18	151:17 178:6	148:16
68:17 69:5 85:9	145:14 167:25	182:12	<b>usual</b> 109:1
85:12 88:19 90:20	168:2 170:5 171:6	user 1:5 2:4 12:9	183:13
90:24 112:15,21	178:7 181:11	39:22 40:11,17	v
135:6 140:10	188:1	42:9,12 50:17	v 43:11
175:7 177:5	understanding	54:2,5 57:10,13	values 156:24
tyler 37:20,25	26:10,13 31:19	60:11,16 61:12,19	variety 56:20
<b>type</b> 91:22 150:20	32:7 40:10 43:19	61:19,23 62:3,4,9	various 19:23
151:2	47:5 51:20 55:14	62:10,17,18,24	36:15,16 93:7
types 133:10,20	59:5 62:6 64:23	64:25 66:6 67:19	96:14 178:5
149:6,16,18	67:25 68:1,12	74:16,17 84:18	179:10
typically 153:6	77:3 81:18 83:14	85:12 86:4,11,13	vc 1:6 2:4
<b>typo</b> 175:20	106:9 107:18	87:9 88:15,15	veritext 12:11
	143:13,21 145:23	89:1 90:5 99:15	191:7,9,11
	146:18,19 147:16	120:14 124:23	, ,
		<u> </u>	

## Case 3:18-md-02843-VC Document 1086-54 Filed 12/12/22 Page 230 of 233 CONFIDENTIAL

#### [version - witness]

			I
<b>version</b> 35:4 74:10	warehouse 67:17	96:11 97:23 98:3	176:21 177:8
125:13 130:5	washington 1:23	98:4,15 99:12	178:7,24 179:16
136:12 167:22	4:10	100:2,6,15,22	179:23,24 180:7
168:8,16	way 24:13 41:23	101:12 102:2,23	180:18 181:14
versions 34:25	42:1 45:13 51:10	103:22,24 104:19	182:1 183:12,20
35:1,6 93:1	51:17 56:7 69:8	104:24 106:19	184:5,22 185:5,10
156:23	71:13 87:11 88:18	108:8,12,18	185:18,24 186:2
versus 62:3	96:1 99:14 109:1	109:16 110:5,24	186:16,24 187:10
<b>video</b> 1:14 2:19	115:8	111:9,19 112:1,10	187:19 188:1,22
videoconference	ways 77:7	112:17,24 113:4	189:4,9
1:14 2:19 3:2 4:2	<b>we've</b> 48:10 95:6	113:12,17 114:2	<b>web</b> 1:14 2:19 3:2
5:2 6:2 7:2	95:12 107:4 114:7	114:11,15 116:12	4:2 5:2 6:2 7:2
videographer 7:7	150:1 158:1 170:1	116:19,21 117:8	118:9
12:5,10 48:18,21	weaver 3:6 8:5	117:11,15 120:16	website 141:19
79:22,25 113:7,10	12:15,16 14:6	120:25 122:8	websites 145:4
151:8,11 164:23	16:7 17:3,14,17,24	125:15 126:3,18	wechat 118:15,17
165:1 180:2,5	22:7 23:3,19 24:2	127:2,13,21 128:7	wednesday 1:16
189:11	24:18 25:9,16	128:14,22 129:8	2:18
videos 145:1	27:8,23 28:2,6,10	129:13,16 130:21	week 36:6 37:6
166:18	28:16 30:13 31:18	130:25 131:10	weeks 36:4 185:2
<b>viewed</b> 159:21	32:6,18,21 33:3,5	132:15 133:11,16	went 74:11 99:25
161:14	33:7,10,13,16 34:4	134:8,18 135:5,15	110:23 138:11,13
virtually 12:21	34:15 35:18,23	135:17 142:5,14	142:21 143:15
<b>volume</b> 1:17 8:3	38:11 40:7 41:25	142:19 143:12	148:7 149:17,17
74:4	42:23 43:3 44:1	144:10 145:22	whatsapp 99:16
W	45:4,21 46:22,24	146:9,22 147:2,21	102:22 109:5,9,16
<b>w</b> 4:6 6:17	47:17 48:1,7,12,16	149:4,21 150:4,7	109:21 110:7
waiting 103:25	48:23 49:10 50:1	150:19,24 151:1,6	118:19,23 126:12
waived 191:23,23	50:18,25 51:6,12	151:13 153:3,10	126:20
waiving 124:15	51:16 52:12 58:3	153:21 154:14	whereof 190:20
191:20	58:17 59:24 60:4	155:13 157:5	whitelisted 168:6
want 22:24 74:8	60:24 61:10 62:8	159:12 160:23	168:15,20 169:6
86:20 89:16 97:21	63:25 66:22 70:11	161:5,19,25 162:6	whitelisting 167:8
121:12 125:21	72:11 73:6 74:1,6	162:15,23 163:4	167:9,16
133:25 135:21	75:7,21 77:22	164:16,22 165:3	wickr 113:22
149:13 164:16	78:12 79:18 80:2	165:21 166:9	115:14
170:5 180:13	84:3,22 88:20	167:7 168:2,14	<b>wikis</b> 118:9
181:11 189:1	89:3,10,20,22 90:1	169:14,23 170:17	wilmerhale 23:14
<b>wanted</b> 140:19	90:10 91:6,11	170:25 171:8	witness 12:12,24
176:14,16	92:24 94:4,15,21	172:3,10,20 173:9	16:6 17:6,20
170.14,10	95:14,15 96:7,10	173:17,20,22	20:22 25:8 33:9

#### [witness - zuckerberg's]

05.0.24.00.7.14		
95:9,24 98:7,14	X	
109:12 188:24	<b>x</b> 8:1,8 9:1 10:1	
190:20 191:13,16	11:1 190:16	
192:2,5	<b>xx</b> 192:1	
woman 43:10	y	
140:15	y 14:11 140:11	
word 45:3 138:19	<b>y</b> 14:11 140:11 <b>veah</b> 44:16 50:3	
words 134:20	•	
142:16	69:7 74:3,3,5 82:1	
work 15:7 28:19	82:2 95:4,23	
28:21,25 29:5	98:12 122:11	
41:12 75:15 93:18	135:5,12 150:6	
94:13,16,19 96:3	162:15 164:19	
105:14 109:13	167:16 176:7,17	
110:13 117:1,6	186:7	
120:1 125:14,25	year 18:5 30:2	
153:8 185:14	75:7	
worked 15:14	years 15:23 16:24	
16:22 23:15,17,20	86:24	
29:17 56:20,20	yekaterina 5:6	
working 17:10	yesterday 52:21	
21:23 24:14 25:2	yield 44:3	
25:14 46:4 68:2	yodi 140:11,15,21	
76:4,7,17 133:20	142:6	
139:21	yreyzis 5:11	
workplace 9:14	Z	
104:17 118:4,8	<b>z</b> 46:6,6	
119:8,17,19,23	zaragoza 46:6	
120:8,8,10,12,14	68:10 76:13	
120:24	<b>zolle</b> 5:13 22:14	
works 22:1	<b>zoom</b> 1:12	
worried 155:16	zuckerberg 100:4	
writing 107:19	102:18 106:10	
written 53:2 107:8	110:16 111:3,20	
107:13 122:17	112:5,14,18,19	
130:16	116:7 124:3	
wrote 53:14,15,20	174:16	
55:2 61:18 76:21	zuckerberg's	
82:14 92:25 99:8	108:22	
125:16		

# Federal Rules of Civil Procedure Rule 30

- (e) Review By the Witness; Changes.
- (1) Review; Statement of Changes. On request by the deponent or a party before the deposition is completed, the deponent must be allowed 30 days after being notified by the officer that the transcript or recording is available in which:
- (A) to review the transcript or recording; and
- (B) if there are changes in form or substance, to sign a statement listing the changes and the reasons for making them.
- (2) Changes Indicated in the Officer's Certificate. The officer must note in the certificate prescribed by Rule 30(f)(1) whether a review was requested and, if so, must attach any changes the deponent makes during the 30-day period.

DISCLAIMER: THE FOREGOING FEDERAL PROCEDURE RULES

ARE PROVIDED FOR INFORMATIONAL PURPOSES ONLY.

THE ABOVE RULES ARE CURRENT AS OF APRIL 1,

2019. PLEASE REFER TO THE APPLICABLE FEDERAL RULES

OF CIVIL PROCEDURE FOR UP-TO-DATE INFORMATION.

## VERITEXT LEGAL SOLUTIONS COMPANY CERTIFICATE AND DISCLOSURE STATEMENT

Veritext Legal Solutions represents that the foregoing transcript is a true, correct and complete transcript of the colloquies, questions and answers as submitted by the court reporter. Veritext Legal Solutions further represents that the attached exhibits, if any, are true, correct and complete documents as submitted by the court reporter and/or attorneys in relation to this deposition and that the documents were processed in accordance with our litigation support and production standards.

Veritext Legal Solutions is committed to maintaining the confidentiality of client and witness information, in accordance with the regulations promulgated under the Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act (HIPAA), as amended with respect to protected health information and the Gramm-Leach-Bliley Act, as amended, with respect to Personally Identifiable Information (PII). Physical transcripts and exhibits are managed under strict facility and personnel access controls. Electronic files of documents are stored in encrypted form and are transmitted in an encrypted fashion to authenticated parties who are permitted to access the material. Our data is hosted in a Tier 4 SSAE 16 certified facility.

Veritext Legal Solutions complies with all federal and State regulations with respect to the provision of court reporting services, and maintains its neutrality and independence regardless of relationship or the financial outcome of any litigation. Veritext requires adherence to the foregoing professional and ethical standards from all of its subcontractors in their independent contractor agreements.

Inquiries about Veritext Legal Solutions' confidentiality and security policies and practices should be directed to Veritext's Client Services Associates indicated on the cover of this document or at www.veritext.com.